Leadership Styles, Promotion Opportunities, and Salary as Correlates of Turnover Intentions among Librarians in Nigerian University Libraries

Afebuameh James Aiyebelehin, Ambrose Alli University, Nigeria Rosemary Odiachi, Benson Idahosa University, Nigeria Blessing Omoregie, Ambrose Alli University, Nigeria

Abstract

The study investigated leadership styles, promotion opportunities, and salary as correlates of turnover intention among librarians in Nigerian academic libraries. It applied the correlational survey design, and data was gathered with a questionnaire. The entire 115 librarians in three (3) universities in South-South, Nigeria formed the population of this study. The data was analyzed with mean and Pearson Moment Correlation (2-tailed). The findings show that the turnover intention of the librarians was high; leadership, promotion opportunities, and salary positively correlate with the turnover intention. The major implication of the findings of the study is that the issue of leadership style, promotion, and salary should be carefully planned by the management of the library, otherwise, the librarians will leave the library whenever the opportunity shows up. These findings provide new data for planning the management of library staff to achieve effective information service in the library.

Keywords: academic libraries, leadership styles, librarians, promotion opportunities, salary, turnover intention

Introduction

In this modern world, the level of commitment of workers is critical for the survival and continuity of any organization (Azeez, Jayeoba & Adeoye, 2016). For any organization to function effectively, the organization must be able to retain the qualified and committed workforce. However, this is not the case in many organizations today, as evidence has shown that it is becoming difficult for managers to retain their workers and this is increasing the rate of the turnover intention among employees across various sectors. In fact, Caglar & Duarte (2019) pointed out that "managers now spend 10-20% of their time recruiting and training new hires in high turnover service businesses". Although, in a developing country like Nigeria and with the uncertainty brought about by rising unemployment rates even among the vibrant youth population, it can be said that turnover may not be as high as recorded in developed countries, however there is an intent to leave an organization for another due to one or a combination of several factor(s). This is what is referred to in the literature as "turnover intentions".

Kumar (2011) noted that "turnover is a critical human resource issue in all sectors of the economy which affects productivity, product and service quality, and profitability". Azeez, Jayeoba & Adeoye (2016) defined "turnover intention as the intent of an employee to leave an organization in search of a new job". Also, Ngamkroeckjoti, Ounprechavanit and Kijboonchoo (2012) stated that "turnover intention of employees refers to the likelihood of a worker to change their place of work". In the view of Medina (2012), the term "turnover intention" "is often used in human resource management to describe an employee's intention to find a new job with another employer". The intention to leave one's place of work is a result of several factors. Bandhanpreet, Mohindru & Pankaj (2013) asserted that turnover intention is a complex phenomenon that depends on various factors; Omeluzor et al. (2017) noted that these indicators are "age, gender, tenure, designation, experience, compensation, education, nature of employment are predictors of turnover intentions of employees in organizations" (p. 5). Furthermore, Belete (2018) identified factors that may influence the turnover intention, such as leadership styles, organizational culture, promotion opportunities, salary, and job satisfaction.

Employee's intention to leave their current place of work has become a critical issue for organizations irrespective of size, where they are, and what they do (Long, Thean, Ismail & Jusoh, 2012). This means that the turnover intention among employees cuts across sectors and organizations. The library as an organization has its fair share of turnover intention among its staff. Studies, such as Idiegbeyan-Ose, Opeke and Nwokeoma (2018), have shown the growth of turnover issues among Nigerian librarians in public and private universities in recent times. Other studies in Nigeria have shown that promotion (Owhondah, Onuoha & Akhigbe, 2016), organization factors (Omeluzor, 2018), and leadership style (Nwokocha & Iheriohanma, 2015) are some of the factors affecting turnover intentions among librarians. The few studies on this subject have paid more attention to private universities, however, it seems that the intention to leave a library also affects library professionals in government-owned academic institutions. In Southern Nigeria, the issues of poor welfare and delay in payment of salaries have been causing agitations in recent times.

Based on the foregoing, this study is designed to investigate leadership styles, promotion opportunities, and salary as correlates of turnover intentions among librarians in three (3) selected universities in Southern Nigeria.

Research Question for the Study

What is the level of the turnover intention of the librarians in the selected universities in South-South, Nigeria?

