The IAFOR Journal of Arts and Humanities

Volume II – Issue I – Fall 2014

Edited by Thomas French
# Table of Contents

## Notes on Contributors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coming Together and Apart while Reading Popular Cultural Texts: Identities in Media Reception</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ewa Glapka</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Many Faces of Popular Culture and Contemporary Processes: Questioning Identity, Humanity and Culture through Japanese Anîme</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mateja Kovacic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Resistance to Participation: Clanship and Urban Modernization in the Wuyi Rural Market Towns During the Republican Era</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tung-Yiu Stan Lai and Weijen Wang</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jerusalem as a Uniting Factor for Muslims and Christians: Historical and Scriptural Grounds</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kamal-deen Olawale Sulaiman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes on Contributors

Dr Ewa Glapka is a Post-doctoral Research Fellow in Sociology Department at the University of the Free State. She is the author of Reading Bridal Magazines from a Critical Discursive Perspective (Palgrave Macmillan, 2014) and has published on the topics of language and gender, narrative analysis, media discourse and media reception.

Mateja Kovacic, has obtained graduate degrees in Philosophy and Ethnology and Cultural Anthropology at the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, University of Zagreb. She is now in the final year of her doctoral studies, at Department of Humanities and Creative Writing, Hong Kong Baptist University. Her special areas of interest are the philosophy of technology and technoscience, bioethics, Japanese culture and animation, popular culture and cultural imperialism.

Dr Tung-Yiu Stan Lai, an architect by profession, is Assistant Professor in the Department of Architecture, Chu Hai College of Higher Education (CHARCH), Hong Kong. He is a specialist in the urban morphology of historic market towns and buildings. His teaching focuses on sustainable design in urban environment, modern architectural theories, and the history of Chinese and Hong Kong architecture. His research interests cover various architectural types ranging from walled villages, cha-chaan-teng (Hong Kong-style cafes), shopping malls, cinemas, to multilevel transportation systems.

Professor Weijen Wang is the Head of Department and Professor in the Department of Architecture at the University of Hong Kong. He is a graduate of UC-Berkeley and Taiwan University. His research mainly focuses on Chinese architecture and cities, including the transformation of courtyard typology, urban fabric and public space in historical and contemporary Chinese cities, and the typology of the Chinese temple. His design projects have won several AIA Design Awards, a Far Eastern Architectural Award, as well as Green Building Award and HKIA Award. They have been exhibited at venues around the world, including the Taipei Museum of Modern Art, Beijing Architecture Biennale, Shenzhen Biennale of Architecture and Urbanism, and Venice Architecture Biennale of 2008. He was also the curator of 2007/1008 Hong Kong – Shenzhen Biennale of Architecture and Urbanism. In 2008-2009, he was a visiting associate professor in the Department of Architecture at MIT.

Dr Kamal-deen Olawale Sulaiman holds a Ph.D in Islamic Studies from Lagos-State University Nigeria and also a Lecturer at Department of Religious Studies, Ekiti-State University, Nigeria. His research interests are Islamic Civilization and Contemporary Issues. He has published extensively in peer-reviewed journals and with academic research bodies within and outside Nigeria.
Coming Together and Apart while Reading Popular Cultural Texts: Identities in Media Reception

Ewa Glapka
ewaglapka_ev@wp.pl, glapkae@ufs.ac.za

Abstract
Although reading is popularly considered to be a solitary experience, in linguistics and literature studies the social nature of reading has been widely recognized. Accordingly, it is posited here that due to their inherently interactive and interpersonal character, media texts cannot be related to other than intersubjectively. Based on data gathered during research on teenage media reception, this article demonstrates that the ‘imagined communities’ (Anderson 1991) constructed in media discourse provoke in readers a sense of belonging and sharing a specific identity, and that the trajectories of readers’ emotional involvement also includes alienation from the textually constituted communities. The same dynamic of coming closer and away concerns the recipients’ significant others to whom they relate intertextually in media discourse. In analyzing these issues, this study shows the social and psychological complexity of media consumption as well as the research value of exploring it for cultural and social studies.

Keywords: identity, media, popular culture, symbolic communities, transdisciplinarity
Introduction

Identity and text reception have been examined in a number of ways, but to merge the two objects of analysis within a single piece of research has been a relatively new approach in which identity is explored in terms of its appearances in specific contexts of interpretation (see Long 2003; Benwell 2009; Eriksson & Aronsson 2009; Glapka forthcoming). One of the earliest and most firmly established approaches to text reception has been Cognitive Stylistics (see Semino & Culperer 2002; Stockwell 2002). Another strand of research, developed under the rubric of the Constance School (see Iser 1978; Jauss 1982), has been premised on the idea that the formal organization of text determines how its meaning is ‘decoded’ by readers, which the assumption was reflected in analysts’ primary concern with the text and only a remote, if any, interest in the recipient. Concerned with either the mental mechanisms underlying interpretation or with the role of the formal features of texts in the reception thereof, neither of the approaches has addressed the socio-cultural processes behind the production and consumption of media discourse. The socio-cultural implications of media reception became the central object of attention of the Birmingham Centre for Cultural Studies (henceforth BCCS) (see Hall et al. 1980), whose principal and confirmed assumption was that recipients of popular cultural texts co-construct their meanings rather than merely reconstruct the meanings following stable and predictable linguistic or cognitive patterns.

Recognizing the agency of individual media consumers, BCCS analysts undermined the legacy of the Frankfurt School, whose key theorists (Marcuse 1968; Horkheimer & Adorno 1972), also concerned with the receptive site of the ‘circuit of culture’ (du Gay et al. 1997), emphasized its desensitizing influence. The industrialized and commercialized culture, they claimed, developed within societies regulated by the capitalist relations of production, and subject to alike regulations of the market, turns individuals into the impassive consumers of the products of what they called the ‘culture industry’. Although BCCS researchers complicated this undeniably simplistic and mechanistic view of cultural consumption, they did not propose any methodology of systematically examining individuals’ engagement in the process. Consequently, this article considers, none of the aforementioned approaches has empirically accessed people’s diverse styles of consuming popular cultural texts, and hence neglected the fascinating area of identity processes underpinning individuals’ negotiation of their place and role in the ‘circuit of culture’.

Discursive psychology in media reception

Interested in both the linguistic and social implications of media consumption, the current study seeks to demonstrate that with the analytic parameters set on the idiosyncrasy and the social contingency of media reception, the analysis of people’s relationship to media texts can yield insight into readers’ understanding of the world. As mentioned at the beginning, to explore text reception in terms of identity processes is an approach which has only recently been taken in the exploration of literature reception. With the analytic focus set on identity, this model of research has been premised on the methodology of discursive psychology (henceforth DP) (see Edwards & Potter 1992; Benwell & Stokoe 2005), which will thus be deployed also in the current inquiry of media reception.
In its own pursuit of the identity processes underlying the interpretation of media texts, the investigation also follows the methodology of DP but it contends that DP’s programmatic involvement solely with the ethnographic contexts of discourse practice unnecessarily limits researchers who do not have an access to the naturally occurring data. Because of the mediated nature of discourse data gleaned from the artificially created contexts of talk, discursive psychologists deny them transparency and consider the interviews as problematic (Benwell 2009, p.301). Here it is proposed that, firstly, people’s thoughts are mediated and conditioned by situational contingencies in any discourse practice. Secondly, the identity concerns which are believed by discursive psychologists to unduly influence individuals’ identity work in the interview contexts are also salient in most (if not all) interactional settings. Therefore, by proposing to loosen the emphasis on the naturally occurring data, this article makes a case for considering research interviews a valuable method of data collection.

What this analysis finds as central to its approach to media reception is DP’s view of identity and of how it surfaces talk. By finding it applicable to studying media reception, the current exploration does not expect media-related talk to reveal any deeper structures of cognition. The talk (and the accompanying constructions of self) occasioned by media texts are approached as the social and discursive action situated in a particular context which shapes the meanings people arrive at. Thus, rather than assume that the content of talk is the effect of the same, stable mental and linguistic dispositions which are mobilized irrespective of time and place, this examination considers that both the content and form of talk are contingent on the formal organization and social dynamic of the context. With all this in mind, the discussion below is intent on presenting a transdisciplinary approach to media reception in which the discursive analysis of this form of cultural activity is deployed to investigate questions germane not only to discourse but also social and cultural studies.

**Media discourse**

The data explored in this article (passages selected from the transcripts of ca. one-hour interviews with teenagers) are part of a larger set of data which were collected in a two-fold exploration of discourse production and consumption (see Glapka 2011). Following the survey of media reception patterns among 60 seventeen-year-old high school students in a small Polish town, I conducted interviews with a selected group of informants to compare the results of the quantitative and qualitative analyses of media reception. The economy of research is a significant disadvantage of the microanalytic and interpretive methodology, but the account of media reception which it rendered, although non-representative, allowed a richer and more profound understanding of the process.

The interviews were based on individuals’ interpretation of the same prompt magazine that many respondents in the questionnaire indicated as their favorite. Although the discursive psychologists exploring literature reception have not been interested in how texts are mapped onto the receptive processes and have relied solely on text-related talk, this exploration included the examination of the discourse of the magazine (*Twist*, a monthly magazine for teenage girls). The analysis was conducted with the purpose of exploring any potential relations between the textual properties of the magazine and the ways in which readers involve themselves with its discourse.
In line with the media’s new ‘communicative ethos’ (Scannel 1992), the magazines examined revealed a significant degree of *synthetic personalization*, which consists in the ‘compensatory tendency to give the impression of treating each of the people handled “en masse” as an individual’ (Fairclough 1989, p. 52). Accordingly, texts in *Twist* were found to emulate the relations of intimacy with the recipient by means of typical linguistic resources:

1. interrogative forms: ‘You think that putting rouge on your cheeks is a fad?’ (*Twist* 11/2009), personal pronouns: ‘we’, ‘us’, ‘you’
2. imperatives: ‘Doll yourself up like a catwalk model!’ (*Twist* 8/2009)
3. deixis suggesting the shared perspective of time and place: ‘here’, ‘there’, ‘then’, ‘now’
4. informal register, including lexis (‘Get the buddy on your own ground’) and emoticons (‘Bikini and flip-flops are not enough :-))’
5. the use of English borrowings typical of youth talk: ‘cool’, ‘hot’
6. presuppositions implying shared knowledge: ‘You don’t have to be afraid that dying hair will cause damage to the hair ends.’ (*Twist* 11/2009)

The high social and emotional proximity implied in the textual properties of the magazine’s discourse gives the appearances of a community of readers who share not only a fondness for the magazine but also the troubles and joys of their teenage lives. In the emergent ‘imagined community’ (Anderson 1983) of teenage girls, the border between the discursive practices of reading and writing and the social practices of showing and seeking mutual support becomes blurred. Vitally, by merely examining the discourse of media, this article contends, researchers gain grounds to argue that the consumption of teen media culture proposes a highly personal and emotional style of involvement in it but they lack premises on which to confirm or deny that teenagers indeed engage themselves as personally in the popular media discourses as the media texts encourage them to. In the discussion below, moving dialectically between media discourse and the interviewees’ relationships to it, I will demonstrate that their interpretative and identity work implies a significant degree of emotional engagement in the discourse but the relationships established do not yield any obvious patterns of media reception.

**Media reception**

A linguistic analysis is employed in the discussion of the following extract, in which one of the informants talked about her favorite articles in the magazine:

**Extract (1)**

INTERVIEWER: So why do you read *Twist*?

ANNA: I like reading about those youth’s problems, I find them interesting. And there are like different letters from young people, where they seek advice for instance, and that I kind of look differently at different issues.

INTERVIEWER: Such as?

ANNA: Well, well girls describe different situations there, so I know for instance what I can expect from life, that this kind of thing may happen to me too.

INTERVIEWER: Could you show me the letter in this issue which you found most interesting, one which influenced your view?

ANNA: Well for sure the article about the girl, who you know stole, smoked, drank, this too…

INTERVIEWER: Mm, this true story?
R: Yes, this story.
INTERVIEWER: And what about this story? Do you identify somehow with
her?
ANNA: No, no no, but I know that once I have read this story, I know that
such people kind of exist, and that what can, that this may happen to anybody,
that not everybody is so lucky, like, in life.

The extract illustrates how closely the textual and experiential worlds may come
together in teenagers’ involvement with media discourse. Anna aligns with the
positioning patterns set in her favorite genre of texts. The narrative stories in the
magazine are the first-person narratives written by teenage readers – the appearances
of factuality and intimacy are enhanced by the elements of youth language as well as
pictures of the authors (or of teenage models whose exposition in the setting often
puts the images in contrast to the photos in the ‘glossy’ parts of the magazine). Anna
indexes her commitment to the discourse of the magazine through the implicit
acknowledgment of its mediating role between readers and of the educational value of
the mediation. The parallel claims of belief that the experiences described in the texts
may be part of her own experience ratify the texts as legitimate representations of
teenage life. Additionally, the interviewee establishes a communal bond with both the
social actors depicted in the text and other readers of Twist. She works up the
collective identity category by means of the somewhat fraternizing ‘girls’ and ‘too’ –
the former resembling talk about one’s friends, the latter constructing the relation of
likeness.

Interestingly, within the extract, the high personal involvement is however mitigated.
Once she is asked about her relationship to the magazine directly, Anna replaces the
constructions of the shared identity of ‘girls’ with the distancing formulation ‘such
people’ as well as the generalizing pronouns ‘anybody’ and ‘everybody’. Also, the
extreme case formulation (Pomerantz 1986) in the emphatic denial ‘No, no no’
contradicts the relationship which she earlier constructed implicitly. Of course, what
motivated the speaker to defy the emotional engagement cannot be determined. It
might suggest the uneasiness of admitting her relationship to the articles.
Alternatively, if the disclaimers were not used to achieve a strategic distance from the
content of her claims, they may have been the speaker’s strategy of distancing from
the interviewer or of maintaining control over the level of intimacy which Anna
offered in the conversation. As such, the extract demonstrates the uneasy task of
determining individuals’ relation to media, most likely related with the intrinsically
contradictory and dynamic character of the very relation.

In the Extract below another interviewee talked about an article which she found
particularly interesting:

Extract (2) INTERVIEWER: Okay, anything else? Another letter or article?
MARTA: Here… I read some of them here ‘cause I thought that maybe I
could read and it maybe find it interesting, like for instance ‘I dated two guys
at the same time’. I read it and the girl here, I found it interesting cause she
lived in a village and had two boyfriends and obviously in villages and stuff
this sort of information spreads fast and stuff.
INTERVIEWER: Do you live in Gostyń or do you commute?
MARTA: No, I’m village [a village person]. Stara Krobia. And I know what it
is like, for instance, in a village. And I know that when somebody does something, then all people, especially the older ones, like gossiping.

INTERVIEWER: How does it make you feel?

MARTA: Well, I generally… I am not the kind of person people gossip about because I don’t do things which people could talk about. Well, but I think that it’s kind of funny cause those people, each of them will add something and a big deal will come out of it [mega-story], like some kind of a story which is not necessarily true.

INTERVIEWER: And if you started doing something which you would not see as wrong in any way and they started to laugh at you?

MARTA: I would definitely tell, for instance my mom, or I would go right away to those people and requested [sic/said] that this sort of thing makes me mad and I will not tolerate that. I would go saying that for sure. That’s what I would do for sure.

As she explains her interest in the story, Marta works up several overlapping identities. The reader, age, gender and provincial self are enacted simultaneously as the interviewee constructs the relation of empathy with the protagonist of the story (a girl who also lived in a village). In this way she indexes her belonging to the symbolic community of the magazine readers (teenage girls) and to the local community of Stara Krobia. Additionally, how she establishes her relationship to the age-based community props up Marta’s local identity. Throughout the extract, the youthful self is reinforced by positioning in the relation of difference (Bucholtz & Hall 2005) from the elderly members of her local community. The proximity to the protagonist and distance from the older people is also indexed by the prefix ‘mega-’, which is a distinctive feature of Polish youth talk. Marta projects her rural self directly (disclosing her place of living) and indirectly. Namely, constructing the rural community as irritatingly prying, she gives the enunciation the status of obviousness (‘obviously’), which indexes her insider’s knowledge of life in the country.

Clearly, as Marta does her interpretative work, she discloses the burden of living in a rural community. The extract makes it thus evident how tightly linked identity processes and the practices of media consumption are – the interpretative work triggers in the girl the feelings of empathy which are based on the speaker’s self-disclosed sense of being monitored and judged by her locals. Interestingly, within the same extract, Marta denies giving her locals any reasons for rumors. How she makes the claim accountable illuminates her moral and social disposition (see Drew 1998). It implies that Marta considers being the object of gossip as something embarrassing, which indexes her tacit alignment with the community’s social and moral norms. As mentioned, her talk reveals the tension accompanying the life of a teenage girl in a small community. That the teenage self which the interviewee articulates is problematically related to her rural background can be observed in the number of affective and evaluative stances. These take the form of extreme case formulations (repeated formulations ‘I know’) paralleled by the constructions of personal opinion (‘I think’, ‘funny’). The troubled relationship with the community is also evident in the emotionally charged statement ‘requested’ through which she seems to be shoring up some agency and strength in managing her relations with the environment.

As can thus be seen, Marta used the media-related talk not only to establish her age identity but also organized the talk as the discursive space where she could
symbolically confront herself with the society in which she lives from an empowered subject position – by assessing the norms of her local environment and articulating her right to demand respect from them. This illustrates how having teenagers talk about media texts can help researchers in eliciting a good deal of information about their social worlds and their relationship to them.

