The IAFOR Journal of Arts & Humanities

Volume 3 – Issue 1 – Autumn 2015

Edited by Thomas French
Table of Contents

Notes on Contributors 1

**Impact of Coal Mining on Environment:**
A Study of Raniganj and Jharia Coal Filed in India
Sribas Goswami

The Idea of the Nation-State as an Obstacle to the
Right to Global Development
Rajesh Sampeth

Analytical Survey on the Challenges of Teaching and
Learning the Arts in the 21st Century and the Way Out
Soyoye Akinyode Solomon

Arthur Miller’s *Death of a Salesman*: A Re-evaluation
Gunasekaran Narayanan
Notes on Contributors

**Dr. Sribas Goswami** (Assistant Professor Serampore College), specialises in research in environmental Sociology and the Sociology of Development. Dr. Goswami's numerous publications include articles in the *Global Journal of Human Social Science* and the *European Journal of Social and Human Science*.

**Raj Sampath** is currently Assistant Professor of the Philosophy of Justice, Rights and Social Change at the Heller School for Social Policy and Management at Brandeis University. His teaching and research interests are in applied moral and political philosophy, comparative religions, theories of justice, development ethics, and theories of democracy. Raj completed his Ph.D. at the University of California, Irvine, where he studied under the founder of deconstruction, Jacques Derrida. Subsequently he did a postdoctoral fellowship at the University of California, Berkeley and D.A.A.D in Germany. Prior to his appointment at Brandeis, he was an adjunct lecturer in the social sciences and humanities at the University of California, Santa Cruz. He has published several articles in peer-reviewed journals.

**Mr. Soyoye Akinyode Solomon** is currently a postgraduate student in the Department of History at the prestigious Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile Ife, Osun State, Nigeria. His area of specialisation is Diplomatic History and he is currently researching on China-Africa relation since 1960. He has published articles in several journals at local and international level with the major aim of adding value to the existing body of knowledge in several spheres. Mr Soyoye is an independent researcher and the director of merit-Plus Educational Consultancy, Nigeria.

**Narayanan Gunasekaran** is currently an Associate Professor of English at Government Arts College, Nandanam, Chennai, India and previously worked as a Professor of English in Zawia and Misrata Universities, Libya. Dr. Gunasekaran's research interest include critical theory, drama, film studies and naturopathy.
Impact of Coal Mining on Environment:
A Study of Raniganj and Jharia Coal Field in India
Sribas Goswami

Abstract

Coal mining adversely affects the eco-system as a whole. On the unstable earth; the unresting mankind constantly uses a variety of resources for their daily lives. Coal is recognized to have been the main source of energy in India for many decades and contributes to nearly 27% of the world’s commercial energy requirement. Coal is mainly mined using two methods – surface or ‘open-cast’ and underground mining. The geological condition determines the method of mining. Coal mining is usually associated with the degradation of natural resources and the destruction of habitat. This causes invasive species to occupy the area, thus posing a threat to biodiversity. Huge quantities of waste material are produced by several mining activities in the coal mining region. If proper care is not taken for waste disposal, mining will degrade the surrounding environment. The method of waste disposal affects land, water and air and in turns the quality of life of the people in the adjacent areas. This paper throws light on the burning issues of coal mines and its impact on the environment.

Keywords: coal mining, development, displacement, explosive, pollution
Introduction:

Mining activity puts tremendous pressure on local flora and fauna, particularly where division of forest land for mining takes place. The effect of mining on ground water level, silting of surrounding water bodies and land are also of great concern. Coal mining contributes greatly towards the economic development of the nation, although it also has a great impact upon human health. It also has an impact on the socio-cultural aspect of the workers and people residing in and around the coal mining areas. Thus, a holistic approach to mining activities, keeping in mind the concerns regarding the local habitats and ecosystem, is necessary. This requires identification of various sites where minerals exist as well as various other factors ranging from an appropriate angle of slope of the overburden dumps, safe disposal drains, and safe techniques for various silt control structures etc. In India, coal companies are now working towards “clean coal” strategies, which aim to reduce the environmental impact. The reduced ash contents of the washed coal increases the thermal efficiency of combustion. This has a direct impact on reducing emission of pollutants. The coal washing process requires extra water, but it can help us progress towards a pollution free society.

The burning of coal releases harmful substances such as sulphur dioxide, nitrogen oxide, carbon dioxide, as well as particulates of dust and ash. Dangerous levels of air and water pollution have been recorded in coal burning areas. It is globally accepted that coal mining adversely affects the local and global environment. Mining adversely affects the local environment in that it destroys vegetation, causes extensive soil erosion and alters microbial communities. Coal mining also affects the global environment through the release of coal bed methane, which is about 30 times as powerful as a greenhouse gas such as carbon dioxide. Coal mining thus adversely impacts air quality standards (Agarwal, 1991). Underground mining causes a depletion of groundwater in many places, as well as subsidence etc. resulting in degradation of soil and land.

Subsidence of the soil beyond permissible limits requires the filling of the subsidence area. The displacement and resettlement of affected people including a change in the culture, heritage and related features, as well as a rise in criminal and other illicit activities on account of sudden economic development of the area can be said to be the adverse social and cultural impacts.

Some of the beneficial impacts of mining projects include changes in employment patterns and income opportunities, infrastructural changes and community development. Development in communication, transport, the educational system, commerce, recreation and medical facilities etc. are some of the positive impacts. It is thus clear that coal mining leads to environmental damage, but there are also positives regarding economic development as well as greater self-reliance through increased mining of the available mineral resources. Though there is no alternative site for the mining operations, options as to the location and technology of processing can really minimize the damage to the environment.

In this way, coal mining has multi-dimensional impacts on the environment both directly or indirectly. The present work is an attempt to bring into focus the impact of coal mining on the environment in the Raniganj coalfield region which is the command area of Eastern Coalfields Limited (ECL) and in the Jharia field region, which is the command area of Bharat Coking Coal Limited (BCCL). Both are subsidiaries of Coal India Limited.
Sources of data & methodology:

The present study is an empirical research conducted in two major coalfields namely Raniganj Coalfields and Jharia Coalfields in India. The methodology of this study includes the collection of research materials through field study and observational methods. The present study is based on both primary and secondary data.

Study area:

One of the most important coalfields in India as well as in West Bengal, namely Raniganj coalfield, has been selected for this research. The Raniganj coalfield, bounded by latitudes 23°35″N to 23° 55″N and longitudes 86° 45″E to 87° 20″E, is the most important coalfield in West Bengal (Burdwan District), and lies in the Damodar valley region surrounded by the Durgapur-Asansol Industrial belt. For empirical study, another study area in Jharkhand, namely Jharia coalfield, has been selected for this research. The Jharia coalfield is located in Dhanbad district of Jharkhand state at a distance of 260 km from Kolkata towards Delhi. It is bounded by latitudes 23°38″ N to 23° 52″ N and longitudes 86°08″E to 86°29″E.

Results and discussions:

1. Site development and land use plan in the coal mining area:
A site development and land use plan should be prepared to encompass the pre-operational, operational and post-operational phases of a mine. It should clearly indicate the planned post-operational land use of the area, with details of the measures required to achieve the intended purpose. The general survey for this purpose must take into account not only the broad features of the actual or proposed mining operations, but also the surrounding terrain conditions. The important components of this survey include:
   (i) Present land usage pattern of the area;
   (ii) Main features of the human settlements in the area;
   (iii) Characteristics of the local eco-system;
   (iv) Climate of the area;
   (v) Relevant terrain information that will help in waste dumping, tailings disposal, etc., with the least effects on the local land-water system, including:
      (a) Geo-morphological analysis (topography and drainage pattern),
      (b) Geological analysis (structural features-faults, joints, fractures, etc.),
      (c) Hydro-geological analysis (disposition of permeable formations, surface-ground water links, hydraulic parameters, etc.),
      (d) Analysis of the natural soil and water to assess pollutant absorption capacity, and
      (e) Availability and distribution of top-soil;
   (vi) Communication and transport facilities;
   (vii) Details concerning the mining plans-
      (a) Minerals to be worked,
      (b) Method of working,
      (c) Details of fixed plants,
      (d) Nature and quantity of wastes and disposal facilities required for them,
      (e) Possibilities of subsidence and landslides,
(f) Transport facilities needed, and
(g) Services to be installed.

An action plan for minimizing the adverse environmental impact from the proposed mining activity should be prepared. This shall also include the rehabilitation of the mining area. These important aspects to be considered are:

1. **a Pre-operational phase:**
   (i) Vegetation barriers should be raised along the contours in the hilly areas to prevent soil erosion and for arresting the mine wash.
   (ii) Steps should be taken to construct check dams, either of rubble or brush wood, across small gullies and streams on the ore body to contain the soil wash. The check dams shall be stabilized by vegetation.
   (iii) The banks of streams in the mining areas should be intensively vegetated to prevent the discharge of sediment into the streams.

1. **b Operational phase:**
   (i) For opencast mines, screens or banks of soil and overburden shall be constructed in the peripheral area.
   (ii) Vegetation barriers shall also be constructed along the periphery of a mining area on either side of the mine/service roads and between other locations. The advantages include top-soil preservation, the lessening of adverse visual impacts, noise-baffling, dust suppression, etc.
   (i) Clearance of vegetation should be restricted to the minimum necessary for mining operations, and planned in advance.

1. **c Post-operational phase:**
   Once the mining operations are finished, the land should be rehabilitated for productive uses such as agriculture, forestry, pasturage, pisciculture, recreation, wild life habitats and sanctuaries.

2. **Drilling and blasting (noise pollution):**

2. a **Noise pollution in the Raniganj and Jharia coal mines:**
   Noise pollution is now being recognized as a major health hazard as well as being an annoyance. Effects include partial hearing loss and even permanent damage to the inner ear after prolonged exposure. The problem with underground mining is of particular concern because of the acoustics within the confined space. The ambient noise level of the underground mining area is affected by the operation of the cutting machines, tub/conveyor movement and blasting of the coal. The movement of coaling machines and the transport unit-conveyor, tubs and transfer points causes audible noise which becomes all the more troublesome underground because of the poor absorption of the walls.

2.b **Noise pollution due to mining activities:**
The most noise-generating equipment underground are the haulage, ventilators-main, auxiliary and forcing fans, conveyor transfer points, cutting and drilling machines (Rao, 1971). The ambient noise levels due to different operations in underground mines vary between 80-1040 dB (A). In a mine in Raniganj and Jharia, the noise level near the fan house, conveyor system shearer and road headers is reported to be within 92-93 dB (A). The value increases in many mines because of poor maintenance of the machines and exceeds the permissible limit of 90 dB (A) for 8 hours per day of
exposure. The result of a noise survey for one of the coal mines conducted by DGMS (Director General of Mine Safety) is summarized in the following table which indicates noise over 90 dB by the drills, breaking and crushing units and transport system underground.

**Table 1: Noise level in underground coal mines**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location of survey</th>
<th>Average Noise level (dB)¹</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Near shearer</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer point</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tail end belt conveyor</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power pack pump</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Coal Mining Planning and Design Institute, Survey Report, 2012

The mechanized mines produce lower noise pollution compared with the old conventional mines, mines operating with haulage and coal cutting machines. The results (Table 2) covering wholly manual, partly mechanized with coal cutting machines and partly mechanized with SDL loading shows reduction in the underground noise.

**Table 2: noise survey in selected coalmines**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of mine</th>
<th>Machine points</th>
<th>Noise Level</th>
<th>Duration of Operation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wholly manual Mechanized</td>
<td>Drill</td>
<td>87 dB (A)</td>
<td>1-2 hrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tagger haulage</td>
<td>105 dB (A)</td>
<td>4 hrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With CCM cutting</td>
<td>CCM²</td>
<td>94 dB (A)</td>
<td>1 hr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Drill</td>
<td>94 dB (A)</td>
<td>1-2 hrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Auxiliary fan</td>
<td>93 dB (A)</td>
<td>8hrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanized loading</td>
<td>Drill</td>
<td>88 dB (A)</td>
<td>2 hrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LHD³</td>
<td>98 dB (A)</td>
<td>4-5 hrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chain conveyor</td>
<td>84Db(A)</td>
<td>4-5hrs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Coal Mining Planning and Design Institute, Survey Report, 2012

**2.c Noise pollution due to blasting:**

Underground blasting causes high frequency sub-audible noise measured in terms of air over pressure. The magnitude of air pressure is found to be 164 dB (l) at a 30m distance reduced to 144 dB (l) at a distance of 70m. The test results of some of the sites are summarized in the following table.