Hypotheses

The following null hypotheses were tested at 0.01 level of significance:

 $H0_1$: There is no significant relationship between leadership styles and turnover intentions $H0_2$: There is no significant relationship between promotion opportunities and turnover intentions

H03: There is no significant relationship between salary and turnover intentions

Literature Review

Organizations in the modern era are faced with unrestricted and rapid changes in their processes and procedures (Olusegun, 2012). This has posed serious challenges to the sustainability of these organizations. For instance, Azeez, Jayeoba & Adeoye (2016) opined that "volatile free market economic environments, rapidly changing technologies, global competition, workforce diversity, and new organizational structures are some of the challenges an organization faces". Human capital is the major aspect of the organization that is affected by these changes. It should be noted that human capital is the pivot that drives effectiveness in organizations (Idiegbeyan-Ose, Opeke & Nwokeoma, 2018). In fact, the human capital determines to a large extent the value of the organizations and their level of productivity.

Also, Akthar (2017) noted that in this era of highly competitive business environments, "talented employees are considered as key resources". The ability of organizations to retain these employees has been seen as a critical challenge to 21st-century organizations. In fact, many employees have shown the intention to change their workplaces to organizations with better career prospects and welfare packages. This desire to leave one place of work for another is called "turnover intention". Mwita, Mwakasangula, & Tefurukwa (2018) define "turnover intention" as "employees' willingness or attempts to leave the current workplace voluntarily". Also, Idiegbeyan-Ose, Opeke & Nwokeoma (2018) defined "turnover intention" simply as "the rate to which a member of staff is willing to leave a particular organisation" (p. 2). Turnover intention could even mean an employee's consideration or thinking of quitting a job (Long & Thean, 2011).

Nyamubarwa (2013) reported that in Zimbabwe the "majority of academic librarians (80%) consider employment outside Zimbabwe as a vibrant option to their current state of affairs". Similarly, Olusegun (2012) did a study in Southwest Nigeria and found that the rate of turnover intention of library personnel in some universities in Southwest Nigeria was high.

Several studies have shown that there are many variables that could lead people to quit their job. Some of them are; job satisfaction (Hussain & Ghulam, 2017), organizational culture (Idiegbeyan-Ose, Opeke & Nwokeoma, 2018), organizational commitment (Akhigbe, Felix & Finelady, 2014), leadership styles (Domfeh, Obuobisa-Darko & Asare, 2016), pay satisfaction (Singh & Loncar, 2010), promotion opportunities (Owhondah, Onuoha & Akhigbe, 2016), work-family conflict (Long, Azami, Kowang & Fei, 2016), and so forth.

The findings by Nwokocha and Iheriohanma (2015) established a connection between leadership styles, employee retention and employee performance. Nwokocha and Iheriohanma

(2015) concluded that effective leadership style is crucial for achieving organizational goals. Also, Sulamuthu and Yusuf (2018) established that a relationship exists between leadership style and turnover intention.

Other studies show that salary or financial benefit is a major consideration both for employers and employees (Singh & Loncar, 2010; Akhtar, 2017). Hence, Singh and Loncar (2010) noted that for employees, pay is of obvious importance in terms of satisfying their economic needs. All these variables provide an interplay that results in turnover intention of employees. For librarians in South-South, Nigeria, this important correlation has not been scientifically established. This study aims to fill this gap in order to help library managers and make critical decisions that will foster employee satisfaction and retention.

Conceptual Framework

Building on existing theories of social exchange, this study is built on the conceptual model that suggests that leadership styles, promotion opportunities, and satisfaction from salary are independent variables that correlate with turnover intention among librarians. The framework for this study proposes that if the leadership style is considered appropriate and the library has a balanced way of reward and promotion, as well as pays librarians the salaries due to them, the turnover intention among them will be low. However, if the opposite happens, the turnover intention of the librarians will be high, and this will disrupt effective delivery in these libraries.



Figure 1: Conceptual Model of Turnover Intention of Librarians (designed by the authors)

Research Methods

This study employed correlational research design. The research design simply seeks to establish the relationship among the variables of the study. A total of 115 professional librarians at the University of Benin, Ambrose Alli University, and Benson Idahosa University formed the population of the study. The total enumeration sampling technique was used to survey all the (115) professional librarians. This method is adopted because the population was deemed manageable. Data collection was done with a questionnaire titled "Turnover Intentions of Librarians in Selected Universities". The hypotheses were tested at 0.01 level of significance with two-tailed Pearson Moment Correlation calculated with Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS).

Analysis and presentation of Data

Research question: Level of turnover intention. With a grand mean of 3.16 out of the maximum of 4.0, the data on Table 1 shows that the librarians in the selected university libraries in South-South, Nigeria have a high level of turnover intention. While all the items returned high mean scores except one, it is striking to note that a personal desire to change the current

place of work (x=3.81); availability of job opportunities (x=3.54), and establishment of new universities (3.51) are the most likely reasons that motivate the librarians to want to leave their current place of employment.