The patterns of positive identification with the magazine’s discourse were not the only ones observed in the interviews. For instance, in the extract below it can be seen that the same practice of text interpretation was used by another interviewee to construct a completely different age identity:

**Extract (3)**

**INTERVIEWER:** What made you stop reading it, if you could be more specific?

**KAROLINA:** I’ve noticed that they want to be cool and that it so forced how they want to be so cool, and how they try to go into this youth slang, and stuff like that. And these tests they seemed to me so I don’t know, like typically for the youth. And they all became so nonsensical to me cause I had already known what I was like and I didn’t need to read a [psycho-]quiz telling me what I am like.

**INTERVIEWER:** I get it, the so-called psycho-quizzes.

**KAROLINA:** And so, for instance, I liked horoscopes, quizzes, I still like them because they turn out right. And those quizzes seem to me so, I don’t know, like typically for the youth and some adolescents, and stuff. And so they seemed to be so nonsensical ‘cause I had already known what I was like and I didn’t need to read a quiz [telling me] what I am like.

Throughout the interview, Karolina presented herself as a self-proclaimed critic and an erstwhile avid reader of *Twist*. In the extract, she props up the identity by taking evaluative stances to both the editors and (implicitly) the recipients of the magazine. The editors are constructed as making the unsuccessful attempts to insincerely fraternize with the young readers. The readers are referred to by means of the diminutive form of the Polish word for ‘adolescents’ (Pol. ‘*małolatki*’). The grammatical diminutive (Pol. ‘*małolaty*’) suggests the intentionality of Karolina’s identity work in which she positioned herself in a relation of difference to other (probably not much younger) girls. Based on different levels of maturity, the distance is shored up when the diminutive is combined with the generic formulation ‘some’. In tandem, the former indexes the infantility and naivety of *Twist* readers and the latter implies she has ‘grown out of’ the magazine’s target group.

The constructions of personal detachment predominate over the whole passage. The generalizing and distancing discourse markers ‘some’ and ‘and stuff’, evaluative stances ‘forced’ and ‘nonsensical’, as well as the Polish pejorative formulation for ‘talk’ (‘go into’ for Pol. ‘*gadać*’) do the contextual work of simultaneously reinforcing Karolina’s censorious position to the magazine and indexing her age identity of a girl who has matured enough to become critical of the media’s appeals to adolescents. Karolina’s critical attitude to her peers is also indexed by her regular reliance on laughter. The evaluative stance displayed through laugh tokens is constructed as both shared with her friends and one which she reinforces her basically individualistic orientation (repeated ‘to me’). All this evidently works in the service of ‘self-praise’
(Pomerantz 1978), i.e. assessing Karolina’s own reader self and increasing the emotional and mental distance between other teenage readers and herself.

Consequently, the ways in which the reader and their age selves collate in Karolina’s reception of the magazine is another example of the media’s accompanying presence in teenagers’ identity processes. It is unlike Anna’s and Marta’s reception of Twist in that rather than put up the relation of sameness and closeness, Karolina expressed her emotional distance both from the magazine and its ‘regular’ readers by denying them maturity and simultaneously claiming it for herself. As can be seen, even if media discourse is negatively valued by recipients, its role in making sense of who they are (and who they are not) is undeniable. The apparent process of alienation from the symbolic community to which she once belonged gives her the sense of agency in becoming the person whom she wants to be.

Data discussion

Restricted by the space allowed, the article provides only three examples of individuals’ involvement with media discourse to demonstrate the socio-cultural and psychological intricacy of media reception that I sought to bring out by exploring it discursively. Nevertheless, although limited to the three transcripts, the discussion clearly indicates that while negotiating our relationship to media texts, we negotiate not only our identities of the consumers of popular culture but also gender, age, social identities and other facets of selfoccasioned in context. As could be seen, the investigation which moves dialectically between the textual features of media discourse and the ones of media-related talk allows showing how the former are mapped onto speakers’ talk as well as how the latter reveals individuals’ diverse styles of media consumption and identity work. The relationality and intersubjective quality of media discourse examined were reflected in its recipients’ relationship to the magazine – both in how they positioned themselves to other readers and to their significant others, whom the texts made contextually relevant by consequently referring to girls’ social and personal life.

Although the magazine’s discourse cannot have been the sole reason of the girls’ high personal involvement in it, their situated engagement with the discourse must have been to some degree contingent on the magazine’s appeals to readers’ affective and social needs of finding one’s own sense of self through defining one’s belonging to a specific community. Critics have not been unanimous in their interpretations of the social implications of the synthetic personalization accompanying the conversationalization of contemporary media. Whether the discourse processes are the symptom of the ‘re-feudalization’ (Habermas 1989) or democratization (McDonald 2003) of the public sphere has yet to be settled. The position which is hereby taken is not straightforward either.

On the one hand, it could be argued that the relationships created textually by media producers are artificial and reproduce disturbing discourses (see Talbot 1992, 2010; Bauman 2004; Frost 2001). Following Talbot (1992), the synthetic relations of sisterhood in the magazines targeting young girls realize the hidden agenda of commodification. Nevertheless, as could be seen, girls in the study were attracted to teens’ narratives of experience, rather than to the texts concerning the consumption of commodities (see Currie 2001 for similar findings among Canadian girls reading teen
magazines). At the same time, it is not argued here that the interpersonal style of media discourse may not be disturbing to its recipients. Texts in Twist were found to revolve around various forms of relationship (mainly the heterosexual relations with boys and the heterosocial ones with peers and relatives). As such, the magazines reinforce in the girls the concept of self which is anchored in the discourse of other-centeredness (see Lazar 2002) – they encourage readers to think and talk about themselves primarily in terms of their relations with significant others. In turn, the article proposes, the girls who are exposed solely (or predominantly) to this media discourse may find it difficult to talk and think of themselves as independent selves and consequently learn to draw their sense of self-worth from the intensity and quality of their relationship with significant others.

What may arouse interest is why the appeal of the symbolic community offered by teen magazines does not apparently consist in its promise of an easy way of attaining one’s identity through consumption, as many critics of media’s commodifying influence pose. The explanation advanced here is that readers may find membership in the symbolic community of readers sharing their personal experience particularly appealing because it is easier to manage than the one in the embodied communities. The separate contexts of production and reception reduce the degree of reciprocity involved in the ‘para-social interactions’ (Horton & Wohl 1956), thus allowing participants of the communication to draw on their own resources in meaning construction. Because of the mediated nature of participation in the magazine-based communities, they offer more freedom and security – the meanings which their members derive for themselves from specific texts are not subject to immediate corrective of peers. By the same token, the degree of one’s involvement in the discourse is the individuals’ independent decision. For example, the underlying vectors of identity work underpinning the girls’ media reception were both connectedness and alienation.

Based on that, it can be seen that the micro-analytic study of media reception problematizes the view of the process advanced by critics lamenting the commodifying and standardizing effects of ‘culture industry’ on people’s thoughts and behaviors. The study clearly implies that media texts give readers the opportunity to experience the moments of enhanced self-reflexivity and agency. Obviously, the media consumption may not be the only opportunity to experience such moments. However, on the basis of an even limited amount of data it can be seen that media discourse is a vital site where youth’s identity processes take place. Crucially, the study demonstrates that they do not consist in the individuals’ impassive subjection to the media’s identity-formatting influence. Rather, by reading, talking and thinking about their relationship to media, teenagers experience a form of self-discovery during which they negotiate their location in the surrounding reality and their individual ways of interpreting the reality. Finally, it can be seen that as media recipients we are not only members of our local cultures and (e.g. age-based) subcultures but also of symbolic communities – such as the ones whose construction was examined above. Vitally, membership in the communities may have a profound influence on how we understand our membership in the wider cultural communities.
Methodological implications for transdisciplinary research

The article sought to prove that the linguistic mode of reception studies is an effective tool by means of which the sociological knowledge about our consumption of culture can be made more profound. The methodology presented here is capable of generating not only the knowledge about media reception. The analysis illuminates the ‘social order’ of particular groups of informants, i.e. ‘their implicit values and systems of accountability, and their careful management and negotiation of subjective experience’ (Benwell 2009, p. 300). Hence, examining how the accounts of transparency and equitability are negotiated when people interpret texts and contextualize them in their socio-cultural conditions of living casts sidelight on various realms of the speakers’ lives. The implicitness of the accounts, the article argues, guarantees that the data are less skewed by the self-presentational concerns because the concerns are in first place related with the participants’ consumer identities, rather than with any other. In turn, even if the effect of the ‘essential visibility’ (Edwards 1995) of research interviews is undeniable, the analysts can use them to elicit a significant amount of information which is less saliently affected by the visibility than it would be if the informants were directly asked about the relationship with, for instance, their local community or peers.

At the same time, although the value of any of the specific linguistic and sociological methodologies is not denied here, it is posited here that the research and explanatory capabilities of the two strands of research are limited in the following ways. The sole analysis of texts is incapable of generating findings which would be sufficiently contextualized in the socio-cultural setting of media consumption. The sociological tradition is vulnerable to ignoring the vagueness of social reality which is communicated in discourse. The analytic rigor of case-based discourse studies can serve as a vital complement to the sociological explorations which are based on broad analytic categories.

Finally, a study like the one of which part is presented in the current article could be conducted anywhere in the world – the increased mediatization of social life has become one of the key qualities of late modern culture. As it has already taken place in research on literature reception (Benwell et al. 2012), the article posits the necessity of conducting such transnational research projects in reference to media consumption. By addressing teenagers, the present analysis was driven by the conviction that it is necessary to study their media reception as they are considered the most avid but also vulnerable consumers of popular culture. Nonetheless, it cannot be ruled out that there are other media audiences, or specific media which need to be given priority in the exploration which attends to the socio-cultural and psychological complexity of media consumption and which takes the advantage of discourse analytic methods in gaining insight into its mechanisms. As indicated, by drawing closer, the textual and sociological vein of reception studies can generate a transdisciplinary framework of investigating people’s consumption of media. Advancing this specific approach, this article sought to show that media reception studies provide a convenient ground for pursuing the questions which have been the driving force of not only audience research but of many disciplines interested in how people draw on the surrounding social and cultural discourses to make sense of themselves and the world.
References


Jauss, H. R. (1982), Toward an Aesthetic of Reception. (Translated by Timothy Bahti.) University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis.


Appendix – interview extracts (in Polish)

Extract (1)

INTERVIEWER: Przede wszystkim, jakbyś mi mogła powiedzieć dlaczego czytasz Twista?
ANNA: Lubię właśnie te takie problemy czytać młodzieżowe, interesuje mnie to. I też różne są listy od młodzieży, żeby się poradzić na przykład, i też potem inaczej patrzę na różne sprawy.
INTERVIEWER: To znaczy?
ANNA: Nooo…no dziewczyny tam opisują swoje różne sytuacje, no to wiem na przykład czego mogę się spodziewać w życiu, że coś takiego też może mnie dotknąć.
INTERVIEWER: A mogłabyś wskazać mi list z tego numeru, który Cię najbardziej zainteresował, i który jakoś wpłynął na Twój świat?
ANNA: No na pewno tutaj był ten artykuł o tej dziewczynie, co tak właśnie kradła, palila, piła, to też…
INTERVIEWER: Aha, ta historia prawdziwa?
ANNA: Tak, ta historia.
INTERVIEWER: I co z tą historią? Ty się z nią identyfikujesz jakoś?
ANNA: (Stanowczo) Nie, nie nie, ale wiem, że, jak przeczytałam tę historię to wiem, że tacy ludzie istnieją właśnie, i wiadomo co kogo może, każdego, może spotkać taki los, że nie każdy ma dobrze, na przykład, w życiu

Extract (2)

INTERVIEWER: Cóż jeszcze? Jakiś list, albo jeszcze jakiś inny artykuł?
MARTA: Tutaj niektóre tak przeczytałam, bo stwierdziłam, że może przeczytać, może mnie zainteresuje, chociażby na przykład „Spotykałam się z dwoma facetami jednocześnie” Przeczytałam, i ta dziewczyna tutaj, to mnie zaczękało, że ona była z wioski i miała dwóch chłopców, a wiadomo, na wioskach i w ogóle wszystkie informacje się roszczodzą w takim typowo szybkim tempie i w ogóle.
INTERVIEWER: Ty jesteś z Gostynia czy dojeżdżasz?
MARTA: Nie, ja jestem wioska, Stara Krobia. I wiem jak jest, na przykład, na wiosce. I wiem, że kiedy ktoś coś zrobi to wszystkie, na przykład starsze, osoby lubią plotkować.
INTERVIEWER: A jak Ty się z tym czujesz?
MARTA: No ja ogólnie…na mój temat nie mają co plotkować, bo nie robię jakichś takich rzeczy, które by były tematem do rozmów. No, ale uważam, że to jest troszkę takie śmieśne, bo te osoby, każda potem doda od siebie coś jeszcze i wyjdzie jakaś mega historia, która nie jest tak do końca prawdą.
INTERVIEWER: No, a gdybyś na przykład coś zaczęła robić, co uważałabyś za dobre, słuszne, a oni by właśnie Cię wyśmiewali.
MARTA: Na pewno bym powiedziała o tym, na przykład mojej mamie, albo po prostu posłabym do tych osób i zażyczyła sobie tego, że takie coś mnie tylko denerwuje i nie życzę sobie, żeby o mnie rozmawiano. Na pewno bym poszła.

Extract (3)

INTERVIEWER: Co sprawiło, że przestała go czytać, tak konkretniej?
KAROLINA: Zauważyłam, że oni tak próbują na siłę być super, i młodzieżowym
slangiem gadać, coś tam. Czy jakieś te testy, czy coś.

INTERVIEWER: No tak, te psychozabawy tak zwane.

KAROLINA: No i ja na przykład lubiłam horoskopy, testy, do teraz lubię bo mi się sprawdzają. A te testy to mi się wydają takie jakieś, nie wiem, typowo pod młodzież i jakieś małolatki, coś tam. No i takie bezsensowne mi się wydawały, bo już wiedziałam jaka jestem i nie musiała czytać testu jaka jestem.

**Transcription notes**

. short pause in the flow of talk
. full stop, stopping fall in tone, not necessarily end of sentence
... longer silence
? rising intonation, not necessarily a question
: prolongation of immediately prior sound
[ ] transcriber’s descriptions rather or in addition to transcriptions
( ) inability to hear what was said
Mm I agree a lot/yes, go on
The Many Faces of Popular Culture and Contemporary Processes: Questioning Identity, Humanity and Culture through Japanese Anime

Mateja Kovacic
mateja@life.hkbu.edu.hk

Abstract
In the highly globalized world we live in, popular culture bears a very distinctive role: it becomes a global medium for borderless questioning of ourselves and our identities as well as our humanity in an ever-transforming environment which requires us to be constantly "plugged in" in order to respond to challenges as best as we can. The vast array of cultural products we create and consume every day thus provide a relevant insight into problems that both researchers and audiences have to face within an informatised and technologised world.

Japanese anime is one of such cultural product: a locally produced cultural artifact that became a global phenomenon that transcends cultures and spaces. In its imageries we discover a wide range of themes that concern us today, ranging from bioethical issues, such as ecological crisis, posthumanism and loss of identity in a highly transforming world to the issues of traditionality and spirituality.

The author will demonstrate in what ways we can approach and study popular culture products in order to understand the anxieties and prevailing concerns of our cultures today, with emphasis on the identity and humanity, and their position in the contemporary high-tech world we live in. The author's intention is to point to popular culture as a significant (re)source for the fields of humanities and cultural studies, as well as for discussing human transformations and possible future outcomes of these transformations in a technoscientific world. A case study will be presented: Mamoru Oshii's Ghost in the Shell and Ghost in the Shell 2: Innocence.

Keywords: bioethics, popular culture, Japanese anime, technology, Ghost in the Shell
Introduction

When I started this research around four years ago, I found myself in my usual daily mode, working on my laptop, writing one of the earliest papers related to this topic. My three-year old nephew who just entered the room, curious as he was, approached the laptop, peeking into the screen, trying to take a glimpse of what I was doing. At this point, he heard the buzzing sound coming from my laptop: a mere product of my laptop’s microprocessors and electronics in its working mode. Without a second of delay, he turned to me amazed and said: “Auntie, he breathes!” As he was exclaiming this, he didn’t take a second to choose words: it was an immediate reaction to what he just experienced, formulated within a world of a three-year old boy. I then explained to him that my laptop doesn’t breathe, but his reaction and his words remained part of my memories and, as a form of inspiration and encouragement, also a part of my past and present research work. It is this boy’s reaction that made me realize that children today are born and raised in a different kind of world: it is a world immersed in technology and science, a world of rapid change; many choices, doubts and dilemmas, and a world with less anchors which can provide them (and us, for that matter) with a sense of belonging; sense of home; identity and environment. This is the reason why I continue my research and don’t doubt its usefulness in the contemporary world we all share today.

Although technological changes from a bioethical\(^1\) and popular culture (Japanese animation in particular) perspective are the focus of this paper, I also use this opportunity to advocate the use of popular culture products in pedagogy and argue for its validity as a discussion area where social issues arising from the contemporary processes\(^2\) may be brought forth and analyzed. I argue further in my paper that we are unable to deal with the world we constantly produce because we lack theoretical “machinery” for this kind of activity. We emphasize practice over theory, which marginalizes Humanities in present education and daily practices. Therefore, I see popular culture as an important (re)source for educators and cultural researches because it enables us to talk about the World, using popular culture products as valuable contemporary tools. In order to prove consistency, I focus on Japanese anime, choosing two films directed by Mamoru Oshii: Ghost in the Shell (1995) and Ghost in the Shell 2: Innocence (2004) which I find most inspiring as loci where bioethics, philosophy and popular culture come to the same terms most intensively of all Japanese anime.