1Db- The decibel
2 CCM- Carousel Cutting Machine
3 LHD- Large Height Deviation
The total noise pollution due to underground blasting is the result of the audible and sub-audible noise. The sub-audible noise is responsible for vibrations in the surface features and cases of thin overburden cracks in surface structures can be observed. The societal reaction of Jharia Town Development Forum over blasting forced pick mining in some of the situations. The impacts of the blasting are as follows.

- Damage to old structures due to vibrations.
- Public nuisance vis-à-vis disturbance of sleep.
- Disturbance of sewerage and water supply line.

The amplitude of vibrations due to the blast waves is observed to decrease with an increase in the height of the building, and hence a drop in the level of nuisance in the upper floors. An investigation of some mines reveals that in cases where machines cut the blasting in the lower section in underground, it generates more vibration than that of the upper section. A restriction of total charge is essential to minimize the vibration caused by underground blasting. P5 explosives generate lower vibrations compared with the P3 grade of explosives (Downing, 2002).

The noise control measures in general are categorized into three groups: personal protective measures, engineering control measures and administrative measures. The engineering control measures are the most effective as they are based on sophisticated techniques such as a Retrofit approach i.e. the installation of noise control treatment on mining equipment. Designing inherently quiet mining equipment is also included in this technique, which aims to control and reduce noise emission. The preferred cost-effective system for the underground mining has been the personal protective system – earmuffs for the operator of the noise producing units (Walsh, 1991).

3. Toxic waste treatment for water in mining areas:
Research reveals that nearly 25-35% of rain water is drained back to ocean through rivers and streams; which are major sources of portable water for population (Bagchi, 1990). With the exception of particle impurities (coal dust/soil/clay) and bacteriological or biological impurities; the river water is generally fit for consumption. Normal filtering and disinfectant makes the water acceptable and has been used both in coal mining regions and elsewhere. On the other hand, the ground water is not fit for consumption unless treated for hardness. The quality of mine water in the Jharia and Raniganj coalfields obtained from the underground mines are summarized in the following table.

### Table 3: Air pressure due to blasting in underground

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mine name</th>
<th>Explosive Type</th>
<th>Max, charge/delay Total charge Max, (kg)</th>
<th>Air over pressure at Distance-m Value &amp; Db(l)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ray Bachra</td>
<td>P1</td>
<td>kg</td>
<td>10.6 kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P5</td>
<td>6.2 kg</td>
<td>2.4 kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P3</td>
<td>12.5 kg</td>
<td>12.5 kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girmint</td>
<td>P5</td>
<td>6.4 kg</td>
<td>2.5 kg</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Coal Mining Planning and Design Institute, Survey Report, 2012
Table 4: Mine water quality in Raniganj coalfields

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Kunustoria</th>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Effluent water (MOEF schedule-vi standard)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qtrending</td>
<td>Parasea UGP</td>
<td>June 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sampling station</td>
<td>W1</td>
<td>Mine discharge from pit no. 2</td>
<td>Eutrophication and Deoxygenating due toth of algae because of sulphur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of sample</td>
<td></td>
<td>9th May 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colour</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unobjectionable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orour</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unobjectionable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSS</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unobjectionable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PH</td>
<td>44.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temperature °c</td>
<td>8.40</td>
<td>5.50-9.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oil &amp; grease</td>
<td>Normal</td>
<td>Shall not exceed 5°c</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total residual chlorine</td>
<td>&lt;1.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ammonical Nitrogen</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total kjeldahi nitrogen</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>50.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free ammonia</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.O.D.</td>
<td>BDL</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.O.D.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>30.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arsenic</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>250.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H .Chromium</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Chromium</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copper</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zinc</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selenium</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nickel</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluoride</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissolved phosphate</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sulphide</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phenolics</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maganease</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iron</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nitrate nitrogen</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Coal Mining Planning and Design Institute, Survey Report, 2012

Note: All parameters are in mg/l unless specified otherwise
NA stands for not analyzed.

The water pollution problems in the mining areas are broadly classified into the following major factors depending upon the nature of coal and dump, effluents and rock formation:

- Acid mine drainage in case of high sulphur coal
- Eutrophication and Deoxygenating due toth of algae because of sulphur
• Heavy metal pollution

A high level of dissolved solids such as Bicarbonates, Chlorides and Sulphur of Sodium Calcium, Magnesium, Iron and Manganese are introduced into water while passing through aquifuge and aquiclude which are made permeable due to sagging and industrial usage without treatment (Watherm, 1988). This makes the water hard, unfit for drinking, as well as other impurities in a few selected mines of Jharia and Raniganj coalfields. Low level Nitrates and Phosphates serve as nutrients to algae; rapid growth of which causes deoxygenating of water and the lowering of dissolved oxygen. This is likely to occur when the underground water is accumulated in water pools. Use of such water for irrigation might improve production and crop yields.

3.a Acid mine drainage:
Breaking of coal and leaching pyrite of sulphur content from the coal and surrounding formation leads to Acid Mine Drainage (AMD); a problem known worldwide. Oozing out of yellow sludge, the smell of H₂S and an increase in the pH value are some of the physical symptoms of the AMD. The corrosion of the impeller of the pumps, pitting or hole development in the steel pipes and the loss of aquatic life are the other impacts of AMD. This problem is mainly in the North Eastern Coalfields of Assam, Arunachal Pradesh and Jammu & Kashmir and in the Raniganj and Jharia coalfields also (Biswas, 1992).

The average sulphur content of the coal in the Gondwana stage was below 1%, which has been increased to 8% in the Jharia Coalfield; the average being within 3.5%. The sulphur content of the semi-anthracite deposits of Raniganj is even higher, up to 9% (Ghose, 2004). The sulphur in the coal deposits of this region is organic as well as pyritic in nature. The organic sulphur is structurally bound in coal and is difficult to separate, wash or drain. On the other hand, pyritic sulphur is present as an intrusion in the coal seams and the immediate vicinity in the form of balls – circular or elliptical mass or fine, dispersed particles. These tiny particles are mainly responsible for the acid mine drainage. Crushed pillars, caved coal bands, intrusive rocks and leftover coal dust are subjected to leaching when the aquifer or aquiclude drains down due to the secondary permeability of the interbreds. Under the influence of seeping water, the pyrite (Fe, SO₂) is oxidized, forming sulphuric acid. As a result, the pH value of the water is increased, making it unfit for normal consumption and industrial use.

3.b Heavy metal pollution:
Traces of heavy metal such as Lead, Zinc, Arsenic and Cadmium are detected in the mine water, mainly because of leaching of aquifuge, aquiclude and igneous intrusions and effluent of oil and grease from the machines underground. The toxic substances are generally confined within the rock mass that are exposed to the dynamic setting of the soil water system and thus pollutes the mine water. The list of the toxic elements and their impact is summarized as follows:

Table 5: Toxic trace elements and their area wise impact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl.no</th>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Area 1</th>
<th>Area 2</th>
<th>Area 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Fe</td>
<td>5.67-13.33</td>
<td>4.38-14.29</td>
<td>5.12-14.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mn</td>
<td>0.128-.493</td>
<td>0.143-.682</td>
<td>0.148-.801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Pb</td>
<td>0.136-.581</td>
<td>0.148-.623</td>
<td>0.125-.712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cd</td>
<td>0.028-.067</td>
<td>0.018-.073</td>
<td>0.021-.061</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some of the above elements serve as nutrients to plant and aquatic life at a lower concentration. The concentration in the coalmine water is normally within permitted limit and required no special treatment. The high presence of Fe can be observed in the water and Cu is also found high in the water, which is .281 to .621 in all areas.

The survey result of two mines of Raniganj coalfield is summarized in the following table.

Table 6: Micro elements in Bonjemihary & Ghanshyaam mines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Micro elements</th>
<th>Coml. (P+) kg</th>
<th>Benjemihary*</th>
<th>Ghanshyaam*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cu</td>
<td>0.281-0.489</td>
<td>0.362-0.521</td>
<td>0.302-0.621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zn</td>
<td>1.32-1.52</td>
<td>0.920-1.203</td>
<td>0.822-1.008</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Coal Mining Planning and Design Institute, Survey Report, 2012

*Results in ppm.

The presence of a large number of trace elements in the coal is attributed to species of carbonaceous swamps or contemporaneous sedimentation with holmic acids soluble and binding these elements. Trace elements might have come through inflowing ground water during calcification. The magmatic and fluid might have resulted in epigenetic mineralization and enrichment of trace metals. Elements such as As, Cd, Hg, Pb and Zn are the inorganic fraction of coal while Cr, Cu and Sn are present in mineral and organic form.

The concentration of trace elements in Raniganj and Jharia coalfields are summarized below. In the process of mining, these elements are released or mixed to the inflowing water and ultimately to the water channel.
Table 7: Concentrations of trace elements in coal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Concentration (µg / g⁻¹) of trace elements in regions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kunustoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antimony</td>
<td>1.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arsenic</td>
<td>14.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cadmium</td>
<td>2.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chromium</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluorine</td>
<td>59.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead</td>
<td>39.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mercury</td>
<td>0.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barium</td>
<td>113.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nickel</td>
<td>22.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Coal Mining Planning and Design Institute, Survey Report, 2012

3.c Water regime disturbance in mining areas:
The disturbance of lithosphere, yield and movement of ground water, dewatering of the workings and the recharging of overburden formation are the interrelated operations of underground mining. Dewatering from underground, recharging from rainwater precipitation and an inflow of surface water are complimentary to each other. With the formation of depression fissures, even the aquifuge starts draining across and a cone-like depression extends far and wide out of the area of influence.

The implementation in the ground of water drainage induces additional cracks and fissures over the surface. As a result, the rate of precipitation increases when higher percentages of rain and surface water infiltrate downwards; raising the overall water table. Furthermore, in place of a few confined aquifers, extensive unconfined/leaky aquifers are formed with the ground movement (Singh, 2005).

Starting from precipitation, the water travels overland, adopts through flow, interflow and base flow leading to the basin channel flow and is partially retained in the aquifers. With the creation of underground voids; there is percolation through mine roofs and walls and it ultimately flows due to the failure of the confining beds. The water accumulated in the mine is pumped back to the surface. Mine water pumped from the working face contained 1500-1600 mg/l of suspended impurities, mainly coal dust, particles and Salts of Calcium, Magnesium and Iron. The concentration of suspended impurities drops slowly in slumps from underground. With the filling of cracks by silt or clay particles during the rainy season, the overburden character is restored with time when water pools form on the surface, and subsides through. As a result, flora and fauna congenial to climate and surroundings develops with better results. On the other hand, the undulation of the ground disturbs the channel of streams and rivers, bringing a larger area under the high flood level of the streams. Unless care is taken, the river water would flow down through fracture planes, flooding the workings. Depending upon thickness of the burden and the working seams, the fractures have become open channels or are sealed with silting. Loss of streams or the formation of water pools are the two extremes of the phenomena (Bose, 1989).
Quality of water, however, is the main issue, where the hardness of the water increases up to 700 mg/l inclusive of 300-500 mg/l permanent hardness which necessitates special treatment (Nish, 2012). The other impurities such as heavy metals and the oxygen balance of the underground water in most of the Indian coalfields are well within the accepted limit.

The ground movement impact on the hydrosphere is manifested in the form of increased storage and charging character, the lowering and disturbance of the water table, and the loss of streams or water pools. Some of them improve the water availability to the flora and fauna and biomass in general and improves the environment and ecology, while a few causes temporary damage to the environment and ecology with the development of the fracture planes and opening of cracks. However, the positive impact of the ground movement over the hydraulic regime is diluted due to repeated mining of the seams one after the other. With each seam working, the cycle of negative impact is repeated, the water table and the level of pollution increases time and time again. It takes time – a couple of years before the regime are restored to normalcy.

4. Illegal coal mining in Raniganj and Jharia coalfields:
Coal is often very close to the surface in many areas of the Raniganj and Jharia coalfields, particularly in the context of the stagnant agricultural sector, that to dig it out is very simple. Many tools can be used for this purpose, ranging in variety and complexity from the traditional to comparatively more efficient, modern equipment. A near vertical hole in the ground leads to a labyrinth of tunnels, which are sometimes only high enough for a person when crouched. These rat-holes often occur all over the region and have opened up new, albeit illegal, avenues of informal employment. Many abandoned uneconomic mines of ECL (Eastern Coalfields Ltd) and BCCL (Bharat Coking Coalfields Ltd), both underground and opencast, are thriving as illegal mining sites.