Table 1: The Turnover	Intention	of the Re	spondents
-----------------------	-----------	-----------	-----------

ITEMS	Very High (4)	High (3)	Low (2)	Very Low (1)	М
I wish to change my current place of work in the nearest future.	68 (80.9%)	16 (19.0%)			3.81
I am open to finding a another job if the opportunity presents itself.	50 (59.5%)	20 (23.8%)	10 (11.9%)	4 (4.8%)	3.38
I believe there are available employment opportunities in my profession, hence I can change my place of work as soon as possible.	52 (61.9%)	27 (32.1%)	3 (3.5%)	2 (2.4%)	3.54
New institutional libraries are being established, hence I can easily find another job.	55 (65.4%)	22 (26.1%)	2 (2.3%)	5 (9.5%)	3.51
I have the qualifications and years of experience to get another job.	39 (46.4%)	24 (45.2%)	19 (5.9%)	2 (5.9%)	3.19
I am willing to leave my current place of work for a similar position elsewhere if the pay is better.	49 (58.3%)	14 (35.7%)	9 (10.7%)	12 (17.8%)	3.19
I do not think my expectation can be fulfilled in my current place of work.	34 (40.4%)	27 (32.1%)	3 (3.5%)	5 (5.9%)	3.30
Thoughts of leaving my current place of work comes to my mind quite often.	30 (80.9%)	39 (46.4%)	2 (2.3%)	8 (9.5%)	3.15
It is not likely that I would think of quitting my library.	5 (5.9%)	8 (9.5%)	50 (63.0%)	21 (25%)	1.37
Grand mean					3.16

Interpretation criteria: means scores 1-1.4 = Very Low, means scores 1.5-2.4 = Low, means scores 2.5-3.4 = High, while means scores 3.5-4 = Very High; and the benchmark mean = 2.50 since the response format is 4 point.

Hypothesis 1: There is no significant relationship between leadership styles and turnover intentions.

As shown in Table 2, a strong positive relationship exists between leadership styles and turnover intentions with (r = .834; N = 84; p < .01). Therefore, the hypothesis which states there is no significant relationship between leadership styles and turnover intentions is hereby rejected. Hence, there is a significant relationship between leadership styles and turnover intentions. Therefore, a change in leadership style will account for 84% of turnover intention among the librarians.

Table 2: Pearson's correlation on the relationship between leadership styles and turnover intentions

Correlation	Leadership styles	Turnover intentions
leadership styles		
Pearson Correlation	1	.834**
Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
N	84	84
turnover intentions		
Pearson Correlation	.834**	1
Sig (2-tailed)	.000	
N	84	84

****** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)

Hypothesis 2: There is no significant relationship between promotion opportunities and turnover intentions.

As shown in Table 3 the correlation coefficient of 0.887 indicates that a strong positive relationship exists between promotion opportunities and turnover intentions. The significant value of .000 shows that turnover intention has strong relationship with promotion because 0.00 < 0.01 Sig level. Therefore, the hypothesis which states there is no significant relationship between promotion opportunities and turnover intentions is hereby rejected. Hence, there is a significant relationship between promotion opportunities and turnover intentions.

Table 3: Pearson's correlation on the relationship between promotion opportunities and turnover intentions

Correlation	Turnover intentions	Promotion opportunities
Promotion opportunities		
Pearson Correlation	1	.887**
Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
N	84	84
Turnover intentions		
Pearson Correlation	887**	1
Sig (2-tailed)	.000	
N	84	84

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)

Hypothesis 3: There is no significant relationship between salary and turnover intentions.

An interpretation of the correlation coefficient of .752 in Table 4 shows the existence of a relationship between salary and turnover intentions with (r = .752; N = 84; p < 0.01). Therefore, the hypothesis which states there is no significant relationship between salary and turnover intentions is thereby rejected. Hence, there is a significant relationship between salary and turnover intentions.

Table 4: Pearson's correlation on the relationship between salary and turnover intentions

Correlation	Turnover intentions	Salary
Salary		.752**
Pearson Correlation	1	.000
Sig. (2-tailed)		
N	84	84
turnover intentions		
Pearson Correlation	752**	1
Sig (2-tailed)	.000	
N	84	84

****** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)

Discussion of Findings

The findings revealed that majority of the respondents agreed that their turnover intention was high. The major factors encouraging the tendency to change their current place of work was attributed to a personal desire to leave and the availability of job opportunities. These findings align with Long & Thean (2011) who stated, "Employees' turnover has been always a key concern issues faced by organizations regardless of its locations, sizes, natures of business, business strategy" (p. 91).