I draw lines between Japanese animation, its global context, and contemporary issues which arise from imageries of one of the most popular anime authors: Mamoru Oshii. From a philosophical and bioethical perspective, I engage with issues of technology

---

\(^1\) It’s not an easy task to define Bioethics, due to its many aspects and relation to Philosophy and Medicine. A leading Croatian ethicist and bioethicist, Ante Covic, defines Bioethics as “specific, relational and multiperspectival ethics”, exploring further its development and extent in relation to Peter Singer’s theory (2004, 9-35). Covic also defines Bioethics as “a pluriperspective area of interaction between various disciplines which provide anchors and criteria in questioning life or conditions and circumstances of its preservation” (11).

\(^2\) By contemporary processes, I mean all processes emerged as products of the contemporary world and its modernization which began with Industrial Revolution. In particular: globalization, technologization, informatization, urbanization, commodification and all other processes given from interaction between biology, technology, informatics, politics, economy, medicine and mass media.
and biotechnology; posthumanism and ecology in relation to human identity, environment and culture.

Japanese Animation and its Global Popular Culture Context

The first book I referred to at the beginning of my research in Japanese animation (anime in short) was Anime: From Akira to Princess Mononoke (2001), written by Susan J. Napier. This book has been a valuable tool for me, and the one I always liked going back to. In the first chapter of the book, Napier poses a question referring to her own research: Why anime, not so much to provide a justification for her research; nor as much as to point to this global popular culture phenomenon as a relevant medium in addressing some of the issues I raise in this paper. Napier states:

“Anime is a popular cultural form that clearly builds on previous high cultural traditions. Not only does the medium show influences from such Japanese traditional arts as Kabuki and the woodblock print (originally popular culture phenomena themselves), but it also makes use of worldwide artistic traditions of twentieth-century cinema and photography. Finally, the issues it explores, often in surprisingly complex ways, are ones familiar to readers of contemporary “high culture” literature (both inside and outside Japan) and viewers of contemporary art cinema. Anime texts entertain audiences around the world on the most basic level, but equally importantly, they also move and provoke viewers on other levels as well, stimulating audiences to work through certain contemporary issues in ways that older art forms cannot. Moreover, precisely because of their popular reach they affect a wider variety of audiences in more ways than some less accessible types of high cultural exchange have been able to do. In other words, anime clearly appears to be a cultural phenomenon worthy of being taken seriously, both sociologically and aesthetically.” (Napier: 2001, 4).

She further continues thematizing the popularity of anime on a global scale, pointing to its statelessness and its background in photocentric Japanese culture as its core characteristics which make anime so widely accepted. She is not the only one to draw attention to these characteristics. Tze-Yue G. Hu in her book Frames of Anime (2010) builds up a theory on anime as a local, but global visual language and communication, derived from rich high cultural product traditions. This shows that

---

3 Napier explains the statelessness of anime: “But one of anime’s most popular genres, science fiction, is the one that is far less likely to be culturally specific. (…) In fact, a number of Japanese commentators have chosen to describe anime with the word “mukokuseki”, meaning “stateless” or essentially without a national identity. (…) Unlike the inherently more representational space of conventional live-action film, which generally has to convey already-existing objects within preexisting context, animated space has the potential to be context free, drawn wholly out of the animator’s or artist’s mind. It is thus a particularly apt candidate for participation in a transnational, stateless culture.”(2001, 4).

Also, on photocentric property of Japanese culture: “Images from anime and its related medium of manga (graphic novels) are omnipresent throughout Japan. Japan is a country that is traditionally more pictocentric than the cultures of the West, as is exemplified in its use of characters or ideograms, and anime and manga fit easily into a contemporary culture of the visual (ibid. 7).

4 Tze-Yue states: “Animation is a visual language and an act of communicating. Technically defined, it is a movement-based medium in which image is captured through the camera in order to create a series of alleged movements.(…) Other forms of traditional hand-manipulated images include the use of wood puppets, clay figures, and cut-out paper puppets. To animate is essentially to communicate, to
anime, as an internationalized media, is more than qualified to become a contemporary world agora, enriching global popular culture with opportunities for more philosophical dialogues.

As Irwin (one of the contributors to *Popular Culture and Philosophy* book series) points out: “we reach out to one another and discuss life, current events, politics, and religion through popular culture” (2007, 1). In that sense anime, with its odorless operational mode makes a perfect case-study.5

A Very Short Overview of Rise of Anime

Anime has been a global popular culture phenomenon for quite some time already: it has been labeled as new form of soft power, a term coined by Joseph Nye who focuses on cultural politics and a new kind of interaction between cultures emerging from globalization and the shift from military power to cultural power. Other scholars, such as Anne Allison, adopted his concept in their own research on cultural imperialism and cultural power:

“At work here is a new kind of global imagination, or new at least in the way it differs from an older model of Americanization. Joseph Nye has defined latter in terms of what he calls soft power, the “ability to get what you want through attraction rather than coercion or payments.”” (Allison 2006, 17)

At this point, the sudden shift from Western science fiction and envisioned images of futuristic worlds towards its Japanese “double” might seem a bit unusual, but if we observe anime as this new global cultural phenomenon and soft power that everybody is talking about, then it doesn’t seem so extraordinary. If we are talking about popular culture, anime has a significant place in it and becomes as relevant for its contribution to the science fiction genre as any other non-Japanese and non-animated popular culture product. The extent and intensity of anime’s contribution to global sci-fi film tell a story for oneself or others or for both, via a chain of manipulated and designed images.” (2010, 13)

5 According to Koichi Iwabuchi, who created the concept of cultural odor, “In a globalized world, for a non-Western cultural product to become successful, it must lose much of its original “cultural odor” so as to be promoted in the international market as a neutralized product to gain wider audience reception” (quoted in Lu: 2008, 175.). Lu further points out at the difficulty for any cultural product to completely lose its cultural specificity (that is, specific cultural “smell”), but anime does a good job by its representations of internationalized characters and universal themes (ibid.).

Amy Shirong Lu is one of the most elaborative authors to talk about anime in an international, global, context. She speaks of cultural politics behind anime’s global success, consisting of de-politicized internationalization, occidentalized internationalization and self-orientalized internationalization, which, according to Lu, produced odorless and globalised products for global consumption: “The three cultural politics of anime suggest that appropriation changes the cultural mix in many ways. A local product thus has the potential to go abroad and create, through unexpected cultural clashes, novel ways to think through issues of identity, exchange, and politics (…) Different from Western animation, anime has undergone a unique developmental trajectory that allows creative borrowing of various cultural and political elements to build up its stylistic properties and narrative framework along the way. This process is further complicated by the dynamics of the mobilization and circulation of anime products among international audiences who endow anime consumption with various cultural possibilities. As a result, anime is able to engage multiple cultural politics, whose interplay with its mixed signifiers results in an interesting postmodern landscape.” (169-183).
does not come by surprise, as the genre is one prevailing in anime, along with fantasy
and cyberpunk.  

Popular culture is now obviously recognized as something powerful, usually taken
into consideration in terms of cultural politics and economy of popular culture. It has
become a dialectical space producing opportunities for “cultural imperialism” and,
according to scholars; the two struggling powers on the global cultural scene today
are Americanization and Japanization. Though I will leave the discussion on cultural
politics for another paper, I would like to highlight the word power here, but not in its
political sense. The power I refer to is the power of popular culture to produce
images, raise questions, and respond to the challenges of the contemporary world: to
discuss and to explore. It is not a coincidence that there has been a series of books on
Popular Culture and Philosophy published as a response to this new cultural
“condition”, with its first volume issued in 2000. The series is dedicated to dealing
with philosophical aspects of popular culture and includes different authors in each
volume: contributors who discuss about philosophical issues in a variety of popular
culture products, ranging from The Simpsons, Monty Python and Quentin Tarantino to
Pink Floyd, baseball, manga and anime.

One prevailing theme among writers in the Anime and Philosophy issue were
cyberpunk and posthumanism, in which most authors referred to Ghost in the Shell,
the same film that I refer to in my paper (for more information on the book series,
please refer to the official website of the Open Court Publishing Company:

This paper is not focused on the history of anime, but I believe a (very) short
overview would be in order, not only to provide a more complete picture of this
phenomenon, but also to note that anime has quite a long history, evolving through a
variety of cultural forms (both high and low), always responding to local changes and
cultural needs. However, I must first say that, even though “high culture” and “low
culture” are mentioned on couple occasions in the paper (usually by quoted authors), I
do not agree with the distinction: especially not today when popular culture has
widely taken over the global art scene. This is not to equate more traditional (cultural
or art) forms with the contemporary ones, but to suggest that both cannot be valorized
and dichotomized as in the past cultural studies, as was the case with Frankfurt
school. It might be my academic background in Ethnology and Cultural
Anthropology, that made me erase such etiquettes as “high” and “low” when it comes
to culture, but even so, I do not think this dichotomy works anymore (if in reality ever
did work).

6 Cyberpunk is a term coined out of two words: cyber (coming from the word cybernetics) and punk
(implying its focus is on marginalized individuals, urbanized culture and distopic landscapes). In his
book, Dani Cavallaro attributes the cyberpunk cultural movement to the writings of William Gibson
and Bruce Sterling in the 1980s. As he poetically says: “In cyberpunk, the shiny hardness of metal, of
sturdy and imposing machinery and of industrial technology at large (hardware) favored by traditional
sci-fi cinema and literature gives way to the murky softness of junk-infested urban settings and of often
undependable postindustrial technology (software)” (2006, 27)

7 Frankfurt school, with its “Critical theory”, strongly distinguished between pop or mass culture and
high culture, seeing masses as rather ignorant consumers and criticizing the rising of mas - popular
culture content.
If I was to argue against the dichotomy further in this paper, anime would probably be my joker card, as it is one of the best examples of being an offspring of both cultural dimensions.

Anime’s history goes back to Japanese-style paintings, *yamato-e* in general, and *emakimono* or picture-scrolls in particular. It is further traced to *chinzō* or portrait painting, *ukiyo-e*, *kabuki*, *bunraku*, *nō*, *kyōgen*, picture-card storytelling and especially interesting *utshushī-e* or magic lanterns, with its most contemporary predecessor: *manga* or Japanese comics. Why I find magic lantern shows especially interesting is because they were based on certain technologies imported from the West and were probably one of the first Japanese popular culture forms to bring two-dimensional inanimate objects into life, starting its internationalization and adoption of Western techniques. It also evokes some irony, as story-telling started being dependant on technology which I thematize in this paper. This irony rises from anime being dependant on technology and offering critical narratives on technology at the same time.

To continue with a more recent history, in 1917 the first locally made anime works began to appear, but what followed in the 1960s was a fascinating boom, with manga-artist Osamu Tezuka who would change the world of anime, both visually and narratively. Tezuka created one of the first internationally accepted anime, *Astro Boy* or *Tetsuwan Atomu* in 1963, thematizing the relationship between technology and human beings. Back then, one could still notice the positive attitude of anime artists and their audiences towards technology. After the economic crisis and growth of environmental problems in Japan, this attitude radically changed. This new view on technological development was probably best pictured in works of Hayao Miyazaki, who is also known as Mr. Environment for adopting a shintoistic and ecological approach in his narratives.

---

8 In her book, *Frames of Anime* (2010), Tze-Yue dedicates a whole section to exploring connection between magic lantern shows, anime and Japanese culture. She states: “In general, Japanese animation scholars, teachers and film historians acknowledge *utsushi-e* as Edo’s form of anime (or simply called “Edo anime”), one of the pre-modern ancestors of today’s Japanese anime.” (43). In *Frames of Anime*, she explores in depth the evolution of anime through earlier art forms and relates it to visualness as the specific feature of Japanese culture. While *yamato-e*, *emakimono*, *chinzō* and *ukiyo-e* are pictorial art forms, *bunraku*, *kabuki*, *nō* and *kyōgen* are Japanese traditional theatre (see chapters *Origins of the Japanese art of Animating*, 13-23, and *Continuity of Art Forms and Their Visualness*, 24-43).

9 *Shintō* is an indigenous Japanese religion/philosophy (most authors agree it can’t simply be referred to as religion or a form of spirituality only), whose followers worship *kami* deities. It is pantheistic and animistic, with a strong ecological aspect. Though “kami” stands for numerous *shintō* deities, it can also signify any kind of life force or energy that can reside in all things, live or dead. Due to this potential, environment; plants and animals need to be respected as they can also be messenger from gods. The most common and distinguishable feature of *shintō* are orange *torii*-gates which are put in front of temples and all places believed to be sacred grounds. *Shintō* also includes many festivals that reaffirm the relationship between people and nature.

10 Miyazaki’s narratives are well known for adopting *shintō* beliefs and values, especially in form of promoting respect towards nature and bringing forth ecological problems. He himself stated that there are more and more Japanese who abandon belief in *kami*-potential of all things, which he wishes to preserve in his animated works: “In my grandparents’ time, it was believed that spirits [kami] existed everywhere – in trees, rivers, insects, wells, anything. My generation does not believe this, but I like the idea that we should all treasure everything because spirits might exist there, and we should treasure everything because there is a kind of life to everything.” (Quoted from *Japan Times Weekly, 9/28/02* In Boyd and Nishimura (2004))
Hayao Miyazaki was not the only one to speak about the changes brought on by technology, urbanization and “progress”, and with Otomo Katsuhiro’s *Akira* (1988), and Miyazaki’s own *Nausicaä of the Valley of the Wind* (1984), the science fiction genre started to bloom. It is no wonder that it happened in Japan. The Japanese people experienced many of the atrocities of the brave new world and could now produce stories from their own experiences. Many of the animated works depicted dystopic worlds and post-apocalyptic futures which came to be after world wars or nuclear disasters. Posthumanism somehow “naturally” followed these narratives: and as posthuman scholar Rosi Braidotti puts it, “One needs to turn to ‘minor’, not to say marginal and hybrid genres, such as science fiction, horror and cyber punk, to find fitting cultural illustrations of the changes and transformations that are taking place in the forms of relations available in our post-human present. Low cultural genres, like science fiction, are mercifully free of grandiose pretensions – of the aesthetic or cognitive kind – and thus end up being a more accurate and honest depiction of contemporary culture than other, more self-consciously ‘representational’ genres.” (2006, 203)

The most influential representative of the genre without doubt, is a cyberpunk creation by Mamoru Oshii; his masterpiece, *Ghost in the Shell* (1995).

*Brave New Uncanny World & Ghost in the Shell*

*O, wonder!*

*How many goodly creatures are there here!*

*How beauteous mankind is! O brave new world,*

*That has such people in’t!*

--Miranda, in W. Shakespeare’s *The Tempest*, Act V, Scene I

Somehow, it turned out that throughout my studies in popular culture and bioethics, the focus has always been on the essential changes in the world we inhabit and the way this feature of our world affects us. I have also been interested in the ways we affect the world, with an emphasis on ecology and technology, both producing the most visible large-scale changes among the rest of the areas that bioethics is concerned with. Following a statement made by Hans Jonas, that we have found ourselves in an unknown land of collective practice, that is, in an ethical vacuum because there are so many contemporary changes to our lives that we are unable to deal with properly. This paper leans on Hans Jonas’ philosophy of technology in order to resonate my personal strong belief that we are lost in a sense

---

*Nausicaä of the Valley of the Wind* (1984) for example, speaks of a world after a huge disaster which destroyed almost all living beings, and of struggle of Princess Nausicaä to revive life on the planet. Another example is the award-winning *Spirited Away* (2001) which speaks against capitalism and commodification and advocates for a more sensible and sensitive approach to our world and our lives, through a young pure-hearted girl Chihiro and her adventures in a kami bathhouse.

11 Hans Jonas stated that Technoscience found itself in an unknown land of collective practice, thus producing a sort of ethical vacuum which is supposed to bring us to a no man’s land in terms of ethical theory. Jurie, one of the leading bioethics scholars in Croatia emphasizes Jonas’ thought on this ethical vacuum being the very no man’s land; a discrepancy between imagined absolute power that man gained thanks to technology, and man’s absolute feeling of being disoriented in this man-made world (Jonas: 1990, 42-43 in Juric (2008, 9-10).
that the many contemporary processes, such as informatization, globalization, urbanization, commodification, technologization, etc. offer us plenty of answers to our everyday needs, but they also raise issues which we are unable or unwilling to deal with. Why are we unable? Because everything is happening too fast and we do not give ourselves the time to follow the process by reflecting on it. Why unwilling? Because the world’s logics rely heavily on neo-liberal capitalism, and the narcissistic culture we share today does not allow “unnecessary” questioning.

Another issue I am concerned with rises directly from the unknowingness we have (or knowledge we do not have) about the world we inhabit. If the world has ever been anything familiar to us, and I believe to some extent it has been, then the world we inhabit today still may carry this familiar feeling, but actually be a very un-familiar place. It is transforming all over again, creating a chaotic image of our home that does not even represent our home all that much: our thoughts are directed towards universe, with our interests shifting from the Earth towards space. One consequence of this shift is the false premise of the Earth as being exploitable; a temporary station on our way to the stars. In that perspective, Kant’s statement “Two things fill the mind with ever new and increasing admiration and awe, the more often and steadily we reflect upon them: the starry heavens above me and the moral law within me” (Quoted from Kant, *Critique of Practical Reason* (1788) in Schönfeld: 2012) now bears slightly different implications.