These mines have often been referred to as ‘state run private enterprises’ (Penz, 2011) as few adequate steps have been taken to curb the malpractice. These mines have become death traps where unplanned coal exploitation and subsequent roof collapses result in loss of lives in many illegal mines, most of which go unreported. Illegal mining is a common feature in most of the coal mining areas. The Raniganj and Jharia coalmine regions are not an exception. In these regions, young unemployed people often engage in illegal coal mining. Illegal mining can be defined as “unethical and illogical cutting of coal seams beneath the earth surface without the prior permission of the coal mining authority” (Saxena, 2000). In the coal bearing land, it is the easiest way to earn money quickly. In this process, many large holes are cut into the earth’s surface like a ‘rat-hole’ to catch the shallow coal seams (Madwbwe, 2011). Another process involves cutting the coal seams from abandoned mines, illegal miners simply dig out the coal seams and sell a huge amount of coal in the local market through the ‘Coal Mafia’ and earn a healthy profit. The author has visited many places in the Raniganj and Jharia coalmining belt to observe the illegal mining process. The local police authority is not effective in preventing the illegal mining.

4. a Some negative impacts of illegal coal mining on environment:
1. In this process of mining there are unscientific cuttings of shallow coal seams, which often cause problems on the surface of the mining region.
2. This type of mining results in huge removal of top soil and also causes soil erosion.
3. Where the mining activities are taking place, there is total destruction of vegetation cover in that region.
4. Due to the illegal mining, there is massive dust and noise pollution in the surrounding area.
5. Due to the unscientific cutting of the coal seam, there is a destruction of the coal reserves in coal mining belt.
6. Due to the illegal mining, there is always a chance of land subsidence.
7. Due to the mismanagement and natural heating, sometimes fires may occur in illegal mines, which results in huge emission of noxious gases and burning of Coal seams.
8. After the cutting of coal seams, illegal miners leave all the mines open to nature, so the whole region is converted into an abandoned field.

Many local people are also engaged in this illegal coal business. Often, they are supported by the local coal mafia and local police authority. Local people use their bicycle, bullock cart, rickshaw van etc. to transport the illegal coal to the local market. They earn a healthy profit from the illegal business this way. Many complaints are made to the local police station to stop the illegal coal mining by the local people, but the police ignore it.

4.b The region of illegal coal mining:
Jharia region- Mohuda, Bhatdih, Murlidih, Gobindpur, Tetulia, Katras, Kusunda, Kustaur, Lodhna, Mourigram, Sudamdih etc.
Raniganj region- Jamuria, Mejia, Satgram, Sripur, Sonepurbazari, Mahavir colliery, Kunustoria area etc.

4.c Laws to curb illegal mining:
In order to curb the illegal mining and rampant smuggling of major minerals, the State Government has formulated the Jharkhand Minerals Dealers’ Rules (JMDR-2007) to monitor the issue.

The state cabinet, while approving the Mineral Dealers’ Rules-2007, found that that there are a large number of dealers operating without any proper records or registration with the mines and minerals department. Hence, the government decided to make the registration of operating dealers mandatory with the department concerned. This will put a spanner in the works for the illegal marketing and smuggling of major minerals like iron ore, bauxite etc., according to the secretary. The state government has said it is unable to cross-check the minerals stocked or stored. Those dealing in minerals claim that they paid the royalty at the mining site and have stored the stock at some other place for transportation. The Government also recommended the cross-checking and verification of minerals, as there is no provision available under the Central Government Mines and Minerals Development Act (MMDR), 1957.

The Central Government has given ample scope to prepare the rule as per its requirement for checking and verification of account. With the new rule, JMDR-2007, to be brought into effect soon, the mines and minerals department will be able to verify the stock at any given point of time. Officials claim that once the registration of the dealers is completed, the department concerned will issue a license to the party. After this, the party will be able to purchase and stock the major minerals. The modus operandi also includes the dispatch receipt from the district mining officer (DMO) from the place of transportation of the minerals. According to the local authority, illegal mining in the state is widespread thereby causing huge losses running in several cores to the state exchequer (Mathur, 2008). The department is flooded with such complaints and the revenue collection targets of the department are
difficult to achieve. Hence, the legal wing of the department felt it necessary to formulate a rule to check on the smuggling of major minerals.

**Conclusion:**
Mining has a significant impact on the economic, social and environmental fabric of adjoining areas. Although mining activities bring about economic development in the area, it also causes land degradation that creates ecological and socio-economic problems. Mining adversely affects the eco-system as a whole. It is important to conduct suitable assessments to understand the potential adverse impact of mining on flora and fauna. The adverse impact should be identified at the planning stage itself so that corrective measures may be taken in advance (McDowell, 1996).

To overcome the problems, one should be aware of the various activities that are of concern regarding the environment. Every mine manager should keep a checklist giving information on environmental controls, as envisaged in the various mining lease conditions of the Government of India and Environment Management Plan. Frequent review of this information may enable identification of the site-specific environmental issues at the mine. Poor environmental performance may accelerate the demands for more stringent regulations. The adverse effects of subsidence fissures have made most of the subsided areas barren and unstable. The indirect effect of subsidence has contributed to the drying up of many tanks and dug wells in the vicinity. Much of this subsided land may however be put back to productive use with a joint effort from coal companies and local bodies, but no concerted and coherent effort has been taken in this direction. Not much study has been done towards the reclamation of subsided land in Indian coalfields. In a few areas of Raniganj coalfield including Ninga and Sripur, plantation on subsided land has been attempted. The scientists are of the opinion that before starting reclamation of subsided land, the purpose of reclamation in terms of “land use” should be decided in consultation with the local people. The most important thing is to plug the cracks and it may not be necessary to bring the subsided land to its original state even for use for agriculture, plantation and housing. Some researchers claim that improvements in water retaining capacity of the subsoil in the subsided land are required. There is no specific legislation in India concerning subsidence, but as per common law, the coal company is to acquire the surface right of the property in which subsidence may occur due to underground mining. In some countries, there is specific legislation guiding the coal industry in matters of subsidence and perhaps such enactment may be necessary in our country also.
References


Contact: +919434545330; sribasgoswami@gmail.com
The Idea of the Nation-State as an Obstacle to the Right to Global Development

Rajesh Sampath

A stark question remains with us today. Has the idea of the nation-state always sought to conceal an illusion? For over four hundred years, since Westphalia of 1648, thinkers have probed the mystery of the nature and existence of ‘sovereign, independent nation-states’ within an international system. Positivism is one epistemological framework underpinning international relations theory, which studies the relations of independent nation-states within the international system. Positivism attempts to adopt the mindset and methods of the natural sciences to study the balance of powers, structures, processes and interactions of nation-states, and the size and impact of militaries to wield and yield power within the international system. Post-positivism is another epistemological framework, which rejects the realism of the positivist world view and contends that the phenomenon of an ‘international system of nation-states’ cannot be represented in an objective, neutral and scientific way. This study will not explore the positivist and post-positivists world-views. Rather, I will submit the central issue of IR—namely the relations and interactions of nation-states within the international system—to a critique while assessing how certain theoretical assumptions in IR obstruct, hinder and ultimately stymie the realization of a right to global development/poverty alleviation. My central question is what if the nation-state is really an arbitrary, historically constructed culture or civilizational set of values based on the illusion of geographic boundaries, which masks itself as a sovereign entity that possesses an invisible existence within international law? How do we reflect on our own moral grounds and the reasons for justifying such a critique of the idea of the nation-state? The nation-state in that case is an illusion, and the illusion that persists is precisely what prevents the realization of a right to global development and poverty alleviation, which would free two thirds of the world’s population from unnecessary suffering and deprivation. This paper will use an analysis of Rawls’s *The Law of the Peoples* by the eminent moral philosopher Thomas Nagel as a point of departure of separate and independent reflections on how the idea of the nation state obstructs the possibility of a real right to development.

The nation-state is not an unconcealed secret but a secret that perpetuates an illusion. The illusion is the possibility to argue ontologically that a) the state exists as some ‘thing’ or entity; b) it exists for a reason, namely to protect and secure the interests and needs of what lies within it; c) it plays a role in an international system of relations that perpetuates peace and justice; d) the state exists to continuously solidify the notion that human beings can be categorized by citizenship and hence have a patriotic duty and obligation to a particular nation, its identity, and its interests given an a priori consensual commitment to a social contract of some kind. This is in contrast to the absence of a universal identity of the human species guaranteed and contained within a single world government grounded in a single world constitution; e) the nation-state exists to wage war in defense of its interests from attack by others (‘just war theory’); f) it exists to preserve an amorphous agenda with other states that have reason to agree on a certain norms that can justify proclamations, covenants and decrees on the interests, justice, equity, rights of the international order and what constitutes ‘fair trade’ between states for their individual economic interests. I will examine each of these concepts and how the nation-state justifies itself. In the process of its reasoning, ultimately the nation-states within the international balance of powers, end up foreclosing the possibility of a right to universal development. For such a right to be realized, the nation-state would have to reveal the illusion that it is.
In his article, “The Problem of Global Justice”, Thomas Nagel opens his text acknowledging the importance of Rawls’s *The Law of Peoples* for contemporary debates on global justice given the legacy of the Hobbesian tradition of the self-interest of nation-states. Given the various epistemological camps in contemporary IR, the question of how we even frame a theory of global justice becomes a befuddling and daunting task as Nagel asserts. What we might add to Nagel’s opening proviso is something broader in scope. How *can and should* the quest for global sustainable development be integrated in to the epistemological and philosophical debates surrounding the broader issues of a theory of global justice and world governance? Sustainable development would include, among others, the following: the eradication of ‘severe poverty’ as Thomas Pogge puts it, solutions to global institutional economic inequities say between Global North developed countries and Global South developing countries in terms of trade relations, re-shifting the uneven benefits of globalization and alleviating the burden of debt stemming from decades of development aid, and the realization of rights to economic well-being, health and water. By asking how it *can* be integrated, I refer to the conditions of possibility of how the right to development is linked with the theory of global justice. By asking how it *should* be integrated, I am admitting from the outset a self-reflexive consideration of our own moral grounds when we critique the idea of the nation-state within contemporary IR theories while trying to advance the argument for the right to global development. A clear-cut philosophy of history can arise from the moral arguments for the right to development, but this way a philosophy of history, which questions the history of philosophical defenses of the idea of the nation-state.

For Nagel, the nation-state is the steady, unswerving and self-certain ‘locus’ for domestic political theory to explore questions of justice. However, when we think of the global scale of justice, it is hard to imagine a ‘comparable’ entity to that of the nation-state that can perform a similar function. When it comes to the international order, questions of justice typically deal with the criminal conduct of certain states, say ethnic cleansing, questions of reparations and assistance in previous war-torn or civil-war countries, international rules for a global, capitalist market economy and trade, assistances for humanitarian relief in the wake of natural disasters, and responses to violations of individual human rights, particularly the first-class of rights involving political and civil liberties—based on positive and negative freedoms. Anything like the ‘right to development’ seems to be overshadowed by these other dominating concerns. The question is why and what role the ‘nation-state’ plays in the intentional *deferral* of the question of the theory of global justice that can support the universal right to global development. The nation-state creates a set of domestic, normative interests (well-being, security against internal and external threats, and economic growth of one’s own nation) in the name of protective sovereignty and liberty while engaging in moral responses to events and disasters within the international framework. In the process, nation-states occlude the reality of self-interested competition between themselves that would otherwise allow for the right to global development to emerge. Until we examine the grounds for a sovereign sense of global economic justice to materialize, idea of ‘sovereignty’

---

1. Thomas Nagel, “The Problem of Global Justice,” *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 33:2 (1995): 114. Hobbes and Machiavelli are considered the ‘founding fathers’ of the realist tradition in international relations, which espouses the view that nation-states are ‘self-interested’ entities who seek to compete with one another to increase their power and secure themselves from threats within an international system. As a result, Nagel readily admits at the outset that the contemporary landscape of theories of global justice is completely undeveloped: “concepts and theories of global justice are in the early stages of formation, and it is not clear what the main questions are, let alone the main possible answers. I believe that the need for a workable ideas about the global or international case presents political theory with its most important task…” p. 113.


3. For example the right not to be tortured or enslaved.
will continue to mean the freedom to rule oneself on one’s own terms without interference from some other (self).