The finding is equally in tandem with the report by Mwita, Mwakasangula, and Tefurukwa, (2018) who predicted that "external employment opportunities to have a direct positive effect on turnover intention". The finding that librarians have a high turnover intention in South-South, Nigeria, attributed to the availability of job opportunities, is not far from the reality. Even though the general employment situation is bad in Nigeria, the proliferation of public and private universities in recent times have increased employment opportunities for librarians. And this could be why turnover intention is high among the librarians in the selected university libraries.

Finding of hypothesis one shows a strong relationship between leadership styles and turnover intentions with (r = .834; N = 84; p < .01). This finding is in agreement with Belete (2018) who reported that leadership style affects the turnover intention. This means that the nature of leadership in the university libraries has capacity to either encourage the librarians to stay or leave the library for other places of work.

Finding of hypothesis two shows a strong positive relationship between promotion opportunities and turnover intention of librarians (0.00 < 0.01 Sig level). This finding agrees with Nyamubarwa (2013) who reported that promotion opportunities along with other factors have significant relationship with turnover intentions. Medina (2012) also noted that "promotion speed and remuneration growth are the foremost factors that have direct high

impact on employees' turnover intentions". If the issue of promotion is mishandled, it can result in employee dissatisfaction and fuel the intention to leave the library.

Finding of hypothesis 3 shows a strong positive relationship between salary and turnover intentions with (r = .752; N = 84; p < 0.01). This finding agreed with Singh and Loncar (2010), who reported that "for employees, pay is of obvious importance in terms of satisfying their economic needs... this may impact their attitudes and behaviors." Again, whereas, Akhtar (2017) reported that there is a negative relationship between salary and turnover intention, Singh and Loncar (2010) found that "money and nonmonetary reward system in term of remuneration were the motivation for an employee". The implication of this finding is that if salaries are poor, unpaid or delayed, the librarians will have a higher tendency to change their jobs. This further implies that such librarians are constantly looking for new opportunities. In view of this, the current situation in Nigeria, where salaries are delayed, must be carefully reviewed so that the librarians can concentrate to deliver services instead of constantly looking for new opportunities.

Recommendations

Arising from the findings, the following recommendations were made:

- 1. The issue of salaries and allowances of library personnel should be taken seriously since it could lead to turnover intention.
- 2. The leadership in operation should promote employee's satisfaction and participation in order to stem discontent and turnover intention among librarians.
- 3. The promotion principles should be transparent and understood by all the staff in the library in a way that none will nurse the intention to leave due to vague and unreliable promotion criteria.

Conclusion

The findings of this study have helped to establish the fact that most of the librarians in the studied libraries have a high tendency to change their place of work. Some of the factors that influence this desire are leadership, promotion opportunities, and salary. It can be concluded that if the factors identified as influencers of turnover intention are not properly managed, most libraries will be unable to retain their workforce for longer periods. The consequences may be devastating for these libraries especially in developing economies where libraries are already understaffed.

References

- Ansari, F. A., & Abbas, A. A. (2018). Nationalism in perspective: Allama Iqbal's critique of Western nationalism. *International Educational Scientific Research Journal*, 4(9), 24–32.
- Coldiron, A. B. (2018). *Translation and translations*. Wiley Online Library. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118585184.ch2
- Akhigbe, O. J., Felix, O. O., & Finelady, A. M. (2014). Employee job satisfaction and organizational commitment in Nigeria manufacturing organizations, *Europeans Journal of Business and Management*, 6(2)5, 83–95.
- Akthar, P. (2017). Research on employee turnover intentions: a review, *EPRA International* Journal of Economic and Business Review, 5(1), 28–37.
- Azeez, R. O., Jayeoba, F. I., & Adeoye, A. O. (2016). Job satisfaction, turnover intention and organizational commitment, *BVIMSR's Journal of Management Research*, 8(2), 102–114.
- Bandhanpreet, K., Mohindru, A. & Pankaj, M. (2013). Antecedents of turnover intentions: a literature review, *Global Journal of Management and Business Studies*, *3*(10), 1219–1230.
- Belete, A. K. (2018). Turnover intention influencing factors of employees: an empirical work review, *Journal of Entrepreneurial Organization Management*, 7(1), 253–67.
- Caglar, D., & Duarte, C. (2019). 10 principles of workforce transformation, *Organizations & People* (Magazine). Retrieved November 27, 2020 from www.strategy-business.com
- Domfeh, A., Obuobisa-Darko, T., & Asare, L. O. (2016). Leadership style and employee behaviour: a reciprocal relationship, *African Research Review*, *10*(2), 1–15. https://doi.org/10.4314/afrrev.v10i2.1
- Hussain, S., & Ghulam, A. (2017). Job satisfaction and turnover intentions among college faculty in Gilgit-Baltistan, Pakistan, *Pakistan Business Review*, 19(3), 810–825.
- Idiegbeyan-Ose, J. (2018). Influence of organisational culture on turnover intention of library staff in private university libraries, South-West Nigeria, *Academy of Strategic Management Journal*, 17(4), 1–8.
- Idiegbeyan-Ose, J., Opeke, R. & Nwokeoma, N. M. (2018). Influence of organisational culture on turnover intention of library staff in private university libraries, South-West Nigeria, Academy of Strategic Management Journal, 17(4), 1–16.
- Kumar, R. R (2011). Turnover issues in the textile industry in Ethiopia: a case of Arba Minch Textile Company, *African Journal of Marketing Management*, *3*, 32–44.
- Long, C. S., Thean, L. Y., Ismail, W. K. W., & Jusoh, A. (2012). Leadership styles and employees' turnover intention: Exploratory study of academic staff in a Malaysian college, *World Applied Science Journal*, 19(1), 575–581.
- Long, C. S., & Thean, L. Y. (2011). Relationship between leadership style, job satisfaction and employee's turnover intention, a literature review. *Research Journal of Business Management*, 5(3), 91–100. https://doi.org/10.3923/rjbm.2011.91.100