Talking about the familiar in un-familiar, or un-familiar in familiar: of course it is derived from Freud’s concept “unheimlich”13, but in this paper it is not so much applied to notions of “the frightening, or what evokes fear and dread” (Freud, 1997, 123), as much as to losing one’s grip in the world we know no more. Even though Freud had a slightly different definition of the concept on his mind, I believe I do not do him any injustice by expanding his definition. He himself implied that the uncanny is linked to the scientific, or to say lack of the scientific. As one aspect of the uncanny emerges from the uncertainty of science, then the term is very applicable to the present technoscientific world.

In his writing, Freud will argue that many people link the uncanny to death and afterlife, which is due to “the uncertainty of the scientific knowledge” (ibid. 148), as both death and the afterlife were and probably will remain unresolved by scientific knowledge. Freud says that we escape to the realm of uncanny and mysticism whenever we meet questions and problems to which our technoscience is unable to provide answers and solutions.

---

12 Kant would develop a metaphysics whose claims anticipate scientific discoveries, “and an ethics that culminated in the Categorical Imperative”. His friends chose to put this quotation from the *Critique of Practical Reason* on his tombstone (Schönfeld, 2012).

13 Freud analyzes the term “unheimlich” starting from its linguistic aspect, with focus on its etymology and various vocabulary definitions of the term. After doing so, he continues with his psychoanalytical analysis. Following the term’s relation to death, dead bodies, revenants, spirits and ghosts, it almost evokes to be linked with scientific uncertainty and especially technological devices, such as automata, which will be further discussed in the paper. Also, going back to Jonas’ ethical vacuum, the term ‘uncanny’ bears a different kind of contemporary significance as “It is not equally beyond doubt that the word is not always used in a clearly definable sense, and so it commonly merges with what arouses fear in general.” (1997, 123)
In today’s technoscientific world, not many people would claim that we lack scientific knowledge, but quite the opposite: we produce so many wonderful things using all newly attained scientific knowledge, followed by a collective hallucination of absolute power over the world. However, the fact is that our knowledge still cannot, and perhaps never will, answer all of our questions (life, death, identity, humanity…). These questions have been evading scientific framing from the beginnings of philosophy. Now, when science has adopted these terms for its own use and definitions, we might feel more secure and less provisional about it, but the truth is that they not only remain unresolved but, due to new (bio)technologies, are even more ambiguous, and that is the reason why the uncanny remains functional even today. Not only is it still functional, but it has acquired new modes of existing in the contemporary world. I claim this here to define the contemporary world as a space that is our home, but does not feel like it anymore. Or, it feels like home, but it changes so rapidly that we are simultaneously aware of our space of belonging and not fully recognizing it as familiar anymore. This is probably a more literal translation of the German word “unheimlich” that Freud uses, but still contains Freud’s thought: only expanded to new modes of human existence.

I see it as ironic to some extent: that for Freud, the uncanny was linked to the mythical, superstitious and infantile, while for us it also includes all familiar-unfamiliar things that the adult world of science and technology creates. Still, Freud himself pointed to this aspect of the term’s applicability, by analyzing E.T.A. Hoffmann’s short story The Sandman (1816). The story actually has much in common with Ghost in the Shell and Innocence, but I will come back to it later.

I am far from being the only one in contemporary cultural studies who links the term with technology, informatics and globalization (exempting Freud who, as its creator, was the first). It has been popular before, with its reference to man-made organic, but mostly in-organic things. This usage is not new: it is just further expanded. This expansion however also links with the fact that humankind today creates and produces much more of organic and inorganic than ever before. The world is being manufactured in many new ways and the beings we create become omnipresent. That is why I fuse this term with Aldous Huxley’s 1931 novel Brave New World. In his popular novel, Huxley presents us a fictional world with certain technological developments – the kind that are no longer fictional today. A satirist, Huxley produced a parody which is not funny anymore. Our new world (if measured by quantity of the destruction of it, then it certainly must belong to us), is the brave new world Huxley is talking about. Maybe not because everything Huxley imagined has become true, but because it reflects to great extent Huxley’s vision of the futuristic-present world we inhabit. Basically, I am suggesting that our brave new world has become a highly-developed unfamiliar home to us. This is not to say that we should denounce all our achievements or live more simple lives; it is to say that we must work harder to understand the world, to think about it and reflect on it more. Otherwise, we are becoming more estranged in our present home - if it is our home at all. Maybe we should consider ourselves as guests here and respect the space we inhabit more.

Aldous Huxley (1894-1963) is not a lone case making his (unintentional) sci-fi legacy in the fields of popular culture and bioethics: Herbert George Wells (1866-1946) was
his contemporary, while Jules Gabriel Verne (1828-1905) was their earliest predecessor. Their novels have been made into films and their visions of the (future) world remained a significant part of popular culture and a valuable resource for the science fiction authors who followed. It is interesting how many posthumanist and science fiction theorists forget about Verne, but in his time his novels were quite fantastical in presenting human achievements which were beyond imagination (and reason). In his time, his novels were quite posthuman already because they anticipated that humans would technologically evolve into species which can easily move in the water and through air. If posthumanism is about enhancing human abilities with the use of technology, then Verne deserves his place in the posthumanist theory. This is significant because it demonstrates that contemporary popular culture that thematizes technology and futuristic worlds is not something new. Jules Verne deserves to be given credit (though I did it only briefly) before moving on to two films which are the focus of the paper: *Ghost in the Shell* and *Ghost in the Shell 2: Innocence*.

*Ghost in the Shell*

*Ghost in the Shell* (*Kôkaku kidôtai*) is an animated film made by Mamoru Oshii in 1995 and has been a topic of discussion ever since (not only has it been heavily discussed, but other works in the field were also strongly influenced by it, i.e. the revolutionary *Matrix* trilogy, made by the Wachowski brothers in 1999, intensively drew inspiration from it). From my own experience, I can say that the film can be seen tens of times without being fully explored; that is its depth and its power.

The plot is very simple: a full-cyborg with human brain, Major Motoko Kusanagi, is the female protagonist of the film. She works as a top operative for Public Section 9, an anti-crime government organization. Together with her team (cyborg Batou, almost-completely-human Togusa and Chief Aramaki being the most prominent), she fights global crime in the post-apocalyptic world of 2029, which is now dominated by Asia. Though the film is abundant with action and all sorts of (bio)technological gadgetry, the focus is on Kusanagi who is trying to identify herself in her uncanny environment. Her search for identity and self-defining intensifies as she crosses paths with the Puppet Master, an apparent ghost-hacker, but actually a life form born in the sea of information: evolving from Project 2501 to a self-conscious being.

What is special about this anime is the way it reflects on universal human struggles, and also questions the future of humanity in a highly-technologized world. The philosophical notions of selfhood, existential crisis, and the search for answers to ontological questions are set in a futuristic world which provides Oshii with a source for problematizing identity and humanity in the way it has always been as part of Philosophy, but also as a response to the contemporary world and its technological promises to humans and other possible life-forms. Oshii complicates the old, never-resolved issues of who we are by offering an answer to what we can become. This becoming is no longer a concept observed within the fields of nurture, pedagogy, education or didactics: it is now observed within the field of technoscience in general and biotechnology in particular. If we ever were uncertain about what we are, this uncertainty is now further expanded due to technoscientific changes through which we, together with our world are burdened with doubts and uncertainty. Science was meant to give us certainty, but it has only increased the feeling of unfamiliarity about the world and especially about ourselves. This post-war future of Oshii’s focuses on
the feeling of unfamiliarity about ourselves through the character of Kusanagi. Even though it is the future that Oshii is depicting, the fact that we are being altered by technology to the extent that many scholars consider us post-human already remains and is further reaffirmed. N. Katherine Hayles and Donna Haraway are the most prominent figures of this kind of posthuman thought and they both argue that we indeed are posthuman already: cyborg is just a metaphor.

Posthumanist theory indeed deals with the coexistence of technology and humankind to a great extent: its alterations and post-human conditions in terms of the technological. It is about fusing the organic and inorganic; or even the prevailing inorganic in the new virtual and cyber realities. The cyborg Kusanagi is a creature of such a post-human world: a world where everyone can plug in and communicate almost telepathically or dive into other personae’s ghosts; a world where the Puppet Master manipulates biotechnologically enhanced cyberbrains and everyone can become half-immortal by replacing their organic body parts with inorganic ones. But do androids dream of electric sheep? Yes, they do. Even though what we see in Oshii’s masterpiece is fully imagined, the questions are real and relevant. Some of those questions were already raised in two of Oshii’s forerunners: Ridley Scott’s Blade Runner in 1982 and the already mentioned William Gibson’s Neuromancer, both cult cyberpunk-noir works.

At the end of the film, Kusanagi and the Puppet Master merge, creating a new life-form, non-dependent on the body and free to join the vast and limitless Net. This was the point when Donna Haraway’s promise of creatures in a post-gender world became realized by anime. This is also the point when Cartesian mind-body dualism came back to life (if it ever was overcome in Western tradition in the first place). It is because the film evokes this dualism: first by replacing bodies and externalizing brains, that is to offer the possibility of switching inorganic bodies while human brains remain intact, and second: by offering a “happy ending” where the body is no longer needed and the mind can exist on its own as part of the Net.

We have have struggled with this dualism quite a lot in the past, for which Haraway anticipates a posthuman solution in her Cyborg Manifesto (1985). This dualism however did not only impact human beings: implications of such a philosophy extend to the Universe. René Descartes made a huge impact on Western philosophy and science with his well known mind-body dualism. To ancient Greeks, human beings belonged within the Whole together with nature (physis), while Descartes, instead of observing human beings as inclusive, decided to oppose human beings to nature. Further, by dividing the Whole into res cogitans and res extensa, he laid the foundations for the new natural sciences (Hösle, 1996, 40). The division has had major consequences in the fields of natural sciences, which remain present - especially in terms of our relationship with the world we inhabit.

14 In his Meditations (1996) Descartes has clearly divided everything in existence into two matters: res cogitans-thinking matter and res extensa-non-thinking matter. While a man belongs into the first category, everything else: plants, animals, and nature included, belongs into the second category. If the latter category implies that all beings included are mere mechanisms and of lesser value, it is obvious what it means from the modern scientific perspective.
Another philosopher who contributed was Descartes’ predecessor, Francis Bacon, who called for an exploration of nature as a servant that needs to be tamed. However, as I mentioned earlier, the film *Ghost in the Shell* has a happy ending, seemingly resolving the raised issue of dualism by creating a new software-like life-form that does not need its hardware anymore.

Cyborgs and these disembodied life-forms might be promising a better future, but whether or not it resolves the problem that Cartesian dualism creates is yet to be seen.

**Ghost in the Shell 2: Innocence**

*Innocence* (2004) follows up the *Ghost in the Shell* film, but with focus shifted away from *humanity* and directed towards biocentric ethics and non-human life forms. Oshii however, still refers to humanity, increasing the feeling of uncaniness by “playing” with all kinds of automata and their human doubles.

*Innocence* takes place in 2032 and revolves around the main Public Section 9’s team, Batou and Togusa. Major Motoko Kusanagi has disappeared into the Net but remains a Guardian Angel for Batou who, together with his new partner, investigates murders and suicides committed by gynoids produced by a company named Locus Solus. The gynoids, a kind of androids, were intended for sexual pleasure, but the producer “enriched” them with ghosts he dubbed from kidnapped children.

If popular culture, cultural research, literature, philosophy and technoscience ever met in one *nodal point*, to use Francois Lyotard’s term, it was this film. This is most apparent in its use of citations which are so abundant that it is hard for viewers to follow the dialogue (even with excellent subtitles).

Steven T. Brown, author of one of the most elaborated articles on *Innocence* states: “I would argue that Oshii’s use of citationality in *Ghost in the Shell 2* also serves a larger philosophical purpose in relation to ventriloquism of the puppet theater. Such citationality foregrounds not simply the ventriloquism of the director or screenplay...”

---

15 In his major work *The New Organon* which was part of his great project of the *Great Renewal*, supposed to modernize science, Francis Bacon writes: “Human knowledge and human power come to the same thing, because of ignorance of cause frustrates effect. For Nature is conquered only by obedience; and that which in thought is a cause, is like a rule in practice.” (2000, 33)

16 Steven T. Brown wrote an excellent article on this topic, which was published in *Mechademia* series. Brown links the *uncanny* to automata in *Innocence*, ranging from traditional Japanese puppets to such technological creatures as gynoids. He states: “The uncanny blurring of boundaries between the animate and the inanimate, the living and the dead, is clearly exemplified by puppet-like characters, but the uncanny is also evoked in scenes involving cyberbrain hacking and e-brain communication.” (2008, 225). He then goes further to explore the uncaniness of these puppet-like characters, also categorizing the automata we encounter in the film. Brown cites Oshii on this: “There are no human beings in *Ghost in the Shell 2: Innocence*. The characters are all human-shaped dolls.” (Ibid. 222) On another occasion, he writes: “Each instance of the uncanny that unfolds at Kim’s mansion (the repetition of déjà vu, the blurring of boundaries between life and death, animate and inanimate, and the doppelgänger) evokes a feeling of unhomeliness in the home, a defamiliarization of the everyday that destabilizes our assumptions about what it means to be human in a posthuman world and how we are to relate to all the *ningyō* (dolls, puppets, automata, and androids) that inhabit the world with us.” (234).

17 “Young or old, man or woman, rich or poor, a person is always located at “nodal points” of specific communication circuits, however tiny these may be. Or better: one is always located at a post through which various kinds of messages pass.” (Lyotard: 1984)
Though *Innocence* also speaks of the relationship between humanity and technology; organic and inorganic; familiar and unfamiliar; human and non-human (but alive), I find it most interesting on three other interconnected levels.

The first level is the aforementioned intertextuality or citationality, as referred to by Brown. Second is the evocation for transhumanist ethics, that is biocentric ethics, and the third level is Donna Haraway’s signature throughout the film (which made me doubt whether she co-authored it).

The second level is interesting because it further expands bioethical issues of a posthuman world and of the impacts of the development of (bio)technology on human and non-human lives.

*Transhumanist* and *biocentric* in the syntagm suggests that other life-forms besides humans should be taken into consideration. This especially becomes evident in the use of the word *biocentric*, coined from two terms: *bios* – which means life, and *centric* – in the center: defining ethics as a discipline which deals with all life-forms, as opposed to traditional anthropocentric ethics.

If we are to face the brave new uncanny world, then it is apparent that there is a whole bunch of issues we need to deal with. Imagining possible futures, just like Oshii does, provides great means to do just that. Besides, it is not only the future we are talking about, because we always reflect contemporaneity in the products we create and the futures we imagine. Visions always come from minds that are present here and now, so the visions may tell us more about our own struggles and reactions today than about future ones. In *Innocence*, for example, Oshii poses a problem of human relation to non-human life forms: not only gynoids and cyborgs, but also animals. So when we put all these new-imagined and old-existent life forms into one sphere, it is apparent that our task is to provide new kinds of ethics and orientation tools to redefine life which only seemingly still revolves around a man. This projection of a pre-Galilean and pre-Copernican self-centered/human-centered universe onto ethics requires revolution. Humanist and anthropocentric ethics no longer suffice.

Now we arrive to the third level: *Donna Haraway’s level*.

Hawaray is likely the most famous cyber feminist author, whose *Cyborg Manifesto* remains the reference point for all authors engaging in posthumanist and particularly cyborg studies. Besides *Cyborg Manifesto*, Haraway wrote another interesting work, *The Companion Species Manifesto: Dogs, People, and Significant Otherness* (2003)\(^{18}\)

\(^{18}\) In her *Companion Species*, Haraway’s goal is to show “1) how might an ethics and politics committed to the flourishing of significant otherness be learned from taking dog-human relationships seriously and 2) how might stories about dog-human worlds finally convince brain-damaged US Americans, and maybe other less historically challenged people, that history matters in naturecultures?"
which might be even more interesting as a reference point to *Innocence* than the *Cyborg Manifesto*.

When one reads through her work and then watches *Innocence*, one cannot resist to draw a very distinctive parallel between the two authors. *Innocence* is concerned with dogs as much as it is concerned with people and automatons. Oshii would even say that this film is about him and his dog.¹⁹ With that in mind, Oshii and Haraway both speak about species closely related to humans, calling for new ethical consideration and re-definition of relationship between humans and animals (here, dogs). Oshii further adopts Haraway’s concept of cyborg²⁰, its potential (post-genderness) and its characteristics (non-Innocence). Related to the latter, it is ironic (again) that Oshii names his film *Innocence*, when it is actually about the pursuit of human attempted re-production(s) of innocence (through dolls and other automata) which is always inscribed in animals and children, but which always eludes all human attempts. Oshii draws on Haraway’s words when adopting the concept of innocence: “A cyborg body is not innocent; it was not born in a garden; it does not seek unitary identity and so generate antagonistic dualism without end…” (1991, 181)

This is not the only concept we find in both authors’ works: Haraway also speaks of textualization,²¹ mentioned earlier, which Oshii elaborates and applies in his story of innocence. In a way, Oshii uses his puppet-like characters’ bodies and their language to embody and express the fact that we are always covered with layers of meanings, and that the postmodernist world we share is all constructed from inscribed texts and interpretations.