Ruling oneself, one’s nation on one’s terms, regardless of whether anything similar to a ‘one’ exists, or one in relation to many, or one within the many, is not the issue. Rather, we must probe the conditions for the notion of sovereignty to arise; in which a theory of global justice becomes naturally aligned with a right to global development, so that the contours of an actual entity, say a ‘world government,’ can truly emerge in human history. Or if that is impossible, how do we outline the ontology and ethics of conceiving something other than the ‘nation-state’ within a semi-stable, international system of competition, security and self-interest? What is considered an ‘other’ to the nation-state is not just another entity that is geographically bounded in space-time, say a regional bloc like the European Union or a future ‘African Union.’ Rather, we have in mind the elemental forces that solidified the nation-state as something permanent and real, as a legal, military, economic, and political body, which itself is composed of elemental forces that perpetuate self-interest through national citizenship, duty and obligation. Yet it is this historical calcification that must give way to another set of elemental forces, which in turn emanate from another set of sources. What are these sources? Say the nation-state is the minimally sufficient notion to advance a minimal set of social-welfare obligations to the citizens that belong to an empirically bounded space-time entity and its cherished historical, political and cultural identity. Then the minimally sufficient notion for a set of obligations (to alleviate global poverty) to which a theory of global justice adheres must draw from reasons that are distinct from the nation-state. A quantum leap is necessary because expanding the idea of a nation-state (based on self-preservation, interest and security vis à vie other nation-states) to a single idea of an inter-national state would lead to a twofold contradiction. If an international state is grounded in a set of competing interests, self-preserving elements, and movements between security, self-defense and military assertion of power, then the state would implode. If the international state, which has sovereign rule over the entire human species, were to contrast itself with another species, say an imaginary alien species from another planet, then it could not anticipate the terms, reasons, and assumptions of how it would compare and contrast itself with that other (imaginary) species to assert its own interests and values. This is tantamount to trying to dialogue with someone that you cannot understand fundamentally because they speak a different language. In that scenario, the international state cannot establish its identity in a relation of negation with some other identity and runs the risk of relapsing in to the very same set of values of a nation-state extrapolated to a much larger system, i.e. self-interest, self-preservation and protections against threats.

This raises the very daunting philosophical task of the relation between two questions: a) what takes the place of the nation-state and the IR theories, which try to explain its existence within the international system, and b) what can possibly invent a set of assumptions, morals, values and norms other than self-interest, protection, security and competition in the absence of an imaginary identity (say an alien species) to which a universal human species identity can compare and contrast itself? An international state—that is not based on an ego that tries to preserve itself on the one hand or an ego that anguishes about its moral, ethical and perhaps legal obligations to stem the pain and suffering of other egos on the other—would require a conception other than the ego. Whether the ego has a history of unconscious repression (Freud) or arbitrarily fashioned instincts that conceal themselves as moral norms, which go unquestioned (Nietzsche), is not the issue. It might be more instructive to look at

---

4 This would require a separate mediation on Plato’s magisterial dialogue *The Parmenides* and other great sources in the history of philosophy- Leibniz, Spinoza and Hegel.
the relation between the would-be entity that takes the place of the nation-state and an ontological ground in which oppositions become meaningless, say an ego vis a vie other egos. The theory of global justice that is intrinsically linked to a right to global development carries the possibility of going against the grain of an interminable historical presupposition: that justice has to emanate from some people, group, or entity or between those things in order to be possible - but who says this is the case for all eternity? The real question is this: how long do we have to suspend the idea that the purely factual nature of our global existence—as one of catastrophic and disproportionate suffering, deprivation and inequality—cannot be recognized as a monstrous evil because collective humanity lacks the real agency to think beyond the confines of contemporary international law, the existent global economic institutions and the interrelations therein (the wealth of governments and dictators, INGOS, multinational corporations, bargaining entities, multilateral aid institutions, illegal black markets and murky foreign currency exchanges), and ineffectual covenants on social and economic rights? The foundation of nation-states (in competition with one another within the international system) to defer another World War by all means necessary while managing conflicts and starting circumscribed wars in certain regions such as Iraq and Afghanistan undergirds the aforementioned list. We must begin the project to think other than the bare—humanitarian—recognition of factually known, intolerable and unjustifiable human suffering on a global scale, and the infinite deferral of agency and responsibility on how we create institutions and live in a world other than the one we find ourselves in today. Such statement puts a stake in the ground for an ambitious new way of thinking.

Nagel again is helpful in setting the stage for discussing the heuristic value of Rawls’s *Law of Peoples*, even though Nagel will ultimately end up disagreeing with Rawls. In terms of what can be done in today’s world economy to minimize ‘extreme global poverty’ (early death caused by starvation, extreme malnutrition, inability to meet basic needs and combat preventable diseases), he sets up the following challenge:

These more basic duties of humanity also present serious problems of what we should do individually and collectively to fulfill them in the absence of global sovereignty, and in spite of the obstacles often presented by malfunctioning state sovereignty. But now I am posing a different question, one that is morally less urgent but philosophically harder. Justice as ordinarily understood requires more than mere humanitarian assistance to those in desperate need, and injustice can exist without anyone being on the verge of starvation.

Nagel creates a space between extremes, a curiously ambiguous space for creative reflection. First of all, we live in the ‘absence of global sovereignty.’ This can mean that we live in the absence of an actual physical institution called a world government that would trump any of

---

5 We feel justified in offering in a footnote a preliminary set of explicit statements about Nagel regarding his disagreement with Rawls, particularly on the original position in footnote 10 of Nagel’s article. Just as Rawls argued that utilitarianism does not take seriously the difference between individuals, Rawls’ original position, according to Nagel, does not do so either with regard to individuals operating under a ‘veil of uncertainty’ that serves to minimize bias in arriving at the universal principles of justice for a domestic society. Nagel, p. 125. Furthermore, Nagel states, “Even though I am skeptical about grounding it in a hypothetical contract of the type Rawls proposes, its debt to the social contract tradition will become obvious.” Ibid., p. 126. The purpose of this paper is not to assess the extent and validity of Nagel’s critique of Rawls or to compare and contrast their views on the possibility of the global justice. This is why offer this initial separation of Nagel’s perspective from that of Rawls before proceeding further with our analysis.

6 Nagel, p. 118.
the legal and military foundations of a nation-state to defend its own interest vis a vie other nation-states. Or it can mean we live in the absence of a conception of global sovereignty that would differ from either the absence of nation-states with their competing dimensions (self-interests, self-preservation, protective securities, economic gains, cultural values, cultural imperialisms) or the absence of the nation-state raised to a higher categorical order (international-state) or something other to the nation-state on the one hand and the elusive, mysterious ‘world government’ on the other. However, this absence is not purely meaningless. It connotes a very serious challenge of what the current system of nation-states is willing to tolerate regarding the possibility of sensing something totally different from what is conceivable today. Or it means refusing to acknowledge that possibility given some a priori sense of futility to maintain the moral exigency to think beyond everything that has been imagined in human history heretofore. The natural relapse is to begrudgingly acquiesce to an unjust world of poverty and inequalities while directing our attention to nation-states that fail to deliver on their obligations while competing in an uneven global economy: hence the idea of ‘malfuinctioning state sovereignty’ persists.7

The other schismatic structures Nagel introduces is quite interesting. He points to something ‘less morally urgent’ but ‘philosophically’ more difficult to understand. He sets the condition for justice to be in terms of something more that is required than mere humanitarian aid to those in abject need on the one hand and injustice not being reduced to starvation on the other. Certainly when it comes to articulating the philosophical foundations to support an effective theory of global justice, he is speaking of a very difficult task: whether that is to change the world system (of competing nation-states) in order to reduce or eliminate world poverty, or work within the current system for the eradication of the severest forms of human suffering (poverty-related deaths for mass sections of a whole world populations). However, one can ask whether philosophical complexity (and apparent insolubility) has an inverse relation to moral exigency—as if the simplest problems deserve the most immediate moral responses. Furthermore, establishing a requirement for justice being more than humanitarian aid on the one hand and injustice (as irreducible to brute starvation) on the other presupposes a space of reasoning that institutes a middle ground to avoid dogmatic extremes. Yet justice and injustice within domestic societies (say issues of racial, ethnic, gender or income inequality) or between nation-states (unfair trade relations or crushing burdens of debt from development aid) still emanate from the minimal constraints of what an individual ego is willing to feel as a moral obligation towards others’ suffering. In other words; to what extent are peoples within and between nation-states willing to deliberate democratically for an international legal demand to stop causing world poverty (negative duty from Pogge’s view) or the positive act of the world’s poor to draw upon the law to compensate—through criminal or civil means—for the continuous harm being caused to them? This is the overriding question.

Digging deeper in to the issues I can summarize thus far some of my main points in contrast to Nagel’s views: the persistence of the idea of the nation-state does not necessitate the absence of a notion of global sovereignty but defers it for reasons unknown. The moral urgency to solve a problem does not depend upon minimizing its complexity (say how an actual world government that trumps the international order of nation-states can come in to

---
7 I do not want to get in to the designation of ‘malfuinctioning’ or failed states—and whether they are to be blamed simply for their own condition (dictatorships, corruption, vice)—or whether the underlying global economic institutions in which all societies are subjected to (with or without their complicity) is responsible for the endless conflict-development traps and insurmountable debt crises that some poor countries face. The work of Thomas Pogge can be consulted for these issues. See Thomas Pogge, ed., Freedom from Poverty as a Human Right: Who owes what to the very poor (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).
being and the likelihood of that occurring). Justice requires categories beyond moral instincts of an ego to want to help others more or less based on some deep felt sense of obligation or shame/guilt. The causal link between severe deprivation (starvation, hunger and poverty-related deaths) and injustice is not dependent upon whether injustice exists when a threshold of human dignity and worth, i.e. a life that can tolerated, is crossed. Injustice is neither reducible nor irreducible to the thing it signals as the event in which justice is being violated, ignored or erased. Hence it is possible to say that injustice can still exist when there is no threshold to determine when a human life is not worth living, but that is irrelevant. The point is not to prove the existence of justice or injustice but to inquire in to why the existence of the nation-state and the non-existence of the right to development are occurring in the same epoch of human history, namely our historical present. The secondary question is the nature of the occurrence itself and whether it is wise to speak of the existence of one (self-interest of nation-states competing with one another) as the condition of the non-existence of the other (universal right to development) or vice-versa. I also want to avoid any essential determination as to why or how some nation-states accrue more power on the world-stage based on economic, political, geographic, natural resource dynamics. This again would make the moral question of the right to development dependent upon the agency and intentionality of nation-states or the lack thereof, i.e. lack of a real international will to coordinate the elimination of global poverty.  

Continuing with Nagel’s ambiguous space of conditions to conceive the idea of global justice avoiding extremes, we have more to consider before moving straight to Rawls and Beitz. Nagel compares “two principle conceptions”—namely “cosmopolitanism” and what he calls the “political conception” the latter of which is represented in two ways—that of Rawls and Dworkin. Yet prior to his critical analysis of these two conceptions he postulates certain refined conditions that will delimit his space of reflection:

Humanitarian duties hold in virtue of the absolute rather than the relative level of need of the people we are in a position to help. Justice, by contrast, is concerned with relations between the conditions of different classes of people, and the causes of inequality between them. My question is about how to respond to world inequality in general from the point of justice and injustice rather than humanity alone. The answer to that question will depend crucially on one’s moral conception of the relation between the value of justice and the existence of the institutions that sovereign authority makes possible.

I shall unpack this extremely vital passage within a larger set of critical reflections regarding the trade-off between the persistence of nation-states and the suspension of realizing and

---

8 This in fact would take us back to the realist epistemologies of international relations theory, which tries to understand why nation-states do what they do and measure their ability to act based on what they in fact do or own or can control. Having said that, I do not want to ignore the issue of whether moral concerns can be raised within the international order regardless of whether we can determine an essential nature of nation-states competing with each other based on self-interest, security and positions of power as moral or amoral. I will return to Charles Beitz’s all-important Political Theory and International Relations (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979) to take on these questions in future work. In fact, the Beitz-Rawls debate is central to the main section of Rawls’s The Law of Peoples when Rawls addresses the issue of economic aid to ‘decent but burdened’ societies. See John Rawls, The Law of Peoples (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), p. 105-120.

9 Nagel, p. 119.

10 Ibid.
enforcing a universal right to development. Perhaps the right to development is irreducible to Nagel’s view of humanitarian duty on the one hand and the link between world justice-inequality on the other. It seems apparent to Nagel that ‘humanitarian duties’ become obvious and defensible because quite naturally those in absolute need—measured by some sense of gross deprivation (genocide) or violation of bodily integrity (torture)—is where a universal moral sensibility finds itself most aghast. There is nothing relative in our visceral response to torture just as there is nothing relative in the degree of physical pain to which the tortured individual feels. Nation-states can still compete within the sphere of political, economic, cultural and religious influence within the international system, and with relative perspectives on the needs of individuals within all those social spheres. However, when it comes to ‘humanitarian’ duties—both the rights-holder and the duty-bearer—the absolute is the absolute relation between the binding nature of the obligation/duty, the non-quantitative need of a person who is suffering, and the indisputable affront to the moral sensibility, all of which are uncompromising. How did the moral and philosophical conditions form to preserve the unconditional and absolute nature of humanitarian duty as the uppermost obligation for people in a position to help those who have been most deprived of their human being? How is the severest deprivations understood based on the greatest violations that terrorize the moral sensibility, which in turn require agents with responsibility to intervene? How did these conditions coalesce with sovereign justifications that instituted the nation-states, which are self-serving and self-protective but also the ones most responsible for maintaining and executing the universal humanitarian duty as a primary virtue? Who or what first said that the nation-state has to protect anything?\(^\text{11}\) It appears that the nation-state as individualistic, self-serving and competitive within the international system justifies itself as the highest virtue under the law of independent sovereignty within an invisible world of great suffering and deprivation—whether these are due to natural disasters, corrupt political regimes, arbitrary abuses of power, pure evil for the sake of evil, human trafficking, or unfair arrangement of global economic institutions; and the absolute-relative distinction is used to separate the humanitarian duty off from any other moral obligation and make it absolute. Hence the nation-state is absolute too, but economic injustice and severe poverty still exist.

