Digital War of South Korean Netizens in New York City:
From Tweets to a Billboard Advertisement, and an Alt-Right Online Community

Hojeong Lee, Temple University, USA

Abstract

This study explores how people share their political perspectives within online communities, construct online discourses on social and political issues in digital spaces, and finally utilize offline venues to grow their base of supporters as a form of social movement. The researcher examines the events related to a series of birthday wish ads for the South Korean president in Times Square in 2018 and the responses of Ilbe, an alt-right online community, to the occasion. I use three lines of inquiry: 1) How did the Ilbe online community users facilitate online discussions in order to lead to offline social action? 2) Why did the Ilbe members create the advertisement in Times Square? and 3) What are the implications of the billboard within political and social contexts?

By closely examining the recent digital confrontation among different online groups in South Korea, this project yields insights into understanding the current social movements based on digital media, and in particular, an alt-right group. The findings of this research demonstrate how social action can be mobilized based on online communication, and how faithfully the Ilbe community performs its role as a representative alt-right community of South Korea during the political turmoil. Finally, the current study articulates the relations between the digital world and physical space.

Keywords: alt-right community, social movement, Ilbe Storehouse, public space, online ethnography, digital media

Introduction

On January 22, 2018, a message wishing South Korean President Moon Jae-in a happy birthday flickered on an electronic billboard in New York's Times Square. It was a few days later after the President's supporters displayed billboards in several Seoul subway stations and planned gatherings in multiple cities of South Korea, such as Seoul, Incheon, Daegu, Daejeon, Busan, and Jeju, to celebrate his first birthday since taking office (Lee, 2018; Persio, 2018). To join in on the celebration, Korean-Americans created a billboard in Times Square, which read: "Thank you for being our President; we are so blessed to have a President as splendid as you." A two-and-a-half minute video highlighted President Moon's political career and Korean-American supporters of all ages.

Unlike the domestic gatherings and billboards, which were rarely highlighted by any media, this peculiar billboard, a happy birthday wish to the South Korean President in one of the busiest places in New York City, drew tremendous attention. Fan-sponsored billboards to promote K-pop singers in Times Square were not uncommon, but a billboard of the Korean President was a first. Among the mixed reactions of excited approval and contemptuous disapproval, the response of the South Korean alt-right community, Ilbe, was remarkable: the community launched a billboard sign against the previous one in the exact same spot of Times Square within a week.

Highly developed digital media technology has altered our lives and experiences to various degrees. In the current digital era, as Castells (1996) notes, online communities are virtual and, at the same time, real. They are virtual in that they do not exist in physical spaces. People interact with others virtually; yet, these interactions among people can still be real. As people have come to depend heavily on digital media communication, such an obscure distinction between online and offline has become even more blurred than ever before. An example is the event above: it shows the process of how a digital confrontation between groups of different political perspectives has extended the ideological battlefield to offline space. With the case study of a South Korean online community, this research examines how people extend their online discourse to beyond the virtual community, and how they utilize offline venues to grow their base of supporters as a form of social movement. In particular, by highlighting the alt-right community's online interaction and offline activities, this study focuses on 1) how the Ilbe online community users facilitated online discussions in order to lead to offline social action; 2) why the Ilbe members created the advertisement in Times Square; and 3) what the implications are of the billboard within political and social contexts. In so doing, the researcher aims to clarify the meaning of space, both in digital and offline realms, in terms of influencing people's perceptions and mobilizing their social action to express their opinions.

The Alt-Right Community and Ilbe

The liberation of information has accounted for one of the most advantageous aspects of the Internet. Whereas people had been exposed to only limited amounts of news by the media before the Internet, anyone can obtain various types of information online. Yet, the accessibility of abundant information via the Internet has turned out to be a double-edged sword. People obtain not only diverse news perspectives, but also conspiracy theories and fake news (Barkun, 2003; Wilson, 2018). The introduction of incorrect and/or biased information has led readers to construct "alternative" realities. In particular, the audience for conspiracy theories has often tended to incorporate ideas of right-wing authoritarians (Altemeyer, 2004). Given that they have interacted with others who share similar worldviews and beliefs, and that they have

sustained significant parts of their social lives online, they have begun to create particular types of online communities; that is, alt-right groups.