To conclude this short exposé on the account of the third level, I will draw the attention of the potential viewer to the character of coroner Haraway. This female cyborg character created by Oshii establishes the most apparent connection with Haraway’s work, and is whom he grants her wish that she stated in the final sentence of her *Cyborg Manifesto*: “I would rather be a cyborg than a goddess.”²²

(…) The story here is mainly about dogs. Passionately engaged in these accounts, I hope to bring my readers into the kennel for life.” (2003, 3)

¹⁹ Dani Cavallaro explores the world of *Innocence* in his book *The Cinema of Mamoru Oshii* (2006), in which he brings the following statement made by the director: “Since people are all starting to lose part of or all of their ‘bodies’, they need to associate themselves with something else to identify themselves. It could be dogs like myself, or it could be cats or other animals. It does not need to be living things. It could be machines, cars, computers, cities, just about anything but yourself. That’s how you find your lost ‘bodies’ … people are definitely losing their human forms. Animals have always stayed the same, and continue to do so in the years to come, but humans are always changing, and they need to change, with the development of technology. However, they should not fear the change or evolution, but rather accept it and learn to live with it… This movie is about me and my dog [Oshii 2004c].” (209).

²⁰ Haraway’s cyborg is “a cybernetic organism, a hybrid of machine and organism, a creature of social reality as well as a creature of fiction. (…) Contemporary science fiction and modern medicine is full of cyborgs.” (1991, 150-151).

²¹ In *Cyborg Manifesto* Haraway states: “Technological determination is only one ideological space opened up by the reconceptions of machine and organism as coded texts through which we engage in the play of writing and reading the world. ‘Textualization’ of everything in poststructuralist, postmodernist theory has been damned by Marxists and and socialist feminists for its utopian disregard for the lived relations of domination that ground the ‘play’ of arbitrary reading.” (1991, 153)

²² “Cyborg imagery can suggest a way out of the maze of dualisms in which we have explained our bodies and our tools to ourselves. This is a dream not of a common language, but of powerful infidel heteroglossia. It is an imagination of a feminist speaking in tongues to strike fear into the circuits of the Supersavers of the new right. It means both building and destroying machines, identities, categories,
Conclusion

At first glance, the fusion of Bioethics and Popular Culture might seem a bit odd, but hopefully this paper shows the validity for bioethical questioning of popular culture products and the use its analysis can have for humanists, cultural researchers and scholars engaged in bioethics. In this particular case, the focus is on Japanese animation (Ghost in the Shell and Ghost in the Shell 2: Innocence), but the whole range of popular literature, film, art, and the rest of pop-culture artifacts can be used for the purpose.

The early science fiction novels of Jules Verne, Aldous Huxley and G. H. Wells prove this vividly. I did not want to go into cultural politics or analyze the global dialectics between Americanization and Japanization. For the purposes of this paper, I have fully dedicated the topic to dealing with rising bioethical issues in the contemporaneity of the world we live in – and what better way to do that than to use such mediums, which are (in)direct products of the contemporary environment and technological development! In this sense, the famous cyberpunk animated works of Mamoru Oshii can serve as both subject and object in this kind of bioethical questioning.

Ghost in the machine is an idea that has been haunting us for quite some time now, starting with Western Philosophy and Descartes’ mind-body dualism. Today, this idea transforms due to the need to deal with techno-others and the radical human involvement in manufacturing and transforming the world.

Though bioethics deals mostly with ethical dilemmas arisen from technoscientific development (most visibly in the field of medicine), this multi-perspective discipline also deals with life itself: its conditions, transformations and conditions of preservation. One of the most recent bioethical concerns is certainly the impact of technology on (human) lives and the ways that technology shapes our world and our selfhood today. This impact becomes most apparent in the change of narratives and discourses we use when addressing the issue of living beings: The human genome project completed in 2003 proved that we have long been translated into codes and data: becoming objects which call for de-cyphering and further experimental uses. Our collective consciousness today rises from the hallucinated feeling of absolute power and the need to colonize every single corner of our universe, including our own genes.

Using popular culture narratives in the form of Mamoru Oshii’s distinguished works, I have tried to point my questioning finger to some of these issues, and will hopefully trigger further interest among scholars coming from different disciplines.

As stated in the previous segments of the paper, our contemporary condition consists of radical and rapid transformations to which we do not have answers to and which we do not yet know how to deal with. The issues that are the focus here are by all means nothing new: ever since the first human felt marvel for the world (thus the relationships, space stories. Though both are bound in the spiral dance, I would rather be a cyborg than a goddess.” (154).
beginning of Philosophy) such questions existed, but were framed with their own time’s needs and possibilities.

We continue to reflect further, but we have to consider these questions in quite a different context, since technoscience offered some new answers and deepened old doubts. This is not a negative criticism against technology and science: it is a call for more cultural research, more reflections, and definitely more inclusion of marginalized Humanities into the contemporary world.
References


Filmography:

*Ghost in the Shell / 攻殻機動隊 / Kōkaku Kidōtai* [DVD], 2004. Directed by Mamoru OSHII. Japan: Kodansha in association with Bandai Visual and Manga Entertainment; Production I. G.


*Nausicaä of the Valley of the Wind / 風の谷のナウシカ / Kaze no Tani no Naushika* [DVD], 1984. Directed by Hayao MIYAZAKI. Japan: Top Craft.


From Resistance to Participation: Clanship and Urban Modernization in the Wuyi Rural Market Towns During the Republican Era

Tung-Yiu Stan Lai and Weijen Wang
stylai1421@yahoo.com.hk

Abstract
Studies on urban modernization in early twentieth century South China usually attribute rural development only to the government and some returned overseas Chinese. In Wuyi, a region in South China, the traditional clanship that dominated rural society is usually considered to have slowed down urban modernization during that period. However, most of the modernized rural markets were in fact developed by the local clan organizations. It seems that clanship influence on urban modernization in rural society has always been underestimated.

This paper attempts to investigate the neglected role of these clan organizations in the process of urban modernization during the Republican era in Wuyi. It is a historical study that is mainly based on archival documents including government publications, articles in local magazines, share offer prospectuses for village and market establishments, fund-raising articles for construction of bridges, etc.

The above documents show the gradual change of the clan organizations’ attitude from resistance to acceptance, cooperation, and finally to active participation in the process of urban modernization in their hometowns. They are further analyzed by referring to artefacts of townscape which show the merger of traditional clanship and modernized practices in rural markets. As an illustration, Tingjiang Xu is examined to show inter-clan competition with neighbouring markets under the modernized administrative system and design.

This paper concludes that clan organizations had acted as a crucial intermediate party among the government, returned overseas Chinese, and the local individual dwellers in urban modernization in Wuyi. It corrects the widely but wrongly held image of a reactionary clanship society being pushed by external forces for modernization in Republican China (1912-1949).
Introduction

Studies on urban modernization in early twentieth century South China usually attribute rural development only to the government and some returned overseas Chinese. In Wuyi, a region in South China, the traditional clanship that dominated the rural society is usually considered to have slowed down urban modernization during that period. However, most of the modernized rural markets were in fact developed by the local clan organizations (Zhang et al., 1998; Zhang, 2004, 2005). It seems that clanship influence on urban modernization in rural society has always been underestimated.

The Wuyi cultural region in central Guangdong Province is composed of the “five counties”: Enping, Heshan, Kaiping, Taishan, and Xinhui. They share a common dialect and other cultural customs (Figures 1 and 2). This region has had a high amount of emigrants to foreign countries since the nineteenth century. There were also a large amount of markets by the eighteenth century, which were mostly developed by one single clan, or by cooperation of several clans.

This paper attempts to investigate the neglected role of the clan organizations in urban modernization in the Republic of China in Wuyi (Republican era, 1912-1949). It is a historical study that is mainly based on archival documents including government publications, share offer prospectuses for village and market establishments, etc. These documents show the gradual change of clan organizations’ attitude from resistance to acceptance, cooperation, and finally to active participation in urban modernization in their hometowns. They are further analyzed by referring to artefacts of townscape which show a merger of traditional clanship and modernized practices in rural markets. As an illustration, the twin-market of Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu in Duanfen Town of Taishan County is examined to show inter-clan competition under the modernized administrative system and design.

Figure 1. Location map of the Wuyi region
In 1925, the Governor of Taishan County in Wuyi, Liu Zaifu’s request for autonomy was approved by Sun Yat-Sen’s Nationalist Government in Guangzhou. The county was financially autonomous with the power to raise funds, tax, and spend the tax income. These powers facilitated the county’s development in urban construction, education, transportation, etc. In particular, the simplification of the reporting system to the provincial and national governments accelerated the capital-raising and execution of urban development (Zhu, 2004: 34-35).

Similar to Guangzhou, the County Government of Taishan established a Public Works Bureau (gong wu ju 工務局). The Proposal for Material Constructions of Taishan (Taishan wu zhi jian she ji hua shu 台山物質建設計劃書) was issued in 1929 setting the guidelines for public works in this autonomous county (Tan, 1929). It was recorded that the master plan for renewal of the whole county was established by
the Governor in 1923. Two renewal methods according to different degrees of governmental dominance were recorded:

(1) **High degree of governmental dominance:**
This method of renewal consisted of first establishing Municipal Administration Offices (*shi zheng xiang ban chu* 市政勷辦處) in different market towns and appointing prestigious local squires for assistance. These offices were responsible for the affairs of capital-raising and administration, then the Public Works Bureau planned and supervised the works. The appointment of squires was a strategic means of obtaining the trust of local residents in order to minimize the local obstacles and to accelerate the process. There were only thirteen markets on the upper central-place level renewed under a high degree of governmental dominance.

(2) **Low degree of governmental dominance:**
The majority of markets on the lower central-place level were renewed under a low degree of governmental dominance. They were carried out by means of the Public Works Bureau's surveying of sites, site planning, and then indirectly supervising the merchants’ administration and construction works.

Although the authority’s governance in high-level cities like Guangzhou was stronger compared to that in the lower-level towns and rural areas, it does not mean that the government could easily execute urban modernization with the full support of the city dwellers. There were revolts against these policies by the residents in Guangzhou due to inconvenience and loss of properties (Yeung, 1999). On the other hand, in the lower-level Taishan County, where the power of clan organizations was much stronger, the difficulties in urban modernization are easier to imagine. Therefore, when the Taishan County Government initiated urban modernization in the lower-level towns and villages, they had no choice but to obtain the assistance of local squires. We can also see that the lower degree of governmental dominance in urban modernization existed in the lower-level markets in general.

**Overseas Chinese and Urban Modernization: Mediator between the Government and the Clans**

In addition to the government, overseas Chinese also contributed to urban modernization in South China. The founder of Xinning Railway 新寧鐵路, Chin Gee Hee, was born in Liucun, Doushan, Taishan County of Wuyi, and imigrated to the West Coast of the U.S.A. He returned to Taishan in 1904, and established the only railway in Wuyi in history (Zheng and Cheng, 1991: 34-39). The capital raised for the first stage of construction was mainly from the overseas Chinese of Taishan origin (Zheng and Cheng, 1991: 43). Other than individuals, some of the capital was in the name of *ju* 祖 or *tang* 堂 [clan organizations] and hometown associations overseas (Zheng and Cheng, 1991: 45).

Xinning Railway was a modern infrastructural work wholly initiated, planned, funded, and executed by civilians without any governmental participation. However, according to Zhang and Cheng (1991: 57), its development process exposed the

---

1 Xinning Railway has been demolished since the late 1930s due to the bankruptcy of the operator and Japanese invasion.

2 *Sunning Magazine* was a countywide civilian magazine of Taishan founded in 1909 (Qing
conflict between the “local feudal power” and the “emerging overseas Chinese’s capital power.” What Zhang and Cheng call “local feudal power” can be regarded as the clan organizations scattering over the rural areas of Wuyi. This can be reflected in the obstacles that local clans posed during each phase of construction. During phase one, the originally planned line to Xinchang was resisted by the Zhen clansmen near Xinchang and was finally suspended. During phase two, resistance by the Kuang clansmen of Shagang Cun resulted in a shift of the line in a more indirect manner. These incidents of resistance were mainly due to blackmail or feng shui reason (Zheng and Cheng, 1991: 49-53).

However, the railway was a vital component of the economic bloom in Wuyi during the Republican period. Goods from places outside were rapidly imported to and circulated within Wuyi, and directly benefited the founding or renewal of market towns. Among these market towns, the founding of Gongyi Bu indicated the evident contribution by overseas Chinese (Figure 3). One of the founders, Wu Yuzheng, born in Shachong Cun, Dajiang of Taishan County, returned from the U.S.A. in 1905 (Qing Dynasty). He mobilized overseas Chinese merchants, local squires of the Li, Yi, Wu clans, etc. near Gongyi to establish the Office of Port Affairs (bu wu gong suo 埠務公所) for the development of the new port. Unlike other clans, Wu negotiated with Chin Gee Hee and requested for setting a station at Gongyi. This showed the different vision that the overseas Chinese had compared with that of the traditional local squires about the merits of new infrastructure. Finally, Gongyi Bu was opened in 1908 with a railway station right next to it (Cai and Deng, 2006: 48).
The strong local kinship ties are believed to be an important driving force for the overseas Chinese’s contribution to the public affairs of their rural hometowns. In fact, they replaced the government in importing overseas knowledge and carrying out urban modernization for public interests. This enhanced their reputation among the clans. Moreover, their strong concept of ‘family’ meant they sent most of their savings from foreign countries back home. A considerable amount of money was spent on building their own houses (in the form of individual luxurious residences, watch towers, or village houses in the kin-based grid-patterned villages), or invested in building shophouses in the markets for rent. By these means, they could safeguard the living standard of their families, relatives, and of themselves after returning to their hometowns in the future (Li, 1999: 164-172). As a result, these new property developments also constituted the modernization of the townscape of Wuyi.

The overseas Chinese’s investment in their hometowns reflected a quasi-modern-capitalist practice influenced by their exposure to the Western commercial system in foreign countries. For example, a clear charter for shareholding and company-limited systems was issued by Chin Gee Hee during his capital-raising from overseas Chinese for Xinning Railway in 1905 (Zhang and Cheng, 1991: 38). Similar practices familiar to the overseas Chinese have also been widely adopted in different property development projects even in the Qing era before 1912 (Qionglin Li, 1908).

For instance, in Duanfen Town of Taishan County, a new market known as Tingjiang Xu was founded by the Mei and other clans in 1932. From the preserved Tingjiang Xu Shareholding Booklet 汀江墟股份簿 (Tingjiang Xu, 1933), we can discover very detailed written regulations about the modernized systems of stock launch, capital-raising process, shareholding, organization, operation, property management, tenancy agreement, etc. The procedure of establishment of Tingjiang Xu as recorded in the “shareholding booklet” can be summarized as the following steps:

1. Formation of founders and preparatory committee
2. Surveying and planning
3. Application for government endorsement
4. Stock launch for capital-raising from invited clans
5. Subscription of shares by the clans
6. Purchase of shares by individual clansmen via the clans
7. Lottery and allocation of shop lots
8. Purchase of farmlands for the market site
9. Construction of common works by Common Developer
10. Construction of shophouses by individual shareholders
11. Renting of shophouses to businessmen
12. Operation of business for each shop

The seemingly modernized procedure for market establishment in fact still implied clanship dominance of commercial practice. Particularly in steps 4 to 6, the shares of the new market were only offered to limited clans rather than to the public. Even the shareholding of market, which corresponded to the ownership of shophouses, was not an absolutely free property. Assignment of shophouses required the endorsement by the Board of Directors of the market, which was controlled by the founding clans only.
The contribution of overseas Chinese in Wuyi spanned over different levels of towns. Their capital penetrated into different types of urban projects such as infrastructures, markets, individual buildings, etc. Their knowledge in modern project administration, planning, and design from foreign countries was also introduced to their hometowns. In conclusion, they can be regarded as the intermediate class between the government who dominated the large cities and the local squires and clan organizations who dominated the rural parts of Wuyi.

**Clanship and Urban Modernization: From Resistance to Participation**

The traditional clanship that dominated the rural society of Wuyi is usually considered to have slowed down urban modernization during the Republican era (Zhang and Cheng, 1991: 5-7; TSXGWJ, 1929). However, we can assume that urban modernization in the rural part, being the lower-level market towns and villages, could never have been achieved without the promotion or at least cooperation of the local squires and clan organizations.

During the Republican era and before, the sovereignty of the government in these rural areas far from the county administrative seats had always been weak and indirect through the local squires and clan organizations. The news of inter-village, inter-clan, intra-clan, or clan-government conflicts were reported in *Sunning Magazine* at that time. These conflicts occurred so frequently that four pieces of such news in issue 25, 1922 of this magazine can be found, meaning that there were at least four such incidents in Taishan County in ten days (Table 1).

These conflicts, sometimes even with firearms, provided the “premodern” impression of the rural Wuyi. Each village was usually occupied by one or several branches of a clan, and a clan might branch out to different villages in a locality. Autonomous association (*zi zhi hui* 自治會) was one form of clan organization uniting different branches and villages under the same clan. The conflicts related to clanship usually broke out over economic benefits, such as property boundaries.

These clan organizations were sometimes resistant to the changes of urban modernization for two reasons. Firstly, the new construction works disturbed their traditional way of life. Secondly, the new developments were regarded as an infringement on their original territories and benefits, such as properties. In addition to the incidents of local squires’ resistance to the construction of Xinning Railway, there were many similar incidents against the construction of highways in rural areas. Four such incidents were recorded in *The Photo Album of the Construction Works of Taishan County* (Taishan Xian jian she tu ying 台山縣建設圖影) issued by Public Works Bureau, Taishan County (TSXGWJ, 1929) (Table 2).