Nagel contrasts the humanitarian duty with justice. One must ask why he makes the distinction and how he defines the attributes of both with different terms. Humanitarian duty is absolute and unconditional and as such does not involve the ambiguity of determining the conditions of justice for example. Humanitarian duty is the virtue par excellence.\(^\text{12}\) Nagel’s next step is what really predetermines the entire essay to follow in which he compares and contrasts the cosmopolitan view with that of the Rawlsian “political conception.” One can say the cosmopolitan extends moral obligation to every citizen in the world in which every human being requires equal attention in terms of their well being and real (not promised) institutions to guarantee that the duty is upheld by those who can execute it. In contrast, the political conception is more limited in scope. However, it does try to erect a sense of justice and obligation of ‘decent and non-burdened’ (i.e. wealthy) nation-states to decent and burdened societies regardless of whether the latter takes liberal democratic forms or not. That is, those societies in need of investment to build up the necessary institutions that can cultivate the necessary ‘moral powers to create their own conception of the good and a sense of justice’ with stable political and civil institutions without conferring an endless amount of development aid to those societies or mandating that they reach a certain level of economic

\(^{11}\) I am not trying to simplify the matter and hide any allusions to Hobbes.

\(^{12}\) As we shall later see in the contrast, Rawls calls ‘justice the first virtue of social institutions as truth is to systems of thought.’ See John Rawls, A Theory of Justice (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1971), p. 3.
growth.¹³ Once those societies reach a point of development, which is not clearly specified, then they can be considered well-functioning members of the ‘Society of Peoples.’¹⁴ Yet we are not ready for these debates, let alone Nagel’s critical intervention in them, prior to the cosmopolitan or political conceptions is Nagel’s own tense space of deliberation.

Nagel’s definition of justice seems so simple on the surface. However, it is the presuppositions buried in the contrast with humanitarian duty that is critical: why both terms—humanitarian and justice—are set up differently with regard to what is absolute and what is relative when it comes to understanding someone’s need and the duty to those in need (by those who can help) is not so clear. Nagel says that justice is “concerned with the relations between conditions of different classes of people and causes of inequality between them.”¹⁵ Relations between conditions are difficult to assess, unlike relations between categories or principles. Class difference presupposes that you believe difference in income, assets and wealth (created or inherited) constitutes your class status or designation and that the difference is either justified (capitalism) or not (communism). The curious link here is between justice and inequality and somehow that has to do with the relations between the ‘conditions of different classes of people.’¹⁶ Humanitarian duty is absolute because those who can help those in need must help them and ‘need’ is assessed in absolute, not relative terms. Justice, however, is not stated in either relative or absolute terms and inequality presupposes class difference (in income). Therefore, nothing is said about the link between difference in income and differences in need and hence there is no discussion of an absolute obligation to address income difference. But this is where Nagel offers his dramatic insight to the matter: “My question is about how to respond to world inequality in general from the point of view of justice and injustice rather than humanity alone. The answer to that question will depend crucially on one’s moral conception of the relation between the value of justice and the existence of the institutions that make sovereignty possible.”¹⁷

Nagel does not address the issue of inequality within a single nation-state like the United States of America for example. Yet at this moment he introduces the question of ‘world inequality’, and somehow this has to do with the question of justice and not humanitarian duty. Justice deals with relations of difference between different classes of people and presumably within a single society or state. However, Nagel wants to think about ‘world inequality’ from this very standpoint. Nevertheless, at this juncture, he does not dive in to the issue of inequalities in a world of nation-states independent of the issue of inequality within a single nation-state, let alone the cause and effect relations (if they exist) between inter- and intra-nation-state combinations within the world economy. We must keep this in mind because the rest of Nagel’s article compares and contrasts the two dominant conceptions to handle the problem of global justice, namely cosmopolitanism and Rawlsian-influenced political conceptions.

¹⁴ This phrase- ‘society of peoples’ - is in reference to Rawls’ The Law of Peoples.
¹⁵ Nagel, p. 119.
¹⁶ Contrast this with Rawls’s difference principle in which income inequality is justified. See A Theory of Justice, p. 60.
¹⁷ Nagel, p. 119. The reference to sovereignty will recapitulate Nagel’s discussion on Hobbes.
Let us focus on arguably the most important statement in Nagel’s entire essay. Looking at the terms set forth by Nagel and breaking them in to their core analytic properties is no easy task. From there we can try to imagine relations between them to see whether an argument for or against global justice can arise in a world configuration that does not exist today—that is something other to the international system of independent, sovereign nation-states each maintaining their own autonomy and self-determination while resisting external pressures from foreign powers. The issue is not to return to a moment in history before the birth of the nation-state, say the feudal age of the West or the empires of antiquity as if they had a better chance for global justice than we moderns do. So what are the key terms in Nagel’s main proposition? They are ‘world inequality,’ ‘the view from justice and injustice’ (and not humanity), ‘moral conception,’ ‘relation between the value of justice and the existence of institutions,’ and finally ‘sovereignty.’ At this point, there are no phrases or terms such as international society, international state, international government, world society, world state or world government that are taking seriously by scholars or policy-makers. The outermost extremes, which are irrelevant from an ontological and epistemological purpose, are these basic facts of nature: we live on a planet in a solar system in a galaxy in the universe. We hardly have sovereignty over everything in our own world (say all the oceans) and therefore have no sovereignty over the solar system, let alone the galaxy or universe. Even the idea of ‘world’ is not clear, let alone trying to imagine a just world. It is a curious thing as to why Nagel does not apply his absolute standard for humanitarian duty to a cause that can address what he calls ‘world inequality.’ He would rather draw from a view of justice rather than the humanitarian cause. Outside of a Marxist revolutionary solution to income inequality within a single country like Cuba, it is hard to imagine what the concept of justice would look like to address domestic inequality if one was serious about its total eradication. Yet this is exactly what Nagel wants to tackle for something called world inequality, and he will set out to show why he is not exactly committed to either the cosmopolitan perspective on obligations to every human being on the planet or the Rawlsian project, which is more circumscribed: that is obligations of decent, well-developed nations to decent not so developed nations (regardless of whether they are democratic or not) to cultivate just institutions to guarantee basic liberties and equalities but not demand a priori a model for economic growth.

World inequality as the ‘relations between conditions of different classes of people and the causes of inequality’ would have to be extended to all peoples around the world and not just attributed to class stratification within a single nation like the United States. Typically, various traditions of Marxist thought (East and West), Latin American Dependency Theory, World Systems theory and recent Neo-Marxists and World Socialist movements would try to tackle the matter of world economic inequality. The entire global system would have to be changed or restructured from the bottom up because core capitalist nations are directly responsible for causing underdevelopment of the peripheral countries they exploit. The core does so by extracting the periphery’s resources, alienating their cheap labor, and setting up

---

18 Good example of this today is the Nigerian Senate passing a bill banning homosexuality and make it a punishable crime. Many African nations are standing up against the British Prime Minister David Cameron and his ultimatum of stemming development aid to African countries unless they guarantee constitutional rights for gay minorities. The response by some African nations is that this is just another form of cultural imperialism with the irony being that British colonial law actually outlawed homosexuality in the past, which in turn was preceded by African traditional views against homosexual practice as an anathema to natural reproduction, i.e. how animals reproduce in the nature. Some African nations are saying this is a matter for their own internal democratic deliberation and they will not be bullied in to changing their culture even if this means trading off critical development aid. See this article from CNN- http://www.economist.com/blogs/baobab/2011/12/gay-marriage-nigeria

19 And this has nothing to do with a welfare state that has to take care of things like unemployment insurance.
asymmetric trade relations where they can export goods to the periphery. However, the periphery is not allowed to consume its own products and forced to import at high prices commodities of which are then unevenly distributed. Nagel is not talking about these traditions as a viable solution, raising the huge issue of what exactly he means by world inequality.\(^\text{20}\) To answer that question, Nagel says that it would depend upon a ‘moral conception.’ The moral conception is not defined: it is not synonymous with a right (in relation to a law or civil or political liberty) nor is it simply the right thing to do (in contrast with something wrong). Nagel does not speak about something good versus bad, or holy versus evil. It is not the Kantian maxim either.\(^\text{21}\) The mystery of Kant’s profound philosophy would be to penetrate the actual structural depths—beyond any dogmatic content—of what exactly ‘good willing’ is, an action that has its ‘moral worth strictly from duty and not the purpose achieved in the action or the intended result,’ ‘the maxim which determines the moral worth of the action stemming from duty,’ and the ‘duty as a necessity to do an action out of the respect for the law’ and not stemming directly from the law’s intrinsic prohibition. This is what makes the individual truly free from any dogmatic metaphysical conception of an obligation, i.e. from religious law. Taken together all of these would have to form the moral conception by which we can view ‘world inequality’ from the standpoint of justice. The maxim—if we could discover it—would determine the moral worth, if you will, of the conception of justice. This in turn would enable us to tackle the injustice of world inequality (that is global economic inequality), but my task here is not Kantian.\(^\text{22}\)

For Nagel, the ‘moral conception’ is attached to an even more abstract relation: he speaks about the moral conception of the relation between the ‘value of justice’ and the existence of institutions that sovereign authority makes possible.’ The moral conception of the relation is where everything is at stake. The relation exists between the value of justice, or what the value of justice means, and the ‘sovereign authority’ that makes possible the existence of institutions. It is from here that we can view ‘world inequality’ from the standpoint of justice. What is the ‘sovereign authority?’ What kind of ‘institutions’ is he referring to? What is the content of the value of justice and can we measure it? Nagel will not go for the cosmopolitan moral conception or the Rawlsian attempt at a purely political conception not derived from a comprehensive moral, metaphysical or religious doctrine.\(^\text{23}\) This is why he says how we answer the question of viewing world inequality from the viewpoint of justice (and not humanitarian aid) depends upon the moral conception of the relation between the

---

\(^\text{20}\) He is not talking about the capabilities approach, which addresses severe deprivations and freedoms. These deprivations do not allow people to lead the lives they value regardless of whether they are meeting their basic needs or measure their well-being strictly in terms of income, resources, utilities, consumption choices and desire-fulfillment. See Amartya Sen, Development as Freedom (New York: Anchor Books, 1999). He is also not addressing Pogge’s ambitious proclamation: that all the global economic institutions in the world (and not just the multinational corporations) are set up to favor a few wealthy nations, which are the direct (“institutional and interactive”) cause for severe poverty (poverty or hunger that causes premature death). Furthermore, we have a negative duty to not continue to cause severe poverty, which is a universal human rights violation. See Thomas Pogge, ed., Freedom From Poverty as a Human Right.

\(^\text{21}\) Kant says: “The good will is not good because of what it effects or accomplishes or because of its competence to achieve some intended end; it is good only because of its willing (i.e. it is good in itself).” See Foundations of the Metaphysics of Morals, trans. Lewis White Beck (New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 1997), p. 10. And the three principles of morality are: “the first proposition of morality is that to have genuine moral worth, an action must be done from duty. The second proposition is: an action done from duty does not have its moral worth in the purpose which is to be achieved through it but in the maxim whereby it is determined...The third principle, as a consequence of the two preceding, I would express as follows: Duty is the necessity to do an action from respect for the law.” Ibid., p. 15-16.

\(^\text{22}\) This says nothing about the merit of those attempts by others, including Rawls, to find a maxim that would justify action to eradicate global poverty.

\(^\text{23}\) This is classic Rawlsian formulat from Political Liberalism (1993) and The Law of the Peoples (1999).
value of justice and the institutions (to guarantee it) that sovereign authority makes possible. The next question is whether such a moral conception is even possible and whether an idea of sovereignty can make certain institutions—to enforce global justice—a reality.