- Long, C. S., Azami, A., Kowang, T. O., & Fei, G. O. (2016). An analysis on the relationship between work family conflict and turnover intention: A case study in a manufacturing company in Malaysia, *International Business Management*, 10(3), 176–182.
- Long, C. S., Kowang, T. O., & Chin, T. A. (2017). HR Practices and Employee's Turnover Intention: A Proposed Framework, *The Social Sciences*, *12*(5), 826–830.
- Medina, E. (2012). Job satisfaction and employee turnover intention: What does organisational culture have to do with it? (A Masters of Arts Thesis Submitted to Columbia University). Retrieved November 12, 2020 from http://gs.columbia.edu/theses/medina 2012
- Mwita, K. M., Mwakasangula, E. & Tefurukwa, O. (2018). The influence of leadership on employee retention in Tanzania commercial banks, *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 8(2), 274–283.
- Ngamkroeckjoti, C., Ounprechavanit, P. & Kijboonchoo, T. (2012). Determinant factors of turnover intention: a case study of air conditioning company in Bangkok, Thailand. A paper presented at the International Conference on Trade, Tourism and Management 2012. Retrieved November 12, 2020 from http://sconfpapers.org/18392
- Nyamubarwa, W. (2013). I am considering leaving soon turnover intentions of academic librarians in Zimbabwe, *Journal of Business Administration and Education*, 4(1), 7–90.
- Olusegun, O. S. (2012). Influence of motivation on turnover of library personnel in some public universities in South West Nigeria, *Library Philosophy and Practice (ejournal)*. 722. Retrieved November 12, 2020 from http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/722
- Olusegun, S. O. (2013). Influence of job satisfaction on turnover intentions of library personnel in selected universities in South West Nigeria, *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 914. Retrieved November 12, 2020 from http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/914
- Omeluzor, S. U. (2018). Organizational culture variables as factors influencing librarians' turnover intentions in university libraries in South-South and South-East of Nigeria, *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*, 1693. Retrieved November 12, 2020 from https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/1693
- Omeluzor, S. U., Dolapo, P. G., Agbawe, M. O., Onasote, A. O., & Abayomi, A. I. (2017). Library infrastructure as predictor of turnover intentions of librarians in university libraries in Nigeria. *Information Impact: Journal of Information and Knowledge Management*, 8(1), 1–12. https://dx.doi.org/10.4314/iijikm.v8i1.1
- Owhondah, E. I., Onuoha, B. C. & Akhigbe, J. O. (2016). Promotion and turnover intentions in selected oil firms in rivers state, *International Journal of Advanced Academic Research*, 2(8), 76-84.
- Singh, P. & Loncar, N. (2010). Pay satisfaction, job satisfaction and turnover intent, *Industrial Relations*, 65(3), 470-490.
- Sulamuthu, G. A., & Yusof, H. M. (2018). Leadership style and employee turnover intention, *Proceedings of the International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Operations Management*, Bandung, Indonesia, March 6-8, 2018.

Corresponding author: Afebuameh James Aiyebelehin **Contact email:** jamesaferich@gmail.com