---

*Sunning Magazine* was a countywide civilian magazine of Taishan founded in 1909 (Qing Dynasty). It was issued three times a month in the Republican era.
Table 1. News of inter-village, inter-clan, intra-clan, and clan-government conflicts reported in issue 25, 1922 of Sunning Magazine

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 11</th>
<th>Chapter 2Heading:</th>
<th>Chapter 3“房界之爭訴界”</th>
<th>Chapter 4[Litigation for branch territories]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page no.:</td>
<td>14-15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location:</td>
<td>Chakeng 茶坑, Sijiu 四九</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rival parties:</td>
<td>Among three branches (fang 房) in the Kuang 鄺 clan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background:</td>
<td>Three branches strove for the common occupation of pond behind village.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process:</td>
<td>One of the branches refused the request by the clan elders to return the pond to common use.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Result:</td>
<td>Two other branches prepared to litigate.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2 Heading: “爭訟界幾乎釀禍”  
[Struggle for territory almost resulting in battle]

| Page no.:  | 39              |                          |                                             |
| Location:  | Paobu 泡步, Shuinan 水南 |                          |                                             |
| Rival parties: | The Zhu 朱 clan vs. The Chen 陳 clan |                          |                                             |
| Background: | The Zhu clan encroached several feet of the territory of the neighbouring Chen clan for construction work. |                          |                                             |
| Process:   | An elder of Chen clan was assaulted when he negotiated with the Zhu clan. |                          |                                             |
| Result:    | The Zhu clan was requested to compensate the Chen clan for medical costs. |                          |                                             |

3 Heading: “抗警費被拘”  
[Arrested for resistance to police levy]

| Page no.:  | 50-51           |                          |                                             |
| Location:  | Paobu 泡步, Shuinan 水南 |                          |                                             |
| Rival parties: | The Zhu 朱 and the Chen 陳 clans vs. Local police branch |                          |                                             |
| Background: | The Zhu and the Chen clans refused paying the local police levy. |                          |                                             |
| Process:   | The two clans persistently refused to pay after several orders by Police Commander. |                          |                                             |
| Result:    | The police arrested six Zhu clansmen and two Chen clansmen, and ordered payment for release of them. |                          |                                             |

4 Heading: “沖蔞伍定安村之不平敬告邑人家族父老書”  
[Declaration of complaint by Ding’an-Cun 定安村 branch of the Wu 伍 clan to clan elders]

| Page no.:  | Nil               |                          |                                             |
| Location:  | Ding’an Cun 定安村, Chongliu 冲 Lanka |                          |                                             |
| Rival parties: | Ding’an-Cun 定安村 branch of the Wu 伍 clan vs. Bajia-Cun 八家村 branch of the Wu clan. |                          |                                             |
| Background: | Two branches strove for territory. |                          |                                             |
**Process:** Bajia-Cun branch employed 300 gangsters to destroy Ding’an-Cun branch’s crops and access road, set fire on 11 houses, and assault the women. However, the incident was distorted in the report in a magazine, of which the editor belonged to Bajia-Cun branch.

**Result:** Ding’an-Cun 定安村 branch requested the elders of the Wu Clan Autonomous Association (Wu zu zi zhi hui 伍族自治會) for mediation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5Highway</th>
<th>Chapter 6Village resisting</th>
<th>Chapter 7Request by villagers</th>
<th>Chapter 8Resolutions by government</th>
<th>Chapter 9Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 10Tai-Di Highway</td>
<td>Chapter 12Yue Shan Cun Chapter 13月山村</td>
<td>Chapter 14Rerouting from the right-hand side to the left-hand side of village, due to blockage of water source and feng shui problem</td>
<td>Chapter 15Lobbying with villagers</td>
<td>Chapter 16Construction according to original route; traffic convenience; villagers’ regret for resistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 11台 萃 公 路</td>
<td>Chapter 19Bajia Cun Chapter 20八 家 村</td>
<td>Chapter 21Rerouting further away from village</td>
<td>Chapter 22Forceful suppression of garrison (external, and not under Taishan County Government) employed by villagers</td>
<td>Chapter 23Construction according to original route; traffic convenience; and villagers’ regret for resistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 17Tai-Di Highway</td>
<td>Chapter 18台 萃 公 路</td>
<td>Chapter 26Donkeng Cun Chapter 27東 坑 村</td>
<td>Chapter 28Rerouting</td>
<td>Chapter 29Lobbying with villagers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 24Tai-Di Highway</td>
<td>Chapter 25台 萃 公 路</td>
<td>Chapter 33Zen Cun Chapter 34繒 困 村</td>
<td>Chapter 35Rerouting to the back of village</td>
<td>Chapter 36Lobbying with villagers and construction of a roadside school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 31Tai-Hai Highway</td>
<td>Chapter 32台 海 公 路</td>
<td>Chapter 35Rerouting to the back of village</td>
<td>Chapter 36Lobbying with villagers and construction of a roadside school</td>
<td>Chapter 37Construction according to original route; traffic convenience; improvement in education; and villagers’ regret for resistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From these incidents, we can see that the power of Bajia Cun was strong enough to employ external garrisons to revolt against the Public Works Bureau of Taishan. Therefore, except the incident of Bajia Cun, in most cases the government could only persuade the villagers to accept the constructions. In the incident of Zengkun Cun, the government even offered to help with the construction of a roadside school in order to please the villagers.

Kin-based settlements had spread widely in the villages and towns in Wuyi probably since the Ming Dynasty (fourteenth to seventeenth centuries) (Zhang et al, 1998: 25-26). The strong kinship bond had influenced the formation of grid-patterned villages with house blocks closely packed in a regular layout usually deliberately set by a single clan organization. Such an intimate mode of living can only be adopted by dwellers with kinship bonds and a well-structured clan organization.

In 1908 (late Qing Dynasty), near the Mei-clan-dominated Tingjiang Xu, a new grid-pattern village known as Qionglin Li was founded by four branches of the same clan. (Qionglin Li, 1908: 2-3) (Figure 4). From the preserved Booklet of Shareholding Charter for Establishment of Qionglin Li 創建瓊林里股份章程簿, although a similar shareholding system to Tingjiang Xu was adopted, we can find that some terms with clanship style were inserted in the regulations of establishment (Table 3).

**Table 3. Terms with clanship style in Booklet of Shareholding Charter for Establishment of Qionglin Li**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 38 Article no.</th>
<th>Chapter 39 Summary (translated from Chinese to English by the author)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 405</td>
<td>Those do not want to build houses in the village shall sell the shares only to the shareholders of the village, and sale of shares to external buyers is prohibited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>In case of any village houses built close to the graves of other clan branches arousing conflict and litigation, the village association shall fund and help the house owners for protection of territories.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Any fee due to removal of stuff encroaching the common areas shall be charged to the violators. Those refuse to compensate the fee of removal shall be deprived of all the rights in the village.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>The revenues from rent of common properties shall subsidize the educational expenditures of descendants for the glory of village.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>The two administers shall be composed of one from the branches of Yuanshao and Keda, and another from the branches of Delong, and Xichong.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>The descendants of our four branches shall obey the instructions by the ancestors to live in harmony. In case of any quarrels, the elders of our village shall be called for mediation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3 The four branches were in the name of zu 祖 [common ancestor], namely Yuanshao 元韶, Keda 可 達, Delong 德 隆, and Xichong 錫重.
### Chapter 38: Articles

| Chapter 39: Summary (translated from Chinese to English by the author) |
|---|---|
| 26 | The kinsmen of the village shall love and respect each other. All villagers shall be responsible and well-behaved. |
| 30 | The remaining four shares are reserved for the branches of Yuanshao and Delong, for reward of their efforts in founding the village. |
| 31 | The strip of land behind the village school is reserved for villagers to construct their ancestral halls in the future. |

#### Figure 4. Grid-patterned village, Qionglin Li, Duanfen, Taishan County

Compared to Tingjiang Xu (as a market), Qionglin Li (as a village) was more like a close-knitted and autonomous community, restricted to only the founding families from four branches of the Mei clan. This system was clearly enforced by article 5 regarding the sale of shares, implying building and residence in the village, to other clans or even other branches of the Mei clan was prohibited. This “shareholding booklet” was more than a commercial document. The kinship bond of villagers was reinforced by rights of space, such as protection of territory (Article 17), use of common areas (Article 18), and building of ancestral hall in village (Article 31); and finance, such as support for litigation (Article 17) and subsidy for educational expenditures (Article 22). Moreover, the villagers’ obligations in terms of both morality and behaviour were also regulated.

Regardless of the clanship domination hidden in these terms of Qionglin Li establishment as well as those of the shareholding of Tingjiang Xu, there was a general desire for modernization among the clan organizations in this region in the early twentieth century. The purpose of founding Tingjiang Xu by different clans was declared in the “shareholding booklet” as reforming the “administrative organization dominated by a single clan in apatriarchal style and the lack of freedom for the other clans” in a neighbouring old market, Datong Shi (Tingjiang Xu, 1933: 17). The desire for modernization was also expressed in the “shareholding booklet” of Qionglin Li:
“The world is getting more civilized. All organisms survive by competition. We should insist on long-term evolution.” (Qionglin Li, 1908: 2)

Therefore, we can conclude that in the rural area of Wuyi during the Republican period, on the one hand, the modernized capitalist practice introduced by the overseas Chinese was still fused with the residual of traditional kin-based commercial practice. On the other hand, the traditional clan organizations were undergoing a modernization process through new commercial practices. Severe commercial competition between clans, also with the backup of overseas Chinese capital, acted as the important motivator for the development of many modernized rural markets in Wuyi during the Republican era (Mei Weiqiang, 1996, 2002; Zhang, 2004, 2005).

Twin-market: Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu

The phenomenon of “twin-markets” exposed how the market developers, usually composed of one single clan or several clans, reacted with their competing counterparts in market development. Evidenced by various cases in South China, we can see that if the demand is sufficiently high in a locality, a new market would tend to be founded nearby to compete with the existing market. The generally longer distance between markets before the late Qing Dynasty (late nineteenth century) showed an “order of distance” maintained by clanship power in association with the local government. This practice was a social custom rather than a clear legal enforcement. An obvious case in Duanfen was the Chens’ Shangze Xu founded before 1545 (Ming Dynasty) and the Mei’s Shandi Xu founded in 1771 (early Qing Dynasty). Due to complaints by the Chens, the Mei clan’s original intention of utilizing the existing market network of Shangze Xu by establishing the new Jiangshan Xu next to it not approved by the local government. Finally, the Meis were forced to relocate to a new market which was subsequently renamed ‘Shandi Xu’ further away from the old one (Mei Youchun, 1983: 62; Mei Yimin, 1984: 71).

However, the order of distance had ceased since a modernized marketing system was introduced later in the Republican period (Figure 5). Therefore, when this modernized condition combined with a high demand for marketing activities in a locality, a new market would be founded by another clan right next to the original market, giving rise to the so-called “twin-market.”

---

4 Wu Bingwang and Mei Chengji, interviewed by the author, 7 September 2006; and Mei Weiqiang, interviewed by the author, 17 August 2008.
This section focuses on Tingjiang Xu of Duanfen Town together with its neighbouring Datong Shi, which combined to form a twin-market (Figures 6 to 14). Its process of market-form developments is discussed to illustrate how a new mode of modernized marketing system was introduced to a region of traditionally clanship-dominated economy.

---

5 Image produced from software “Google Earth.”
The major founder of Tingjiang Xu, the Mei clan, has been the most prominent clan in Duanfen since the fourteenth century (Ming Dynasty). As a result, most of the villages and markets in this town, such as Qionglin Li, Shandi Xu, and Haikou Bu, were solely established by them. Another clan in Duanfen, the Yuans, had their original base at nearby Tangtou Shi. They also expanded their power and cooperated with the Mei and other local clans to found Datong Shi in October 1922 (DFZZ, 2009: 374; Mei Weiqiang, 2002: 42). Other than the proximity to the Yuan clan’s villages, the reason for the site of Datong Shi was probably its strategic location at an intersection point of the Datong River and a highway. The Datong Bridge for vehicular traffic across the river near the west side of market was also built by the Yuans in 1930 (DFZZ, 2009: 5). The market is generally in an orthogonal form. The colonnade streets form the pattern of two main streets in northwest-southeast direction and four narrow cross streets in-between.

Figure 7. Morphology of Datong Shi and site and the later Tingjiang Xu during the 1920s

Although Datong Shi was formed by inter-clan cooperation, it was dominated by the Yuan clan instead of the most prominent clan of the region, the Meis (Mei Weiqiang, 2002: 42). This might be the reason for the later instability and disputes between the
clans in the market. From the *Tingjiang Xu Shareholding Booklet* written by the Mei and other clans, the “Yuans-dominated” Datong Shi was accused of having an outdated layout, insufficient facilities, and its administrative organization being dominated by a single clan under a patriarchal style and a lack of freedom for other clans (Tingjiang Xu, 1933: 17). Combining these three aspects together with the existing market form, it is probable that the problems were related to the narrow streets without any central square for the free mobile commercial activities during the scheduled market days. The administration of mobile merchants was usually not clearly stipulated in the market regulations, but depended on the merchants’ social relationship with the administrators. This easily led to inter-clan conflicts in a multi-clan market like Datong Shi.

Regardless of whether such an accusation was fair, there was evidently a sense of discontent from the Meis and the other clans about the administration by the Yuans. Finally in 1932, the Meis led the other clans in withdrawing from Datong Shi. Eleven Meis, two Qius, together with one from the Wu, Cao, Liang, and Jiang clans respectively initiated to found a new market on the other side of a narrow stream right next to the southeast of Datong Shi. Their aims were set as “fund-raising from multi-clan, building of public market, improvement of municipal administration, and freedom of business.” The market site acquired was in total twenty-odd acres which housed sixty-five pieces of farmlands privately owned by the Meis. Despite no written limitation of clan, the domination of the Mei clan over the sixteen clans and some other unidentified organizations was reflected in the ratio of Initiators 發起人 (about 65%), Provisional Preparatory Administrators Elected 公推臨時籌辦員 (about 85%), Board of Directors 董事 (about 50%), and shareholders (about 50%) (Tingjiang Xu, 1933: 4-7, 10). Therefore despite the nominal multi-clan cooperation, the new market was in fact dominated by the Mei clan without any Yuan clansman’s participation.

Unlike the linear-street form of Datong Shi, the new Tingjiang Xu was planned in central-square form in a rigid rectangular shape with all colonnade shophouses facing internally. On the one hand, the square provided a spacious marketplace especially for itinerant merchants during the scheduled market days (Tingjiang Xu, 1933: 14), so as to resolve the problem of insufficient space along the narrow streets for mobile hawkers in Datong Shi. On the other hand, the square form helped to perform strict management. For instance, there was a regulation restricting the businesses of kerosene, lime, livestocks such as cattle, pigs, and sheep, etc. inside the market so as to avoid danger and hygiene problems (Tingjiang Xu, 1933: 14). Another regulation stipulated the employment of a team of guards in the watch tower for the security of the market (Tingjiang Xu, 1933: 16). It is possible that this internal square form also helped to impose a clear demarcation from the adjoining Datong Shi and even to easily restrict the Yuan merchants’ use of the new market.

As the Datong Bridge was built by the Yuans and was geographically separated by Datong Shi, it was probably inconvenient for the clans of Tingjiang Xu to cross Datong River via this bridge. Therefore, Mei Jiangxing, a Managing Director of Tingjiang Xu, promoted the fund-raising from the clansmen in the region and overseas for construction of the Tingjiang Bridge at the southeast corner of the new market (Mei Jianxing, 1981: 49-50). Finally, the new vehicular bridge was built in 1936 as an alternative river-crossing route.
Figure 8. Morphology of Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu during the 1930s
Figure 9. Scheduled market day activities in the eastern square of Tingjiang Xu during the 1940s (Republican period). *Top*, ground-floor plan; *bottom*, section.
There were post-Republican extensions (after 1949) at the fringe areas of the two markets. The highway on the northwest side of Datong Shi is a later extended area filled with post-Republican shophouses and domestic houses on both sides.\(^6\) The attraction of the new highway resulted in a shift of commercial activities to the northwest outside the original colonnade square and streets. With the highway acting as a primary transportation route, the commercial activities in the two old markets have gradually declined. Since the late 1990s, the shops and market have all moved out of Tingjiang Xu, and there are only a few shops still operating along the southern colonnade main street of Datong Shi.

Other than the economic and urban changes, the social structure in the two markets has also been fundamentally altered. The clanship ideology had gradually been eliminated through the land-reform movement by the Government of the People’s Republic of China after 1949 (Feng, 2005: 316-318). Eventually, many residents from the original clans had moved out, and new residents from the other clans, including the originally hostile clans, were allocated with their new homes in the markets by the government. With the small stream between the two markets filled up, the original market boundary implying the territories of the two big clans also vanished. Finally, the inter-clan competition for urban modernization during the Republican era had lost its motivation.

---

\(^6\) The information of the later development of buildings was provided by 1948-born local resident, Yuan Tingshen, interviewed by the author on 30 August 2009.
Figure 11. Photos of Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu: Street and square

Figure 12. Photos of Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu: Bridge
Figure 13. Photos of Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu: Boundary

Figure 14. Morphology of Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu during the 2000s
Conclusion: Clanship and Townscape

The main aim of this research was to reveal the underestimated relationship between clanship and townscape in the rural part of Wuyi during the Republican era. It is found that despite much contribution from the government and the overseas Chinese, the strong clanship was a crucial factor for urban modernization in the lower-level towns and villages. In fact, many local squires were also overseas Chinese and even participated in some positions in the government. When these people initiated or supported the new public works, they could easily obtain the trust of the local villagers in their own clans. Moreover, compared with the city dwellers who usually posed their own private interests on top of the public ones, the rural dwellers were more willing to sacrifice for the general interests of the clans who benefited from the new public works.