Let us look at this entire formulation from another angle. The real issue is how to understand anything like the moral conception, and how it informs the relation between the value of justice and the institutions that sovereignty makes possible. It is one thing to say that the moral conception resides within the relation itself, which means the holy grail is to identify the actual value of justice (why it may be necessary) and what type of sovereignty (assuming it does not exist in the world today) can make possible the institution that guarantees that particular value of justice. World inequality relates to the same issue with which justice is concerned, namely the relations between the conditions of different classes and the causes of inequality therein. At the level of the world, as opposed to the single-nation state, things change. One would have to consider the relations between the conditions of classes, groups, regions, sects, religions within and between societies in a complex and dynamically evolving global economic system. If the causal relations of inequality in their manifold, multidimensionality are linked to a definable injustice, then perhaps a clear view of the value of justice as the negation of that inequality can emerge. The moral conception would have to be worked out on the basis of a deeper understanding of the causes of world inequality to have a better sense of what world inequality actually entails. Sovereignty for its part makes possible the existence of the (new) institutions that would realize this new value of justice based on the new moral conception of the relation. However, this means another sense of sovereignty must be possible and a critical philosophical analysis of the conditions of possibility for institutions to arise. Right now the most basic idea of sovereignty is the ability to control’s one’s physical territory, i.e. the nation-state and its principle of non-interference. One can argue that the ontological grounds to understand the reality, essence, and being of the global economy supersedes a pure empirical understanding of the forces, agents, pressures, and institutions at work in global economic exchange. If it is hard to prove empirically what exactly the global economy ‘is,’ then it is even harder to show what exactly world inequality means. Thus the idea of sovereignty must change as would our understanding of the conditions of possibility as to how just institutions emerge.

So here we have set the stage for a philosophical departure from Nagel’s initial conditions as to why the theory of global justice is so hard to define. Unlike Nagel, I am not proposing a return to Hobbes, albeit in a complex argument that Nagel makes, which deftly maneuvers between cosmopolitanism and Rawls. Returning to the idea of the nation-state as the highest embodiment of virtue is not my goal, neither the idealist notion of creating a virtuous set of relations between the nation-states to transcend their traditional conceptions (of self-interest, self-empowerment, competition, just war defense and limitless economic expansion as the constitutional guarantees of what citizens demand) and truly realize a novel international cooperative process to eradicate severe global poverty once and for all. I am certainly not taking a pre-philosophical step by imagining covenants, treaties, proclamations by existing multilateral institutions and their stated goals.

My assumption is that a real philosophical understanding of history does not require us to focus on the past to understand how we arrived at our present; the focus is on how to think differently than what we are today and where we believe we came from to imagine an alternative future than the one we seem to be heading towards in a deterministic manner.

24 Nagel, p. 121 (which is the end section III) and p. 147 (which is the conclusion).
25 This is in reference to the UN’s Millennium Development Goals.
Where we seem to be heading involves increasing global inequalities and poverty and all associated problems with that, namely environmental damage, right abuses, new types of conflict and civilizational clashes (reference to Huntington’s model), diminishment of natural resources (Malthusian limits), maximum exploitation of fossil fuels for energy consumption (the will to anti-sustainability), deficits of water and eventually clean air, crushing debt burdens and a continued inability to replace our current monetary system with a new standard other than one nation’s single currency, let alone the previous standard of gold. Nagel opened his article with a profoundly simple statement: “We do not live in a just world.” Does this mean we have to head to an unjust future with no other option? Marx said the point is not to philosophize about the world but to change it. Today one can say the point is not to return to a Marxist concept of true economic justice but to change the conception: that is to devise a new theory unbeknownst to anything the nineteenth and twentieth centuries could imagine and thereby usher in the real historical change that those concerned with global justice seek to achieve.

I am under the impression that contemporary analytic philosophies of global economic distributive justice do not have a sufficiently complex philosophy of history to accompany their analyses and proposals for handling questions of global poverty eradication and global inequalities. New philosophies of history are not easy to come by—Vico, Rousseau, Kant, Hegel, and Marx are some of the giants of the past. We have nothing of that scale and ambition today in our hyper-specialized disciplines, but just because it is not present today does not mean it is impossible. This is a turn to a critical analysis of Beitz and Rawls while outlining the silhouette of a new philosophy of history, which is irreducible to both, can come into focus. In some senses the philosophy of history is the ontological ground by which any theory of global economic justice can become possible. The philosophy of history is not simply the theory of how epochal shifts take place, how historical causality actually works (the causes of events and trends that alter the direction of history), the hermeneutic nature of historical understanding, where man is both the subject and object of history, the one who makes and is made by history, the temporality of historical representations of how

26 A clear example of the last item is the current conundrum of the E.U to re-evaluate its entire fiscal and monetary foundations with the adoption of the single currency in light of its debt crisis.

27 Nagel, p. 113.

28 The scary prospect for the immediate future is telling. After the seeming defeat of communism in the 20th century and the end of the Cold War and the emergence of new state-economic configurations that appear communist by name but are really only centralized, one-party systems (China) who are happy to compete in a free-market capitalist world economy and accrue massive amounts of wealth, we still have no other major philosophical alternative to Marx. The eternal return and repetition of Marx may be fine for an intellectual exercise. But we are under the impression that something new, something other than Marx will be required for the task of constructing a full-fledged, historically novel theory of global justice. And this is something that Nagel said is still unclear and is perhaps political theory’s most urgent task. Nagel, p. 113.

29 This is not to say that if Marx were alive today, he would not try to do the same thing that this being called for in this paper. He too would wonder about the inequalities in the global economic system and the creation of severe poverty. Back in his day he was interested in the dialectical contradictory processes inherent in an emergent industrial capitalist system and its future as a new mode of production distinct from the feudal lord-serf and ancient master-slave modes of production and social relations of production; he pondered the ontological mysteries and epistemologies of a new theory of history based on historical and dialectical materialism in which the modes of production, man’s relation to man and man’s relation to resources (natural and otherwise) is a process of conflict between classes; the emergence of money as a new form of commodity and commodities as fetishistic illusions that obscure the surplus labor value that is extracted from workers for pure capitalist profit. Today he would continue to probe the technological evolution of modern globalization but his attention would certainly also be on how and why new forms of global poverty are emerging as most of the human population becomes increasingly concentrated in urban settings and not rural spaces. But Marx is not alive today and that is the point: to those who want to retrieve him for the purposes of understanding our 21st century landscape may continue to do so but for what purpose?
subjectivity of the present filters through the objectivity of past data, and finally the heuristic value of teasing out moral lessons from previous historical errors in human society. The philosophy of history is more than this; it is part of the Heraclitian dream that extended to Hegel to understand the mystery of motion while being in one’s time so that one transcends one time and all of the history before it into a higher, newer dimension—this is the ultimate act of philosophical creation, which even transcends the historical creativities and inventions proper to the domain of great individuals—i.e. inventors, scientists, artists, etc. The philosophy of history has to do with the fundamental problem of metaphysics itself—namely the entwinement of being, time and motion as a single problem.\textsuperscript{30} I see a correlation between what Nagel is terming the most difficult and urgent problem for contemporary political theory, namely a new concept of global justice, and the central problem of metaphysics, namely a new understanding of time, being and motion, and how they adhere in a novel philosophy of history.

\textsuperscript{30} Heraclitus, Parmenides, Plato, Aristotle, Descartes, Leibniz, Spinoza, Kant, Hegel, Nietzsche and Heidegger all left their mark on arguably the most difficult problem in the entire Western philosophical tradition as Heidegger once remarked in a lecture on motion in Aristotle’s metaphysics.
References


Introduction

The concept of “Arts” in the context of this study refers to the disciplines of Creative Arts and Humanities, which are generally what Art disciplines entail. Despite the prominent and indispensable role the Arts could play in the process of nation building in the 21st century, it is quite unfortunate that it seems governments, curriculum planners, and other stakeholders in the education sector all over the world, do not consider the prominent role that the Arts could play in raising awareness of the fundamental problems that militates against the development of a nation, the solution to these problems and preparing them on how to tackle future challenges that concerns their immediate community at large. This will encourage the process of building a nation.

Research findings have revealed that this rationale is responsible for many of the problems associated with the teaching and learning of the Arts. This situation has resulted in the Arts as subjects to be deemed as unimportant and unnecessary, especially in the secondary school curriculum.

Therefore, the problems facing the process of teaching and learning of the Arts in the 21st century are multi-dimensional, ranging from the non-professionalism of History teachers or facilitators, government policies, the lack of appropriate teaching aids to mention a few.

Nature of Art Disciplines

Though the Arts are uniquely different in appearance and method from each other, the disciplines employ similar cognitive processes, ultimately allowing language and thought to be expressed through a variety of representations. They are represented not in the ordinary sense of language as written on a page, but in either a visual, kinesthetic, aural or tactile form. Engaging students and pupils, arts can enable them to communicate in potentially profound ways (Eisner, 2002). As Russell-Bowie (2009) points out: Because the arts can embody and communicate emotions, ideas, beliefs and values, they can convey meaning through aesthetic forms and symbols and evoke emotive responses to life with or without words. There is also evidence to suggest that school arts programs can enhance students’ potential to engage with school and learning, as well as learning in a broader sense (Australian Council for Educational Research, 2004; Bamford 2006; Catterall, Chapleau & Iwanaga, 1999; Fiske, 1999). Unfortunately, there are gaps in our knowledge with regards to the cognitive process and social capabilities that can be effectively fostered through the Arts. Evidence of this is that studies into the academic impact of Arts education programs in schools conducted in the UK and US confirmed that attention has not been sufficiently paid to the Arts. Also, Gibson and Anderson (2008) argued that within the context of Australian schools there is an urgent need for a detailed study of the impact of Arts programs.

Internationally, there is a growing body of Creative Arts learning and engagement that has a range of positive outcomes in terms of the lives of young people both in and out of school settings (Bamford, 2006; Catterall, Chapleau & Iwanaga, 1999; Deasy, 2002; Fiske, 1999). Sadly, despite a renewed interest in the unique benefits of Creative Arts learning, it appears that the subject matter remains marginalized.
Challenges of Teaching and Learning the Arts in the 21st Century

Despite the prominent and indispensable role the Arts could play in the process of nation building in the 21st century, it is quite unfortunate that it seems government, curriculum planners, and other stakeholders in the educational sector all over the world, do not consider the prominent role the Arts could play in making the students aware of the fundamental problems that militates against the development of a nation, the solution to this problem and preparing them for tackling future challenges that concerns the community at large which will encourage the process of building a nation. However, research findings have revealed that the rationale for this is responsible for many of the problems associated with the teaching and learning of the Arts as a subject. These problems have made the Arts lose its value. The Arts as subjects or disciplines, as the case may be in secondary school curriculums around the globe, have become seen as irrelevant or unimportant, burdened with facts and incidents thus making the Arts uninteresting to students.

However, the problems facing the Arts in the 21st century as subjects or disciplines are multi-dimensional, ranging from the non-professionalism of Art teachers, the inclusion of lengthy notes and copious dates, government policies, lack of incentives for the available teachers of Art subjects, lack of appropriate teaching aids, and many others which include:

1. Unawareness of the relevance of the Arts to society and the curriculum planners:

Jayeola-Omoyeni (1983), “in 2005” was of the opinion that; “the value of the Arts to human and community are never conceptualized by the learners before the actual teaching of the development of the kingdoms”

The above statement suggests that many people, even those in high places and intellectuals in our society today, are not aware of the important role the Arts as subjects could play in the process of nation building. Thus, they ascribe derogatory names to Art disciplines and to Art students.

Furthermore, the Arts have suffered from a misconception of its essence and role in society in 21st century. This is an indirect consequence of the way and manner in which many practitioners have been presenting the Art disciplines. To many people in society, the Arts as a field of study are static, time wasting, and uninterested in contemporary events. Similarly, in national policy on education in the 21st century all over the world as revealed by research, the arts are grossly marginalized owing to the prominent importance placed on science and technology. This clearly illustrates the status of the Arts as endangered academic disciplines.

2. Non-professionalism of Art teachers:

Fadeiye (2004) advocated that “there is no doubt that anyone who wants to become a teacher must have a good disposition to the teaching profession”. In the same vein, Jayeola-Omoyeni (2005) postulated that “the best teachers of Art disciplines include male and female indigenes and expatriates, who teach at all levels of educational institutions from primary to the university. He must have correct knowledge of Art disciplines, show enthusiasm and zeal to teach them (Art disciplines)”. Yet unfortunately, many teachers of Art disciplines in the 21st century are birds of passage in the teaching profession. This is because many of the teachers in the Art disciplines that we have today lack an interest in the teaching profession and in the Art subjects they teach. Such teachers take the teaching profession as a hobby and consequently pay less attention to it while they devote much of their attention to other areas. These sets of teachers without the necessary commitment and interest usually do not
sincerely devote themselves to the teaching profession. They similarly take the teaching of the Art disciplines with levity.

It is important to note that most of these types of teachers find their way to become part of the curriculum planners. Consequently, the non-professionalism and inadequate knowledge allured to lack of commitment and interest which they have initially displayed are also displayed when planning the school curriculum, especially in secondary schools, and this has seriously damaged the position of Arts in the curriculum.