The alt-right, short for "alternative right," refers to a far-right movement based online. The ideology of these alt-right groups can be summarized by white nationalism, anti-Semitism, misogyny, and anti-multiculturalism (Lyons, 2017; Neiwert, 2017; Michael, 2017; Nagle, 2017). Many media scholars have begun to pay attention to the advent of the right-groups since the late 2000s. As their presence became prominent after the 2016 Presidential election in the United States (US), researchers have focused on political trolls and their motivations to participate in the online communities, and their tactics used (Coleman, 2014; Matias, 2016; Southern Poverty Law Center; 2016). Scholars have highlighted how several online communities, such as 4chan and 8chan, have become cyberplaces where members of alt-right groups can exercise their influence (Neiwert, 2017; Michael, 2017). Previous research has indicated the characteristics of alt-right groups as the following: a strong Internet presence accompanied with trolling; sophisticated use of digital technologies; and unique communication via utilizing memes. Moreover, judging by their trolling comments, alt-right group members' attitudes and worldviews towards their surroundings are often "highly ethnocentric, fearful of a dangerous world, aggressive, dogmatic, and inclined to extreme self-righteousness and poor reasoning" (Neiwert, 2017, p. 6). Combining the mindset to secure traditional values with their political inclination toward right-wing parties, alt-right groups' radical, political stances have been consolidated.

The emergence of alt-right groups has become a worldwide phenomenon. Research on such groups have been conducted not only in the US (Coleman, 2014; Matias, 2016; Neiwert, 2017), but also in European countries (Morstatter, Shao, Galstyan, & Karunasekera, 2018; Pirro, 2015). However, alt-right groups in East Asian countries have rarely been studied as of yet. Given the fact that many Asian countries have enjoyed highly developed digital media technology (for example, South Korea has been one of the most wired nations in the world), it is necessary to understand how alt-right groups in Asian countries have interacted with others, and how they have developed their online discourses. In this sense, the current research focuses on one of the alt-right groups in East Asian countries, Ilbe Storehouse in South Korea.

Ilbe Storehouse (henceforth, Ilbe), a representative alt-right community of South Korea, was launched in 2010. It was originally created in order to store the 'daily popular' posts of another popular online community, DC Inside. A sub-forum of DC Inside, 'daily popular,' displays only selected posts that are recognized by its users. Since having a post in the sub-forum was considered to be an honor, it soon led to severe competition among the community members of DC Inside. Its users tended to post problematic threads with ethically inappropriate, abusive memes to draw their peers' attention. Such overheated competition to create provocative posts resulted in the site administrator's need to censor posts in the daily popular forum and delete questionable posts. To prevent the removal of their recognized posts, DC Inside users created a 'storehouse' for saving their threads forever. This was the start of Ilbe Storehouse. Here, Ilbe is short for Ilgan Best, which is Korean for 'popular daily.'

Considering the motives of how the community was launched, it is not surprising that the use of memes has played a significant role for Ilbe. The more sensational the meme is, the more respect its author earns from other users. Indeed, the development of this online community is parallel with that of 4chan in the United States. Ilbe started as an open forum to share funny memes and witty posts. Similar to 4chan's original success with memes, which drew a million hits, several memes on Ilbe have been highly popular among its members. Ilbe also became

known for its trolling. Targets of Ilbe have mainly been ethnic and regional minorities, females, and figures in the liberal political party. Ilbe has been known as a representative alt-right online community since the 2012 Korean Presidential election.