Therefore, after the beneficial effect of change had been fully understood, the rural dwellers and clan organizations in Wuyi generally changed their attitude from resistance to cooperation in urban modernization in their hometowns. Later, they even actively participated in the new market, shophouse, and infrastructure constructions as the means of inter-clan competition. Finally, twin-markets like Datong Shi and Tingjiang Xu in Duanfen, the upper and lower ports of Chikan in Kaiping, etc., were formulated as artefacts of the keen inter-clan competition for urban modernization and capitalist marketing activities.

The change from Republican to Communist rule in Wuyi in 1949 marked the end of the region’s unique marketing activities, which merged traditional clanship and quasi-modern capitalism. Under the new government’s suppressions of clanship, market economy, and overseas connections, the townscape modernization of rural markets in Wuyi finally halted.

Another paradigm shift arrived after the economic reform in 1978. Since then, the market economy was restored, remittances from overseas returned, and clanships not suppressed anymore. Market activities had also revived. Nowadays in the rural part of Wuyi, market economy has been reconstructed, overseas remittances have increased, and urban development has been prosperous. However, the crushed clan-based social communities once bearing the responsibility of local urban development before 1949 are gone forever.
Glossary of Places, People, and Clans in Chinese

Bajia Cun 八家村
Cao 曹
Chen 陈
Chikan 赤磡
Chin Gee Hee 陈宜禧
Daijiang 大江
Datong Shi 大同市
Doushan 斗山
Duanfen 端芬
Enping 恩平
Gongyi Bu 公益埠
Haikou Bu 海口埠
Heshan 鹤山
Jangshan Xu 象山墟
Jiang 江
Kaiping 開平
Kuang 鄺
Li 李
Liang 梁
Liu Zaifu 劉載甫
Liucun 六村
Mei Chengji 梅成基
Mei Jianxing 梅健行
Mei Weiqiang 梅偉強
Mei 梅
Qionglin Li 瓊林里
Qiu 丘
Shachong Cun 沙涌村
Shagang Cun 沙崗村
Shandi Xu 山底墟
Shangze Xu 上澤墟
Sun Yat-Sen 孫中山
Taicheng 台城
Taishan 台山
Tangtou Shi 塘頭市
Tingjiang Xu 汀江墟
Wu Bingwang 伍炳旺
Wu Yuzheng 伍于政
Wu 伍
Wuyi 五邑
Xinchang 新昌
Xinhui 新會
Yi 乙
Yuan Tingshen 阮庭深
Yuan 阮
Zengkun Cun 繒困村
Zhen 甄
References


DFZZ (Taishan Shi Duanfen Zhen zhi bian zuan wei yuan hui) 台山市端芬鎮志編纂委員會 [Editorial Board of the Gazetteer of Duanfen Town, Taishan City], ed. 2009. Duanfen Zhen zhi 端芬鎮志 [Duanfen Town gazetteer]. Taishan: privately printed.

Feng Erkang 冯尔康. 2005. 18 shi ji yi lai Zhongguo jia zu de xian dai zhuan xiang 18 世纪以来中国家族的现代转向 [The modern shift of Chinese kinship since the eighteenth century]. Shanghai: Shanghai ren min chu ban she.


Qionglin Li 瓊林里. 1908. Chang jian Qionglin Li gu feng jiang qing bu 創建瓊林里 股份章程簿 [Booklet of shareholding charter for establishment of Qionglin Li]. Booklet (photocopy). Provided by Associate Professor Mei Weiqiang 梅偉強, Wuyi University on 15 August 2008.

Tan Tiejian 譚鐵肩. 1929. Tai shan wu zhi jian she ji hua shu 台山物質建設計劃書 [The proposal for material constructions of Taishan]. Taishan: Public Works
Bureau, Taishan County.


TSXGWJ (Taishan Xian gong wu ju) 台山縣公務局 [Public Works Bureau of Taishan County]. 1929. *Taishan Xian jian she tu ying* 台山縣建設圖影 [The Photo album of the construction works of Taishan County]. Taishan: Public Works Bureau of Taishan County.


Jerusalem as a Uniting Factor for Muslims and Christians: 
Historical and Scriptural Grounds

Kamal-deen Olawale Sulaiman
drsulaimank@yahoo.com

Abstract
Jerusalem is perhaps the only city in the world that is considered historically and spiritually significant to Jewish, Christian, and Muslim people alike. This paper therefore seeks to examine the reasons why Jerusalem should serve as a unifying factor for Muslims and Christians. For this purpose, it traces the historical and spiritual connections of Muslims and Christians to Jerusalem. Furthermore, scriptural teachings on Love, Unity and Tolerance among Religious Faiths were examined. This research work is purely from written sources, which comprise of books, journals, and websites, as well as the Glorious Qur’an and the Holy Bible. The paper reveals that both Muslims and Christians have solid historical and spiritual connections to Jerusalem. It was evident that both the Qur’an and the Bible preach Love, Unity and Tolerance among Religious Faiths, which is applicable to the people of Jerusalem. The paper recommends that, if both Muslims and Christians, as a matter of fact, adhere strictly to the scriptural teaching on Love, Unity and Tolerance among Religious Faiths there will be peace in the region. It also concludes that Jerusalem embraces the holiest places in Islam and Christianity and is a symbol of brotherhood, solidarity and national unity between Muslims and Christians.
Introduction

Muslims and Christians in Jerusalem belong to one nation. Christians and Muslims in Jerusalem have always formed one body and one family whose sole aim is to defend Jerusalem, its sanctities, Islamic and Christian heritage and civilizations.

The first Islamic-Christian encounter in Jerusalem was in the seventh century when the Patriarch of Jerusalem and the Arab Damascus Sofronious met with the Caliph of the Muslims Umar bn Al Khattab, who opened Jerusalem. Patriarch Sofronious welcomed Umar, as did the masses of Christian Jerusalemites. They both entered the Church of the Resurrection and expressed the strong solidarity that unites Muslims and Christians within one nation. The legacy of Umar is not merely a historical document, but a reassertion of the relationship between Muslims and Christians. It is a testimony to the importance of the Arab Christian presence in Jerusalem, which dates back to before Islam and will continue to exist.

There is no doubt that there are profound and fundamental differences in faith between Islam and Christianity. However, in spite of the differences, both believe in one God, the Creator of the Universe, and that He is the real God whom they all worship. Muslims and Christians worship one God, despite differing practices and interpretations of how to worship Him. Muslims and Christians cooperate and unite in their stand to defend Jerusalem. Jerusalem embraces the holiest places in Islam and Christianity and is a symbol of brotherhood, solidarity and national unity for Muslims and Christians. Jerusalem’s message is peace, brotherhood and solidarity. Therefore, those who talk about conflicts, civilizations and religions admire Jerusalem and see how civilizations, cultures and religions can cooperate and not clash or necessarily be the cause of conflicts.

Jerusalem has never witnessed any form of sectarianism in spite of many attempts by the occupation to plant the seeds of sectarianism. The Islamic-Christian alliance has even been strengthened by the fall of Jerusalem into the hands of Zionists, the enemies of humanity and spiritual values. The Zionists have failed to change the demography of Jerusalem and its Arab character. They do not want cooperation between Muslims and Christians and they oppose unity. However, their attempts to divide and conquer have failed: Mosques and Churches are in harmony, and the Crucifix and the Crescent embrace each other.

When the blessed Aqsa Mosque caught fire and the martyrs were falling to their deaths, Muslims and Christians were in the field together. When the Church of the Resurrection was being attacked, everyone was fighting side by side against aggression. Jerusalem is a symbol of national unity. Jerusalem’s message to the Arab nation from the Atlantic Ocean to the Gulf is to unite in order to be strong, to save Jerusalem from the jaws of occupation.

Jerusalem

The Temple Mount also known as Mount Moriah and by Muslims as the Noble Sanctuary al-haram al-qudsī ash-sharīf, is a religious site in the Old City of Jerusalem. Due to its importance for both Judaism and Islam, it is one of the most contested religious sites in the world. The Al-Aqsa Mosque Masjid Al-Aqsa, "farthest
mosque", is part of a complex of religious buildings in Jerusalem known as either the Majed Mount or Al-Haram ash-Sharif (the Noble Sanctuary) by Muslims, and as the Temple Mount by Jewish people.

The Temple Mount is the holiest site in Judaism. Jewish Midrash holds that it was from there that the world expanded into its present form, and that this was where God gathered the dust he used to create the first man, Adam. The Bible records that it was there that God choose to rest his Divine Presence, and consequently two Jewish Temples were built at the site. According to Jewish tradition, the Third Temple will also be located here, and will be the final one. In recent times, due to difficulties in ascertaining the precise location of the Mount's holiest spot, many Jews will not set foot on the Mount itself.

In Islam, the site is revered as the destination of Islamic prophet Muhammad's journey to Jerusalem, and the location of his ascent to heaven, and is also associated with other local Muslim figures of antiquity. The site is the location of the al-Aqsa Mosque and the Dome of the Rock, the oldest extant Islamic structure in the world.

The Al-Aqsa Mosque is the largest mosque in Jerusalem. About 5,000 people can worship in and around the mosque. It showcases a mixture of styles including Crusader work from when the Crusaders held Jerusalem, during which the mosque was used as a palace and called the Temple of Solomon, in the belief that the mosque was built on the site of the original temple. Al-Aqsa has been at times the target of attacks by Jewish extremists, but most attempts were averted by Israel's security services. Both Israel and the Palestinian Authority claim sovereignty over the site, which remains a key issue in the Arab-Israeli conflict.

Jewish-Christian Spiritual Connection to Jerusalem

To understand the Jewish-Christian connection to Jerusalem one must begin with the Bible. From a Jewish-Christian perspective, the area of special holiness is Mount Moriah, today known as the Temple Mount. This area is located beneath the platform on which the Muslim Shrine, the Dome of the Rock, now stands. In the Jewish Bible, Jerusalem has many names: Salem (Shalem), Moriah, Jebuse (Yevuse), Jerusalem (Yerushalayim), and Zion (Tziyon). The most common term for the city, Yerushalayim, is mentioned 349 times in the Bible, while Tziyon is mentioned an additional 108 times.

The earliest mention of the site is Genesis 4:18, when Abraham interacts with Malchizedek, King of Shalem. According to Jewish tradition the story of the Binding of Isaac (Genesis 22:1-19) also takes place in the "land of Moriah" on the site of the present-day Temple Mount. Abraham chooses the site specifically because he sensed how God's presence is strongly connected to this site. In the Kabbalah, the Jewish metaphysical tradition, the rock of Mount Moriah is known as the "Even Shetiyah" the foundation Stone. This is the metaphysical center of the universe, the place from which spirituality radiates out to the rest of the world.
Later patriarchal stories in Genesis are also connected with the site:

1. When Isaac goes out into the fields to pray prior to meeting Rebecca for the first time (Genesis 24:63-67), he is standing on Mount Moriah.
2. Jacob's dream of the ladder to heaven with the angels ascending and descending (Genesis 28:10-22) takes place on this site.

We see from here that for thousands of years, the Jewish people have always associated Mount Moriah as the place where God's presence can be felt more intensely than any other place on earth. That is why, for the Jewish people, the Temple Mount is the single holiest place. This connection is still very much alive and well in contemporary Jewish practice:

- When the Jewish people pray three times a day, they always turn toward Jerusalem. (Someone praying in Jerusalem faces the direction of the Temple Mount.)
- Jerusalem is mentioned numerous times in Jewish daily prayers and in the "Grace after Meals."
- The Passover Seder is closed with the words "Next Year in Jerusalem." These same words are invoked to conclude the holiest day of the Jewish year, Yom Kippur.
- The Jewish national day of mourning, Tisha B'Av, commemorates the destruction of the First and Second Temples.
- During a Jewish wedding ceremony, the groom breaks a glass as a sign of mourning to commemorate the destruction of the two Temples that stood on Mount Moriah. The breaking of the glass is accompanied by the recitation of part of Psalm 137: "If I forget thee, O Jerusalem, let my right hand forget her cunning. If I do not remember thee, let my tongue cleave to the roof of my mouth; if I do not set Jerusalem above my highest Joy."
- Religious Jewish people often keep a small section of one wall in their house unplastered and unpainted, as a sign of mourning for the destruction of the Temple.
- It is strongly associated with the Biblical prophets David, Solomon, Elijah and Jesus.

Also, Jerusalem has always been significant to Christians because of the places there where Jesus ministered and, most importantly, where he died and rose again. This is the obvious and simple significance of Jerusalem to the Christian world. This is why Helen, mother of Constantine, built churches there in the 4th century that commemorated these events in the life of Jesus and is why Christians from every denomination on earth visit Jerusalem and these very churches and sites.

**Jewish-Christian Historical Connection to Jerusalem**

The early history of Jerusalem is also rooted in the Bible. In addition to the events already mentioned, the Book of Joshua (Chapter. 10) describes how Adoni-Tzedek, the Canaanite king of Jerusalem, wages war against the Jews.

During the approximately 400-year period from the entrance of the Jewish people into the land, through the period of the Judges, Jerusalem remained a non-Jewish city. It
was not until the reign of King David (ca. 1,000 BCE) that Jerusalem was captured from the Canaanites (2-Samuel 5) and converted into the political/spiritual capital of the Jewish people. (Archaeologists agree that the original Canaanite city and the City of David was located in what is now the Arab village of Silwan, a few meters south of the "modern" walls of the Old City.) 19

King David purchased the peak of Mount Moriah (2-Samuel 24:18-25) as the site for the future Temple and gathered the necessary building supplies. The Book of 1-Kings (ch. 6-8) describes in great detail how David's son, King Solomon, built and dedicated the Temple: "And it came to pass after the 408th year after the Children of Israel left Egypt, in the fourth year of Solomon's reign over Israel... that he began to build the house of the Lord" (1-Kings 6:1).

Solomon's Temple is also known as the first Beit HaMikdash (the First Temple). While all archaeologists agree that it stood on Mount Moriah, probably on the site of the present Gold Dome of the Rock, its exact location is unknown 20.

Four hundred and ten years after its completion, the Temple was utterly destroyed by the Babylonians when they besieged Jerusalem and no trace of it remains.

Fifty years later, after Babylon was captured by Persia, the Jewish people was allowed to return to Jerusalem. Under the leadership of Zerubavel and Nechemiah, they rebuilt both the Temple and walls around the city (Nechemia 4-6).

During both the First and Second Temple periods, the Temple was the central focus of the Jewish world both in Israel and the diaspora. The worldwide Jewish population paid for its upkeep. The Kohanim (priests) and Levites served in the Temple, and three times a year during the holidays of Passover, Sukkot and Shavuot all Jews were commanded to come to Jerusalem and visit the Temple21.

This rebuilt temple is known as the Second Temple (Bayit Sheni). It stood for 420 years on the same site as the First Temple, on Mount Moriah. The Second Temple was remodeled several times, but reached its most magnificent form during the reign of King Herod the Great (37-4 BCE)22. The great Jewish historian, Josephus, who lived during the end of the Second Temple period, gives detailed descriptions of both Herod's construction and the layout of the Temple compound23 (see "Antiquities" ch. 15 and "Jewish Wars" ch. 5).

The Second Temple period ended with the Roman destruction of Jerusalem in 70 CE. It is possible that people tried to rebuild the Temple at later periods, but they were never successful, and for over 600 years the site of the Temple Mount lay in ruins. The only remains are the massive retaining walls that encompass Mount Moriah, built by Herod to support the platform on which the Temple stood24.
Muslim Spiritual Connection to Jerusalem

Indeed, Jerusalem's multifaceted meaning is the reason behind the interest of Jerusalem to Muslims all over the world, as well as in the land of Palestine as a whole. The city has strong evocative and emotional associations and has its own place in the hearts of Muslims. It is considered the third-holiest city in Islam after Mecca and Medina in Saudi Arabia. It derives its religious prominence from being the first Qibla, the initial direction towards which the Prophet Muhammad and the early Muslim community turned their faces in prayer. The direction was changed a year and a half later to Mecca by "divine command." Jerusalem also derives its significance Islamically from its association with Prophet Muhammad's miraculous nocturnal journey to the city and then his ascension to Heaven. This event is mentioned in the Qur'an chapter, 17 verse 1,

"Glory be to Him, who carried His servant by night from the Holy Mosque to the Further Mosque (al-Masjid al-Aqsa), the precincts of which We have blessed, that we might show him some of our signs." 26

It is then specified in the Hadith, the sayings of the Prophet Mohammad, that the Al Aqsa Mosque is indeed located in Jerusalem:

Narrated Jabir bin 'Abdullah: That he heard Allah's Apostle saying, "When the people of Quraish did not believe me (i.e. the story of my Night Journey), I stood up in Al-Hijr and Allah displayed Jerusalem in front of me, and I began describing it to them while I was looking at it." 27 Sahih Bukhari: Volume 5, Book 58, Number 226.