3. The government policy:

The attitude of Governments all over the world towards the Arts is encouraging a lack of emphasis on the Arts due to the fact that their attention and focus is on how to produce goods for export, build railways, manufacture homemade goods, and how to improve the technological standards of the country. In the context of such demands, the Arts appear to be regarded as irrelevant. It is clear that governments all over the world in the 21st century have marginalized Art subjects. In addition, very few periods are allocated to Art teaching on school timetables. Art lessons or periods are mostly taught in the afternoon when students are already tired, resulting in students being bored and not active in art history classes.

In furtherance to the above, governments prefer investing their money into finance seminars, workshops, conferences and so on, in Science and Technology subjects rather than using the funds on Art disciplines. They do not promptly organize lectures, symposiums, seminars, and refresher courses in order to make the subjects more alive and productive.

4. Personality of the student or learner:

The performance and achievements of a student is affected by their personality, that is to say the general pattern of a person’s way of reasoning, feeling, adjusting and behaving with particular references to other persons or an environment. It is the projection of ourselves to others. Personality is a product of heredity and environment.

Farrant (1980) grouped human beings into two personality types: introvert and extrovert. The extrovert is always reaching out for new connections with people and things as they prefer the world outside of themselves. They like to be the center of attention and mix well with others. Their extroversive personality exposes them better in learning which situations to ask and answer questions, to adjust well and confidentially interact effectively with fellow students and teachers.

On the other hand, the introvert is observed to be concerned with the world within themselves. Their real feelings are not easily recognized, they hate being the centre of attention because of their withdrawing personality. In fact, they are drawn inwards with shyness, nervousness and calmness.

Students who are prone to falling into either of these two groups should be very vigilant because of the nature of Art disciplines. Arts subjects are not like other subjects that involve definitions, advantages and disadvantages etc. they deal with facts and interpretation.

5. Teaching skills of teachers and lack of appropriate teaching aids:

Although there are some teachers of Art disciplines who possess the necessary qualifications, they are not necessarily effective in teaching skills because they teach their subjects in an abstract manner. According to research conducted by various scholars, many teachers of the
Art disciplines in the 21st century engage in the teaching of Art subjects without the usage of necessary and appropriate audio-visual aids such as maps, charts, models, pictorial illustrations, radios, televisions, tape recorders and players, films etc., especially in developing countries. As a result, many students in secondary schools develop a dislike for learning the Arts due to the abstract manner in which it is taught since proper provision for specific teaching aids is not made by the curriculum. The Arts as subjects can never be a meaningful component of the school curriculum if taught without the necessary and suitable teaching aids to overcome this.

Methods of repositioning the teaching and learning of Arts in the 21st Century

Several solutions have been proffered to the challenges of teaching and learning the Arts in the 21st century by various scholars in the Arts and stakeholders in the educational sector around the world. These scholars were of the opinion that if the teaching and learning of the Arts could be repositioned, the lost value of the Arts would be revived and the relevance of the Arts in the process of nation building in the 21st century will be better understood. This would undoubtedly make society, governments at all levels and curriculum planners aware of the important role that Arts can play. Taking into account the opinions of various scholars, if the challenges hindering the teaching and learning of the Arts in the 21st century were to be addressed, then the following recommendations should be considered:

1. The usage of information and communication technology (I.C.T) to the process of teaching and learning the Arts.

Scholarly works and findings have proven that there is no single acceptable term or definition of information and communication technology (I.C.T) (Augustine, 1999). However, I.C.T can still be described as electronic technologies for collecting, storing, processing and communicating information. It can be separated into two main categories: those which process information (such as a computer system), and those which disseminate information (such as a telecommunication system) (Butter, 2003 and Gunton, 1993).

In the same vein, Ladon et al. (1994) in Augustine (1999), defines I.C.T as “information technologies and systems which include all the different means, methods and tools that humans have used throughout history to help manage information, conduct business, communicate with others and better understand the world”. Therefore, in effort to curb the challenges confronting the teaching and learning of Arts in the 21st century, it is suggested that curriculum planners should adequately ensure that they make provisions for the inclusion of information and communication technology in the teaching and learning of the Art disciplines. The inclusion of I.C.T into the curriculum will definitely make the teaching and learning of Art subjects less abstract and more interesting, especially in developing countries.

2. Inclusion of the usage of virtual libraries to the process of teaching and learning the Arts.

Fadeiye (2004) defined a library as “a place (room or building) where people can read books, journals, periodicals, magazines and other printed matter with a view to collecting information”. In furtherance, Abimbola (2003) opined that “since the mid-1980, the Art subjects have continued to record low numbers of enrolment of students”. In line with the above, Oyekanmi (2002) elucidated upon the relevance of virtual libraries to the teaching and learning of Arts in “Nigeria Journal of Library, Archives and Information Science, (NLAIS, 2003)”. He defined a virtual library as “a computerized system, which provides multiple access to entire collections of a library by means of electronic media”. Worthy of mentioning
is that a virtual library annexes digital technology and internet technologies to search, collect, organize, store and distribute information. A virtual library has the capacity to turn around the fortunes of teaching and learning the Arts in the 21st century.

3. Presentation and usage of appropriate teaching aids in the process of teaching and learning the Arts

To curb the challenges hindering the teaching and learning of Arts in the 21st century, the various concerned professionals on curriculum matters such as curriculum planners, the school administrators and Art teachers should always be mindful in ensuring the prescription of the appropriate teaching aids to teach the Art subjects. While the curriculum planners ensure the prescription of the appropriate teaching aids to be prescribed by the curriculum, the school administration should strictly supervise and co-ordinate the teachers in making use of the prescribed teaching aids in teaching the Art subjects. Furthermore, local materials should also be encouraged in the curriculum as it will greatly help in aiding the teaching and learning process of Art subjects in the 21st century.

It is very important to emphasize here that the prescription by the curriculum and the use of appropriate and relevant teaching aids will definitely be a good stimulant for generating interest in learning abstract subjects through an endeavor to include the usage of audiovisual aids in teaching the Art subjects. The audiovisual aids include: pictures, charts, films, etc. which help students gain a clear picture or description of what they have learnt. Televisions and computers will also go a long way in advancing their knowledge; the chalkboard for purpose of clarity and relevant textbooks which provide relevant, vital and up to date information of current trends and developments in the Arts subject etc. If all these are incorporated in the teaching and learning processes of Art subjects, it will definitely curb the challenges militating against the Arts subjects in the 21st century. Thus, Art teachers should not simply wait until the government provides teaching aids. They should also source teaching aids available within their locality.

4. The usage of relevant teaching methods in the process of teaching and learning the Art subjects.

Jayeola Omoyeni (2005), explained that “good methods of teaching can improve the interests and enthusiasm of students to learn Arts subjects”. In furtherance to the above, he further postulated that “the usage of relevant and appropriate teaching methods to teach the Art subjects will erase the fear of students for learning Art subjects and their erroneous perception of the Art subjects as useless disciplines”. In the same vein, Michael Omolewa (1987) was of the opinion that “no teacher of Art disciplines that has the time, energy or experience to use all methods of teaching at a time but whatever the method is to be used, it should depend on general factors like age of the learners, aptitude of the learners, topic, purpose etc”. However, research findings reveal that some specific methods of teaching should be adopted when teaching Art subjects. Prominent among these methods include:

- Excursion or field trip method.
- Group work method.
- Dalton method.
- Inquiry method.
- Socratic Method.

All of these methods of teaching among others have been observed as good and appropriate in teaching, and the learning process of the Art subjects.
5. Encouraging local writers and motivating teachers of Art subjects.

Another way which the challenges hindering the teaching and learning of Art subjects in the 21st century can be overcome is for governments at all levels, all over the world, to encourage teachers of Art subjects to write relevant textbooks on Art subjects which will reflect contemporary issues. These textbooks and materials produced by these authors should then be incorporated into and prescribed by the curriculum to be used in schools at all levels. Furthermore, since it is clear that there is a scarcity of professionally trained Art teachers, there is an urgent need to intensify the training and retaining of Art teachers. Thus, Art teachers should be encouraged to attend workshops, seminars, conferences etc. so that they can be integrated into the changing conditions of the 21st century. This will adequately enhance Art teachers in the ability to give students the right information and guidance, thereby making Art subjects interesting in schools.

Conclusion

As vividly shown in the analysis above, it has been discovered that there are many challenges bedeviling the process of teaching and learning the Arts in the 21st century. It has been explained why the relevance of Art subjects has been undermined, which has also accounted for the loss of student’s interest in the Art disciplines. It can be concluded that if the challenges facing the teaching and learning processes of the Arts in the 21st century were to be overcome, the relevance of the Art disciplines will become better recognized, and its rightful place will be accorded in the educational curriculum all over the world.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of this study, if the challenges facing the teaching and learning processes of the Arts in the 21st century are to be overcome, the following recommendations should be observed and adopted:

- Art teachers should avoid the teaching of Art subjects in an abstract manner. They should ensure the use of appropriate teaching aids.
- Governments at all levels all over the world should encourage the teaching and learning of Art subjects by providing adequate funding and equipment which will benefit Arts education just as how Science and technology is encouraged in the 21st century.
- Art teachers should not embrace the excuse of a lack of funding from the government or any education authorities in failing to make simple and useful teaching aids. They should improvise and experiment with whatever simple teaching aids they themselves can make use of in their lessons.
- Art teachers, especially in developing countries, should ensure the usage of and maximize the advantages of information and communication technologies (I.C.T), visual libraries and internet facilities in communicating relevant information in the teaching and learning processes.
- Art teachers should always attend conferences, seminars etc. so that they can be integrated into the changing conditions of the 21st century.
References


Contact: +2348139440477; soyoye.akinyode@gmail.com
Arthur Miller’s Death of a Salesman: A Re-evaluation

Gunasekaran Narayanan

Miller, in his “Introduction” to the Collected Plays, says that Death of a Salesman is a play that poses the question … “whose answers define humanity?” (32). Both the popular and critical acclaim that the play has received so far confirms the author’s description of it. The play deals with the distance between illusion and reality, the sense of isolation, lack of understanding and the struggle for being.

The central energy of Salesman is derived from an explanation of technological culture, in which illusion takes the place of dreams, and fantasy substitutes reality. This phenomenon, ignorance of reality or non-recognition of facts, has been a potent source of European theatre since the time of the Greeks; but what lends weight to Miller’s discovery is that it is not an exceptional experience to a few but is actually common throughout industrial civilization. Miller points out with remarkable artistic perception the hold of illusions on individuals and its disastrous consequences, the dreams that are intertwined with illusions, the gulf that separates the actual practices from the professed ideals of society.

Willy Loman is a typical postmodern hero. The playwright has taken particular care throughout to underline the sense of inadequacy in Loman’s life and his idealized attitude towards a society he never understood. Loman encounters many pitfalls in his character. In spite of them, his substantial loyalty to the cherished ideals of his society is unquestionable. He trusts them with the naïveté of a child, and to a large part his failing as a man may be directly traced to his uncritical acceptance of contemporary values. Loman clings to the dream of success with a fantastic allegiance that he can maintain only at the price of his identity. Darlington aptly points out that Willy unknowingly surrenders his “conscience - that which is most fundamentally himself – for a place in society that was never his” (44).

Willy’s concept of success is personified by two individuals – Ben and Dave Singleman, whom Jacobson considers to be the “mythological projections of his own needs and his society’s values” (47). To him, Ben represents the adventurous spirit of rugged individualism, rapid wealth and the American story of rags to riches. He went out to make his fortune in Alaska but because of his “faulty view of geography” wound up in Africa, and through a combination of pluck and luck struck it rich (156). To the awe – struck Biff and Happy he says, “why boys, when I was seventeen I walked into the jungle, and when I was twenty - one I walked out. And by God I was rich.” To which Willy frenziedly adds, “You see what I been talking about? The greatest thing can happen!” (157).

Willy feels that his sons have certain tangible signs which characterize the personality that is likely to succeed. They are physically strong and well-built, and above all, attractive. Biff is a football hero, the captain of the high school team and though Happy is not gifted with Biff’s ability he has a pleasant personality. Willy is ambivalent in his attitude towards education. It is true, he feels, attendance at college confers prestige, especially when coupled with an athletic career. On the other hand, education does not make an appreciable difference in the struggle to succeed.