Neiwert (2017) summarizes 4chan as "a world dominated by digital trolls, insanely unbridled conspiracism, angry White-male-identity victimization culture, and ultimately, open racism, anti-Semitism, ethnic hatred, misogyny, and sexual/gender paranoia" (p. 4). The Ilbe community can be summarized with similar traits. Ilbe is a predominantly male-based online community. According to a self-initiated poll of 1,176 users in March 2013, 35 percent of all users are between the ages of 21 and 25 (Pearson, 2013). First, it is known for its hate speech against women. For example, one of the group's popular phrases, "kimchi bitch," refers to Korean women as gold diggers (Kasulis, 2017). Misogynistic posts have been one of the most popular topics in the community. Second, Ilbe users have shown strong hostility not only towards sexual minorities, but also ethnic minorities. They believe that there are certain groups of people who are superior to other groups in Korean society, that is, Korean men. They degrade anyone who may challenge their patriarchal authority. Third, the Ilbe community holds extreme right-wing political inclinations. Derived from their conservative political perspectives, the users refer to anyone who seems "pro-North Korea" or politically left as "commies" and denounce them with abusive memes and words.

Like 4chan, the Ilbe community is oftentimes a place where social norms, manners, and etiquette are considered as outdated hypocrisy, and its members focus only on trolling. Ilbe users have created several collages of various images, music themes, and words as memes. Some memes are borrowed from 4chan. Pepe the Frog is one of the most frequently used memes in the Ilbe community. In his analysis, Neiwert (2017) claims that alt-right groups utilize Pepe's meme not only because of the character's cuteness, but also because of its implication in a cultural context: irony. By using such memes, alt-right groups perceive themselves as "smarter and more sophisticated, [with] their rhetoric of racism, violence, and open eliminationism wrapped in more wit and humor, at least of a sort" (Neiwert, 2017, p. 9). Ilbe users have adopted both connotative and denotative meanings of several memes from 4chan. Additionally, they have created other images and ideas from the unique situation of South Korea. For example, they often mock the Gwangju Uprising (a mass protest against the South Korean military government in Gwangju between May 18 and 27, 1980), previous South Korean presidents from the liberal party, and North Korean leaders. The evolutionary process of Ilbe as an alt-right group is surprisingly similar to that of 4chan in the Unted States.

The Ilbe community has been able to exercise considerable influence over South Korean society, based on its large volume of users. According to a traffic analysis of the Ilbe community by SimilarWeb[1], it had 22.7 million visits and was the 24th most popular website in South Korea from January to June 2018. Whenever opinions are divided on particular issues, Ilbe has played a leading role in persuading the public to adopt right-wing perspectives. For example, the Ilbe community began to gain notoriety for its vocal support of the former President Park Geun-hye during her 2012 election campaign (Pearson, 2013). When she was impeached due to her political scandal and the liberal President Moon Jae-in was elected in March 2013, many older far-right supporters of Park decided to join the Ilbe community in order to "find solace in the bitter threads of Ilbe" (Kasulis, 2017). Although the far-rightists no longer have representation in the Blue house (the executive office and official residence of the

---

[1] The traffic of the Ilbe community was estimated on March 2019 from
https://www.similarweb.com/website/ilbe.com.

South Korean President), the stance of the Ilbe community as an alt-right community has become more consolidated than before. In this sense, an examination of the community's online discourse and subsequent social movement outside the virtual space provides us with an understanding of the implications for how alt-right groups exercise their influence in society.