In another Hadith he says

"No journey should be undertaken to visit any mosque but three: this mosque of mine, al-Masjid al-Haraam and Masjid al-Aqsa." Narrated from Abu Hurayrah 28

It was confirmed that,

"The most holy spot [al-quds] on earth is Syria; the most holy spot in Syria is Palestine; the most holy spot in Palestine is Jerusalem [Bayt al-maqdis]; the most holy spot in Jerusalem is the Mountain; the most holy spot in Jerusalem is the place of worship [al-masjid], and the most holy spot in the place of worship is the Dome" 29

In the nocturnal journey (al-lsra' wal Mi'raj), according to Muslim tradition, Muhammad was transported one night on a winged horse space (Al-Buraq) from Mecca to Jerusalem where he led Abraham, Moses, and Jesus in a prayer. Afterwards, Muhammad ascended to the heaven accompanied by the archangel Gabriel. In this journey of ascension, Muhammad passed through the seven heavens where he encountered earlier Prophets. The Dome of the Rock is the site from which
Muhammad ascended. Although some critics argue that Muhammad's journey was spiritual and not physical, this journey has a three fold significance:

First, it linked the city of Jerusalem with Islam in its very early days, in addition to the Chapter that refers to Jerusalem as the first Qibla.

Second, it inspired the Muslims with a bulk of lore, so much so, that Muslims all over the world celebrate that occasion every year.

Third, it ushered in a new era in the life of the city because, from then on, the Muslims considered it their holy duty to protect it from the encroachment of the Byzantines and the Persians who were non-Semitic people²⁰.

In addition, it is believed that Qur'an chapter 43 verse 44 was revealed in Jerusalem: 
"Ask those of our messengers We sent before thee Have We appointed apart from the All-Merciful, gods to be served?"³¹

Omar Ibn al-Khattab, the second Muslim caliph, accepted in person the capitulation of Jerusalem which was under Byzantine rule. Omar had also located the Rock, the place hallowed by the Prophet's nocturnal journey, and before leaving Jerusalem, he built a Mosque close to the Rock. Furthermore, a number of the Prophet's companions visited the city and at least one of them resided and died there. From this humble beginning to the rise, some fifty years later, of great monuments of Muslim architecture, Jerusalem's place as the third holy city in Islam was finally established. Its Roman name was dropped and it became al Bait al-Muqaddas (the Holy House), in apposition to al¬-Bait al-Haram (the Sacred House), the appellation of Mecca. A variant of the name was Bait al-Maqdis or simply al-Quds (the Holy City). Later it became al-Quds ash-Sharif (the Holy and Noble City).³²

The religious significance of Jerusalem and its function as a source of religious legitimacy were also highlighted during both the Umayyad and Abbasid rules. Mu'awiyah, the first Umayyad caliph, for example, proclaimed himself caliph in Jerusalem, rather than in Damascus, his capital.

Under Mu'awiyah's successor, Jerusalem became virtually the religious capital, since Mecca and Medina were in the hands of his rivals. Even when Mecca and Medina came under their control, the Umayyad caliphs’ continued to pay equal respect to Jerusalem. The Abbasid caliphs paid Jerusalem a similar regard, and the city remained equally significant to successive Muslim rulers, up to the Mamelukes and the Ottomans who also accorded the city religious status equal to that of Mecca and Medina. But despite its religious significance, Jerusalem was never the capital of Islam. The selection of the seat of the Islamic Caliphate was a matter of strategy; otherwise Mecca should have been the choice³³.

**Muslims Historical Connection to Jerusalem**

Historically speaking, Jerusalem has generally been a site for Muslim pilgrimage, prayer, study or residence. Al-Aqsa Mosque was a particular seat of learning. Muslim scholars came to Jerusalem from distant lands. "Just as it is true to say that the first
textbook in Islam was the Qur'an, so it is true to say that the first school was the mosque.\textsuperscript{34}

Muslims believe in all the Jewish and Christian prophets and Holy Scriptures. The Jewish and Christian legacies are an integral part of the Muslim legacy. Synagogues and churches are God's shrines and their adherents are the people of the book, not heathens or unbelievers. But Muslims, on the other hand, believe that Islam, more than Judaism or Christianity, afforded the city the most tolerant period because of Islam's nature being the religion of all prophets, from Abraham to Muhammad.\textsuperscript{35}

The Muslims ruled Jerusalem for thirteen centuries from the middle of the seventh century (638 A.D.) to the beginning of the twentieth century (1917) with the exception of about 103 years of Crusader domination. The passage of time, and certain events, served to enhance Jerusalem's position in Islamic tradition and history. One such event is the fall of Jerusalem to the Crusaders in 1099 which interrupted the Muslim rule of the city. Palestinian and Arab Muslims dwell a great deal on this holy war waged by the Crusaders against non-Christians, Muslims and Jews. This war – in which all non-Christian inhabitants of Jerusalem were wiped out, their property looted, and their houses occupied – is considered one of the most significant events to have shaped the Muslim outlook towards the Christian-Western world as a whole. It has yet to be ascertained if any roots of the current wave of Islamic fundamentalism actually lie in the Crusaders' war which marked open hostility between the Muslim and Christian/Western worlds.

In 1187 Saladdin, a Muslim leader, reconquered and recovered Jerusalem. This recovery of Jerusalem "figures larger in Islamic history than its first acquisition by 'Umar five and a half centuries before."\textsuperscript{36} The coincidence of Saladdin's entry into the city with the anniversary of the Prophet's nocturnal journey was regarded by Muslims as providential. The current Israeli occupation of Jerusalem (since 1967) is viewed by Palestinians and Muslims alike in magnitude to the Crusades: "By occupying Palestine, the modern Crusaders have earned the enmity of all Arabs; by seizing Jerusalem, that of all Muslims. Are the modern Crusaders bent on forcing history to repeat itself?"\textsuperscript{37}

**Scriptural Teachings on Love, Unity and Tolerance among Religious Faiths**

1 Love, Unity and Tolerance Themes from the Qur'an and Hadith:

Instructing the Muslims to treat their Christian neighbours with kindness, the Qur'an says:

> Those who believe (in the Qur'an), those who follow the Jewish (scriptures), the Christians and the Sabians, anyone who believes in Allah and the Last Day, and work righteousness, shall have their reward with their Lord. For them shall be no fear nor shall they grieve (Qur'an 2:62).
Reminding Muslims that they should not take extreme positions over their differences with others, Allah says: “If your Lord had so wished, He could have made mankind one people” (Qur'an 11:118; see also Qur'an 5:51)

The Glorious Qur'an urges admonition, not intimidation and affirms that Muslims should leave those who reject the message. They should not attempt to punish them but instead they should leave them for Allah to punish:

Give admonition, for thou art one to admonish. Thou art not one to manage men's affairs. As for those who reject your admonition, (leave them alone) Allah will punish them severely (not you) (Qur'an 88:21-24).

Again the Qur'an attests categorically that Muslims should not compel anybody to embrace Islam: Let there be no compulsion in religion. Truth stands out clear from error (Qur'an 2:256).

According to the Qur'an, a Muslim should not be the first to attack others. He must not be an aggressor; neither must he continue the fight after the aggressor has stopped the attack:

Fight in the cause of Allah those who fight you, but do not transgress limits, for Allah does not love transgressors...... But if they stop, (then you too must stop) Allah is Most Forgiving, Most Merciful (Qur'an 2:190-192)

Religious tolerance is advocated either when non-Muslims attempt to draw Muslims to their religion or when Muslims face people of other religions in dialogue:

Say Oh you unbelievers, I will not worship what you worship. You also will not worship what I worship. Neither will I worship what you worship. For you be your religion and for me mine (Qur'an 109:1-5)

The Qur'an teaches forgiveness: (Allah forgives and loves) those who avoid great crimes and shameful deeds, and forgive even when they are angry (Qur'an 42:37)

It places huge reward on forgiveness and reconciliation:

...But if a person forgives and makes reconciliation, his reward is due from Allah; for Allah loves not those who do wrong (by seeking vengeance at all cost Qur'an 42:30).

Aware that Muslims would be tempted to be hostile towards those who do not share their faith, Allah instructed Prophet Muhammad to tell the Muslims to forgive such unbelievers and not to attempt to fight them over what they believe in but rather to leave them to Him for necessary action:
Tell those who believe (O Muhammad) to forgive those who do not look forward to the Days of Allah. It is for Him (Allah) to recompense (for good or ill) each people according to what they have earned. (Qur'an 45: 14).

The Qur'an asks Muslims to forgive Christians "and overlook" their trespasses (Qur'an 2: 109). It also urges them to forgive and ignore those who reject their calls:

If you call them to guidance, they hear not. You will see them looking at you, but they we not. Forgive them and enjoin what is right. But ignore the ignorant. (Qur'an 7: 198-199)

To encourage the spirit of forgiveness in Muslims, Allah says He forgives all sins:

Say: O my Servants who have transgressed against their own souls, despair not of the mercy of Allah: for Allah forgives all sins. He is Oft-forgiving, Most Merciful. (Qur'an 39: 53)

Islam is so forgiveness-compliant that the Qur'an affirms that even the angels in heaven pray that Allah should forgive home sapiens … (Qur'an 42: 5). Allah also warns Muslims not to justify themselves as saints who are above sin: Justify not yourselves, He (Allah) knows best who it is that guards against evil (Qur'an 53: 32)

Allah also enjoins Muslims to repay evil with goodness:

Goodness and evil can never be equal. Therefore repel evil with what is better (which is goodness). Then will he between whom and thee there is hatred become as he is thy intimate friend. (Qur'an 41: 34)

The Qur'an affirms that Allah loves those who control their anger and those who forgive people and ranks them alongside those who spend in the way of Allah:

As for those who spend in the way of Allah whether in prosperity or in adversity, and those who restrain their anger and pardon men, Allah loves those who do good. (Qur'an 3: 134)

In the hadith (sayings of Prophet Muhammad), a man came to the Prophet saying, "Advise me". The prophet replied, "Never be angry". He repeated again, "Advise me" and the prophet repeated his admonition, "Never be angry". On another occasion the Prophet also warned that anger often leads to regret"(Bukhari). The beginning of anger manifests like madness but it ends in regret" (Bukhari).

Advocating peaceful co-existence while at the same time condemning violent propensities, the prophet said, "Be peaceful, and beware of violence". He also cursed extremists: "The curse of Allah is on extremists, i.e. those who are hardliners in matters of religion".
Pursuing moderation as the ideal ideology in Islam, he said, "We are a moderate people" (See Qur'an 2: 143). Muhammad preached kindness to all men on earth, not to Muslims alone: "Be kind to those on earth, and those in heaven will be kind to you" (Bukhari).

He also added: “Allah will not show mercy to those who fail to show mercy to People” (Bukhari). He preached piety and forgiveness: “Fear Allah wherever you may be. Treat people well and repay evil with goodness” (Bukhari). Anas bin Malik reported a Hadith in which the Prophet advocated love: “None of you is a believer until he wishes for his brother what he wishes for himself” (Muslim).

He also encouraged good-neighbourliness: “Whoever fills his stomach but ignores his hungry neighbour is not a good Muslim” 42. He laid emphasis on the unity of mankind regardless of race, colour, religion or social background: "You are all from Adam and Adam was made of dust”43.

We may now take a quick look at such teachings from the Bible, the Christian Religious Book.

2 Love, Unity and Tolerance Themes from the Bible:

Jesus taught his followers patient perseverance even in the face of persecution: Blessed are the persecuted for righteousness. Blessed are you when men insult you on my account (Mathew 5: 10-11).

He also forbade anger, "Every man who is angry with his brother shall be judged." (Mathew 5: 22).

In his letter to the Ephesians, Apostle Paul recognized the fact that man can be provoked and that it is natural to be angry. But he warned:

Be angry but do not sin, do not let the sun go down on your anger, and give no opportunity to the devil (Ephesians 4: 26-27)

Jesus himself taught his followers to love their enemies, saying:

Love your enemies, pray for those who persecute you, so that you can be sons of my Father who is in heaven; for He makes His sun rise on the evil and on the good; and sends doom rain on the just and the unjust (Mathew 5:43-45).

He also instructed them to love their neighbours:

You shall love the Lord your God with all your heart, and with all your soul, and with all your strength, and with all your mind; and your neighbour as yourself (Luke 10: 27)
The love theme is most predominant in biblical teachings. To demonstrate good-neighbourliness, Jesus gave the parable of the good Samaritan. A man was attacked by robbers on his way from Jerusalem to Jericho and lay critically ill. A priest who was passing by ignored him. So did a Levite. But a kind Samaritan who also passed by gave him first aid treatment and took him to a nearby inn where he spent money on him until he recuperated (Luke 10: 29-37). Jesus had earlier instructed thus, “...Whatever you wish that men would do to you do so to them...” (Mathew 7:12).

Apostle Paul posits:

If I speak in the tongues of men and of angels but have not love, I am a noisy gong or a clanging cymbal. And if I have prophetic powers and understand all mysteries and all knowledge and if I have all faith, so as to remove mountains, but have not love, I am nothing. If I give away all I have, and if I deliver my body to be buried, but have not love, I gain nothing. (1 Corinthians 13: 1-3).

Expatiating further on the qualities of love, Paul says:

Love is patient and kind; love is not jealous or boastful: it is not arrogant or nude. Love does not insist on its own way, it is not irritable or resentful; it does not rejoice at wrong, but rejoices in the right. Love bears all things, believes all things, hopes all things, endures all things (Corinthians 13:4-7).

Reminding mankind that love must be endless and that we must never be Hired of giving love, Paul adds.

Love never ends, as far prophesies, they will pass away: as for tongues, they will cease; as for knowledge, it will pass away ... so faith, hope, love abide, these three; but the greatest of these is love (1 Corinthians 13: 8-13)

Even at the pour of imminent death, Jesus still preached the gospel of peaceful coexistence. When he was surrounded by his captors, one of his admirers drew his sword and art off the right ear of the high priest's slave. Instead of applauding his bold action, Jesus reprimanded him, saying:

Put your sword back into its place, for all who take the sword will perish by the sword. Do you think I cannot appeal to any Father and He will at once send me more than twelve legions of angels? But how then should the scriptures be fulfilled, that it must be so? (Mathew 26: 51-54)

To inculcate the spirit of forgiveness, Jesus took the severed ear of his 'enemy' and miraculously put it back in its original place (Luke 22: 51)
Apostle Paul enjoined forgiveness of one another:
Put on then as God's chosen ones, holy and beloved, compassion, kindness, lowliness, meekness, and patience, forbearing one another and if one has a complaint against another, forgiving each other; as the Lord has forgiven you. so you also must forgive. And above all these put on love, which binds everything together in perfect harmony. (Colossians 3: 12-14)

Jesus had earlier given a condition for forgiveness thereby making it imperative:

For if you forgive men their trespasses, your heavenly Father also will forgive you; but if you do not forgive men their trespasses, neither will your Father forgive your trespasses (Mathew 6: 14-15).

In his letter to the Romans, Apostle Paul forbade vengeance:

Repay no man evil for evil, but take thought for what is noble in the sight of all. If possible, so far as it depends upon you. Live peaceably with all. Beloved, never avenge yourselves, leave it to the wrath of God; for it is written, "Vengeance is mine, I will repay. says the Lord. No, if your enemy is hungry, feed him; if he is thirsty, give him drink, for by so doing you will heap burning coals upon his head". Do not be overcome by evil, but overcome evil with good (Romans 13: 17-21).

Demonstrating great respect for the sanctity of human life, Jesus forbade the killing of a human being by another; “Do not kill, do not steal, do not bear false witness..." (Luke 18:20).

Above are idealistic principles of the two religions: Islam and Christianity: peace-loving, welfaristic, idealistic, democratic, liberalistic, human-friendly and progressive. How could Jerusalem Muslims and Christians have gone for so long in spite of the hating, killing, maiming and burning from their occupiers and oppressors?

Every available evidence points to the non-compliance of many of the adherents of the two religions to the teachings of their scriptures and their Prophets. For instance, the Prophet condemned violence and urged peaceful coexistence While Jesus called for love for one's neighbour, but do the people in Jerusalem embrace this?

Conclusion

In this paper, it was revealed that both Islam and Christianity have solid historical and spiritual connections to Jerusalem. It was also evidently clear that both the Qur’an and Bible preached Love, Unity and Tolerance among Religious Faiths, which is
applicable to the people of Jerusalem. No doubt that there are profound and
fundamental differences in faith between Islam and Christianity, but it is believed that
in spite of the differences, both believed in one God, the Creator of the Universe, and
that He is the real God whom they all worship. Muslims and Christians worship one
God, despite differing practices and interpretations of how to worship Him. The paper
recommended that, if both Muslims and Christian as a matter of fact, adhere strictly
to the scriptural teachings on Love, Unity and Tolerance among Religious Faithfuls
there would be peace in the region. The paper concluded that Jerusalem embraces
the holiest places in Islam and Christianity and is a symbol of brotherhood, solidarity
and national unity between Muslims and Christians. Therefore, those who attribute
conflicts and wars to clash of civilizations and religion should take a critical look at
Jerusalem City and relish how civilizations, cultures and religions can cooperate and
not clash, as the majority of people may think.
Notes and references


6. Ibid


12. Ibid

13. Ibid


17. Ibid


27. Sahih Bukhari: Volume 5, Book 58, Number 226.

28. Sahih Bukhari: 2.281

29. Sahih Bukhari: 2.468


37. Ibid

38. Imam Nawawi’s forty hadeeth – Yahya ibn Sharaf an-Nawawi, Hadeeth 1

39. Sahih Bukhari: 72.38


the iafor
journal of arts & humanities
ISSN: 2187-0616