The truth he arrives at is not created by American culture specifically. It is his subjective interpretation of success. Willy’s commitment to the ideology of success directs the educational career of his sons. Even if success passes him by, he can still look forward to a
vindication of his life through them. “The world is an oyster, but you don’t crack it open on a mattress” he tells them ecstatically (CP 152). If Willy is mesmerized by Ben’s success story, he is also seduced by some of its ramifications. “Never fight fair with a stranger, boy. You’ll never get out of the jungle that way,” the uncle intones his nephew, Biff, and it is precisely this stress on the justification of means by ends that enables Willy to wink at the boys’ faults (CP 158). Biff has been a thief from his high school days: he steals a football from the locker and lumber from a local construction job. Willy laughs at both the thefts and treats lightly, considering them to be a manifestation of the power of personality and a fearless competitiveness like Ben’s. He tells Biff “Coach will probably appreciate you on your initiative. . . . That’s because he likes you. If somebody else took the ball there’d be an uproar”(CP 144). When Charley warns Willy that the watchman will catch the boys in their thievery, Willy avers that, though he gave them hell, the boys are ‘a couple of fearless characters’(CP 158). When Charley replies that the jails are full of fearless characters, Ben adds that the stock exchange is also. The boys have been brought to respect the ideology of success; their success will be the salesman’s vindication and he tries to mould them in his own image. His practice of situation ethics is evident. Willy chooses to imitate the salesman side of his father. The most influential of these was his meeting with David Singleman, an old New England salesman who came to represent for Willy, the father he never knew. It is Singleman’s life and more especially his death that comes to symbolize what Willy thinks he wants for himself. Ashe explains to Howard, his boss:

Old Dave, he’d go up to his room, y’ understand, put on his green Velvet slippers – I’ll never forget – and pick up his phone and call the buyers and without ever leaving his room, at the age of eighty-four, he made his living. And when I saw that, I realized that selling was the greatest career a man could want (180).

Miller almost certainly intended the irony implied by Willy’s interest in a job that required no more than lifting a phone, but the more dreadful irony relates to the interpretation of business which Willy derives from Singleman’s example. Willy looks at only surfaces of reality. His knowledge is local, situated and slippery.

What Singleman’s achievement represents to Willy is a demonstration of the co-operative and benevolent nature of capitalism. Singleman’s ability to sell by phone at the age eighty-four was proof to Willy that he was remembered, loved and helped by so many different people. This conclusion seemed to be confirmed by Singleman’s funeral which was attended by hundreds of salesmen and buyers. Singleman, in other words, represented free enterprise with a human face, and it is part of Willy’s tragedy that he never realizes that such a system does not exist.

The only member of the family who distrusts Ben is Willy’s wife, Linda. To her, the words of Ben are disgusting as they pose a threat to the family’s stability and security. The strength and tenacity of her love for Willy and her determination to hold her family together appear to be in reassuring contrast to those around her. She represents the values of decency, courage, self-sacrifice, and devotion. She has chosen a difficult path and has stuck to it. Indeed it is possible to suggest that part of the power of the play can be found not only in the way other members of the family tear each other apart, but in the way Linda attempts to hold them together. She has a painfully realistic insight into the character and situation of the man she married. She knows that the fifty dollars which he gives her as his pay cheque has actually been borrowed from Charley. She allows him to lie, as she does not want to rob him of his remaining dignity.
by informing him of her awareness of his deception. She is also aware of his obsession with the idea of suicide. She quietly subverts his plans instead of shaming him by revealing to him her knowledge of it. She knows that he is fragmented. Fully cognizant of his weaknesses, Linda can also comprehend Willy’s loneliness and heartbreak. In her overwhelming devotion to him, she has helped to build a doll’s house around him and, consequently, has done to Willy what he has been doing to Biff and Happy. In being a good wife, Linda has extended her devotion to an extreme that has become destructive not only to her husband but also to her sons, who have also become victims of her gingerbread house. To a great extent, Linda’s follies are attributable to her longing for security and relatedness.

Willy’s fortunes are at low ebb in the chronicle present of the play. His ideology of success is tested by harsh realities which he alternately faces and flees from. He struggles hard to hold on to his identity and this means holding on to his faith and in the nature of that faith, Willy lies constantly: about the gross sale he has made about the reaction of businessmen to his personality, about his boy’s success and importance, about his own prospects. Neil Carson is right when he says that Willy engages in constant deception to conceal the truth from himself (56). From the observer’s point of view established in the play through Charley, they are pathetic efforts to protect his identity. His infidelity is justified as a provision against the rebuffs of the day. There is an explicit rejection of spiritual values in his life. When he momentarily faces reality – his inability to drive to Boston, the mounting bills and the dwindling income - he has to take refuge in the past and project the future. The salesman cannot abandon his concept of success and its pursuit without reducing himself to zero, and therefore he must hope.

The events of the first act - past and present - contra pose optimism a harsh reality. Act One presents Willy as a fired drummer and his boys as mediocre also-rans, a clerk and a farm-hand, both over thirty. They are lost and confused by their failure to get ahead and Willy is at the end of his tether because he cannot even drive a car anymore. In the first act, all difficulties, past and present, are smothered by a pervading optimism:

> Happy: Wait a minute! I got an idea….’ Loman brothers’. Baby,
> We could sell sporting goods.
> Willy: That’s a one-million-dollar idea (167-68).

This scheme is generated out of his ideology of success. “Loman brothers” has, for Willy and the boys, that authentic ring of personality, solidity and achievement. Enthused by his sons’ earnest endeavor to actualize the dream, he determines to ask his young boss Howard for a place in New York for himself, for a job that would take him off the road.

The interview episodes provide the basis for the movement of the second act. The scene in which Willy meets Howard is so painful that it makes one wince. However, it should be noticed that its tone is a blend of pathos and irony rather than indignation and indictment. The aging salesman who pleads for a job in New York receives his dismissal notice instead. The beleaguered salesman has not collided with a capitalistic ogre, but, ironically with a younger embodiment of his own traits. The scene should be construed more as an arraignment of Willy than as an indictment of the system. The system has not broken down.

Actually it is not Howard, but Charley who is the truly successful businessman in the play and who provides the counterbalance to Willy. Though both of them live in same neighborhood and have essentially similar backgrounds, their views are sharply divergent. Their difference
is not ideological but is the result of a seasoned perception which Charley maintains and which Willy has lacked.

Miller’s approval of Charley reveals not only his acceptance of the man but of the capitalistic system in which he thrives, assuming that for all that can go wrong with it, “the norm of capitalistic behavior is ethical or at least can be” (37). Through Charley, Miller emphasizes that the system is not a fictitious construct. It can be trusted to develop meaning or to give order. Miller indicts Willy for his lack of understanding of the system. Insisting that it is not a matter of what you do but “who you know and the smile on your face!” Loman optimistically locates the secret of success in “contacts” and “personal attractiveness”, expectant that “a man can end with diamonds here on the basis of being well-liked” (184).

But Willy fails to see that men buy appearances only in their leisure. In terms of structure, the interview episodes, one witnessed and the other reported, are dramatizations of the failure of the concept of success as Willy understood it and preached to his sons. Their respective experiences produce different reactions in father and son. Willy is incapable of understanding his defeat even when Charley, a good neighbor, spells it out for him: “The only thing you got in the world is what you can sell. And the funny thing is that you’re a salesman and you don’t know that” (192). He is still not in a position to draw a line of demarcation between the marketable and the imaginary. The meeting of the father and sons in the restaurant is an ironic reversal of the victory celebration. They run away from the failure their father has become and from their own failure. They leave the old man and go off with two chippies.

Two crucial events dominate the restaurant scene. Biff’s inability to get the required finance from Oliver is linked to his failure in math and his flight to Boston. Relying on personality, he had mimicked the effeminate instructor to his face and had cut the classes for football practices. Despite Bernard’s help in the exam, he flunked math and the instructor refused to make a concession. When the boy runs to his father for help, he finds a woman in Willy’s hotel room and his idol crumbles. The travelling salesman’s joke becomes a traumatic experience for the boy, driving away his disillusions and preparing him for present insight. Biff considers the affair as a betrayal of Linda, the family and the home. The image of the husband is shattered when Willy gives the woman “mamma’s stockings” (208). Willy’s search for material and physical pleasure at the cost of inner balance and spirituality is underlined throughout the play.

The result is a situation in which he finds himself alienated and increasingly lost in memories and dreams. In one respect Willy is caught between two cultures: the vanished agrarian frontier that he rhapsodically associates with his father and modern urban society, the tape-record civilization of Howard Wagner. Biff suspects that perhaps the Lomans have been miscast in their salesman role. “They’ve laughed at dad for years, and you know why? Because we don’t belong in this nut-house of a city! We should be mixing cement on some open plain or carpenters”, he tells his mother (166). So when Biff comes to realize who he is, his insight flashes out of the contrast between the office and open sky.

The climactic scene in the second act is the confrontation of father and son. Because he suspects the truth, Willy is unwilling to face Biff or Linda. But this time Biff is not to be put off: “The man don’t know who we are! The man is gonna to know...We never told the truth for ten minutes in this house!’ (216). Willy is no longer a salesman; no longer a father; Willy is ‘the man’. The identity supplied by economic and familial society is stripped away and the issue is joined at rock bottom. Biff adds:
I am not leader of men, Willy, and neither are you. You were anything but a hard-working drummer who landed in the ash can like the rest of them! I’m one dollar an hour, Willy. . . . Do you gather meaning? I’m not bringing home any prizes any more, and you’re going to stop waiting for me to bring them home! (217).

Facts fall before faith and the salesman cannot admit such heresy. Willy knows who he is: “I am not a dime a dozen. I am Willy Loman and you are Biff Loman” (217). Willy’s immediate reaction is the assumption that Biff is trying to spite him in revenge for his disillusionment, but the young grabs Willy and cries, “Pop, I’m nothing; I’m nothing. Pop. . . can’t you understand that? There is no spite in it anymore. I’m just what I’m that’s all” (217). Biff literally tries to pound his message into his father. In the play’s most shattering moment, he breaks down on the old man’s shoulder, sobbing uncontrollably, “Will you let me go, for Christ’s sake!” he begs. Will you take that phony dream and burn it before something happens” (217). Biff’s open cry does not make him see the hollowness of his values. Willy goes to his death without endorsing Biff’s statement. His suicide is not an act of penance for holding on to wrong values. It appears to be penalty. There is no recognition scene in the traditional sense. There is a notable absence of the tragic, articulated awareness of self-delusion and final understanding. Otten aptly observes that the play “reveals the basic problems of self-knowledge that human beings must face. . . . Miller cries with the Delphic Oracle ‘know thyself’ (91).

Willy is almost a personification of self-delusion and waste. His dream is to join the Dominate Power Structure. There is a road to reach the Structure. As he practices moral relativism he fails to locate the road. He is seen justifying unethical means throughout the play. He encourages his son to steal and indulge in debauchery. He does not act in conformity with the universal laws of nature. Anti-conformity is an important trait of postmodern hero. His own neighbor Charley succeeds in joining the Structure. Till the end, he sticks to his perception of ‘truth’. He fails to understand social reality as it really is. He does not recognize that there is ‘depth’ in each and every aspect of issues related to man and society. He looks only at the flowers of the plant. He is unwilling to see that the plant has roots. He does not analyze his ambitions and actions in the light of advice and comments made by people like Charley. He cannot recognize that man is as much acted upon as he is acting. His practice of situation ethics illustrates his disbelief in the soul and spiritual connection. He is not as enlightened as Biff is. He lacks heroic virtues and qualities such as being morally good, idealistic, courageous and noble. The hero does not create truth but rather discovers it. What Willy has created is a false ideology. He looks at only the ‘surfaces’ of concrete experiences; he tends to avoid looking at abstract principles involved in the manifestation of experiences. He is unaware that social dynamics, such as power and hierarchy, affect human conceptualizations of the world.

The outcome of the experience of Loman is not fallible and relative, rather certain and universal. The fall of Grand narratives is one of the themes of postmodernism. It is true that the play moves outside the established conventions of its genre. Miller’s dramaturgy does not indicate his distrust of the existing form of drama. He does experimentation with the dramatic form to accommodate his theme and meaning. The play merges the dramatic form with the novelistic form. Interior monologue technique is adopted to reveal the ‘inside’ of Willy’s head. He succeeds in his experimentation. It is not disjunctive and open -the play has a purpose. It has no scope for free play. Miller’s text cannot be separated from its author. In fact, he has made the Grand narrative grander. The play suggests new directions and possibilities for all of the world drama. Neil Carson’s remarks sums up the thematic greatness of the play:
I respond more strongly to Will’s universality than I do to many more emotional tragic heroes. As for Willy’s blindness, that too seems to me a more valid representation of man’s contemporary experience than ‘enlightenment’ provided by some acknowledged tragedies. Furthermore, it is ultimately the audience’s enlightenment which is important, not the character’s, and in this respect I do not think Death of a Salesman fails. What emerges at the end of the play seems to me an appropriate blend of pity, fear, and consolation – pity for Willy, fear that we may be as self-deluding as he, and hope based on the knowledge that we, if we so desire, take control of our lives. I doubt if we can ask more of serious drama. . . . (59)
References