Public Space Itself Can Be a Symbolic Messenger

Lefebvre (2000) indicates that the globalization of capital has led to a shift from the production of commodities in space to the production of space itself. In particular, an "alternative calculus of use value" (Dirlik, 2001, p. 36) guides the projects of social change to appropriate abstract space and create meanings based on this space. There have been several studies on social movements and political actions related to public space. For example, Tiananmen Square was at the center of the May Fourth Movement (Lee, 2009); Boston for #Occupy Everywhere (Juris, 2012); and Taksim Square to save Gezi Park (Gül, Dee, and Cünük, 2014). Habermas (1996) notes that the public sphere, as "a network for communicating information and points-of-view" (p. 360) lies between the state and society. Here, physical space (Low & Smith, 2006) and media (Thompson, 2000) are some of the major components used to create the public sphere (Castells, 2008). With the advent of digital media technology, both the Internet and wireless communication networks have also become important factors (McChesney, 2007). Hence, when a cultural or political event happens within a physical space, and the mass media (including the Internet) distribute news to the public, space starts to be transformed as symbolic in nature.

People often plan social movements in the popular spots of a city in order to communicate the purpose of their actions in society: non-participants easily get to know what is going on and why it matters. Such movements can also quickly attract the media's attention. Most of the massive demonstrations in South Korea have been held in Gwanghwamun Square, one of the most popular tourist spots, as well as one of the busiest business districts of Seoul. Large groups of South Koreans have come together, holding candles in Gwanghwamun Square in order to express their opinions. Examples include the 2004 candlelight vigil that was held to protest the South Korean National Assembly's impeachment of President Roh, and the 2008 US beef protest, a series of demonstrations held after the South Korean government reversed a ban on US beef imports. Finally, there were the 2016-2017 candlelight vigils, in which more than a million people participated in a series of protests between October 2016 and March 2017 to urge for President Park's impeachment. On some occasions, South Korean diaspora members have also orchestrated multiple demonstrations and candlelight vigils related to the South Korean issues in their own cities, such as New York, Paris, London, and Los Angeles, to support their compatriots in South Korea. The worldwide 2016–2017 candlelight vigils serve as a representative example. Indeed, it is important to note that an individual social action has rarely been planned or taken outside the home country without any related local concurrence. Social actions inside and outside the country have occurred in tandem.

On the other hand, having billboard commercials is a different story in terms of promoting and advertising cultural products, including traditional customs, cities, and celebrities. Many South Korean-related commercials have been created and released external to South Korea, in particular, in New York City's Times Square. The first well-known case involved bibimbap commercials in 2010 and 2012. The South Korean publicist, Seo Kyoung-duk, and his team advertised bibimbap (a popular Korean dish made of steamed rice mixed with meat, vegetables and hot sauce) in a 60-second video (Chun, 2012). Since this commercial gained a great deal of attention from the media, diverse subsequent commercials followed. K-pop fans fund digital

billboards to promote their singers. According to a Forbes' article, such advertising has become "a full-scale, regularly occurring phenomena with fans from around the globe" to show their support, and 20–30 K-pop ad campaigns alone were displayed in Times Square in 2017 (Herman, 2017). One of the main reasons as to why people choose venues away from their own regions is the significance of the place as a public space. For example, Times Square is the most popular and expensive location in the United States for wide-scale ads. It is also one of the most well-known international tourist locations. Having an ad in such a place enables people not only to expect huge exposure to others who are not familiar with the topic, but also to deliver a meaningful message to the world. In this sense, a billboard in Times Square is understood as a way of sending a significant message to the world by its organizers and participants. It explains why fans are now more interested in having their ads in Times Square, even though similar ideas, such as purchasing ad space in subway stations, have been popular throughout Asia for years. Yet, it is still rare to find any such case related to politicians and political messages displayed in Times Square unless it is done for an election campaign. For this reason, when this unprecedented billboard appeared as a birthday wish for the South Korean President, its impact on the South Korean society was recognizable and worthy of study.

Research Questions and Methods

This research begins with the birthday ads for the South Korean President and the alt-right community's response to the commercial. The current President is not only a liberal party politician, but also is a close friend of the previously deceased President Roh, who was also a liberal party president. Fourteen months after finishing his term as president, Roh was suspected of bribery by prosecutors, and he committed suicide after saying that there were too many people suffering because of him. The Ilbe community has been notorious for its consecutive expression of hatred toward President Roh and its mockery of his suicide. Needless to say, its users have exhibited a hostile attitude toward the Moon administration. Within a week from the ad's release on January 22, 2018, the Ilbe community put up an impromptu billboard to countervail the previous ad in Times Square. By analyzing online discussions in the Ilbe community during the week of January 22, 2018 and the subsequent outcome (an impromptu billboard in Times Square), this study aims to answer the following questions:

1. How did the Ilbe online community users facilitate online discussions in order to lead to offline social action?
2. Why did the Ilbe members create the advertisement in Times Square?
3. What are the implications of the billboard within political and social contexts?

The main research tool for this research is digital ethnography. Ethnography is a useful methodological tool used to explore complex links and to interpret culture (Geertz, 1973). Throughout a significant amount of time for observation and interaction, a researcher can provide a rich understanding and interpretation of what is going on within the field, and can decode the cultural meanings of a group's particular behavioral patterns, social customs, and norms.

With the advent of digital media, there have been trials to apply such a methodological approach to virtual communities. Digital ethnography can help researchers collect abundant amounts of data without moving from place to place. Despite its advantages, digital ethnography needs to be conducted carefully. Digital culture entails different types of social formation from the traditional, offline society (Hakken, 1999). This makes it difficult for researchers to find an appropriate site for research. It may also be hard to collect all of the

necessary data due to the features of digital communication – new information every minute; high user population volumes; and frequent changes in relevant topics. Given the features of digital communities, it is important for researchers to monitor online communities over a significant amount of time in order to analyze the online data in a timely and accurate manner (Sade-Beck, 2004; Jones, 1999). The researcher also needs to collect online data carefully because users can simply add, edit, or delete their messages. There is always the risk that only the active participants of the community are noticeable, who may not represent the majority of the group.

To maximize the benefits and to curtail the limitations of digital ethnography as a methodology, the current research has been tailored with respect to its research methods. After deciding on the Ilbe community as the research subject, the researcher endeavored to learn the specific jargons, memes, and issues that have been widely used in the community. Understanding the background and history of the Ilbe community in South Korean society enabled the researcher to capture the underlying contexts of online interactions within the community.

In order to encapsulate the consensus of the community, the researcher focused on one of the sub-forums in the Ilbe community entitled as "Ilbe." The Ilbe community has multiple sub-forums for politics, entertainment, anime, and celebrities, similar to 4chan. When a posting in any of Ilbe's forums receives a significant number of recommendations from other users, it moves to the "Ilbe" board automatically. It is considered as a special forum that has a higher rank than the other forums on Ilbe. Having a posting appear on the forum is thus considered as an honor among its users because it signifies widespread approval. Thus, this forum's postings indicate the topics and ideas that interest Ilbe users the most.

For this study, I collected all of the digital communication within the community from January 21, 2018, when news about the birthday wish billboard ad was first reported, to January 26, 2018, days after the Ilbe community's response ad was released and reported in South Korean media. Since the contents of the community is open to the public, I could easily access the threads and comments of the online community. According to Correll's (1995) typology of online community membership and participation, there are four different styles of participants: regulars, newbies, lurkers, and bashers. My observation style in the online community was close to that of a lurker. I did not participate in any activities or discussions in the community, but I did observe the users' interactions and activities. Since Ilbe is a representative alt-right community, it often promotes a one-sided perspective toward understanding social and political issues in South Korea. I tried to remain objective as a researcher in the process of collecting and analyzing the data from the community. I focused on the ways that Ilbe users developed their opinions as the dominant discourse within the community, and how they communicated these opinions to the outside community. There were approximately 250 postings associated with this topic on the board, and each posting included approximately 100 subsequent comments. Given that these comments represent how the Ilbe community members communicate and interact with one another, this research examines both the postings and the Ilbe community's subsequent comments.

This article consists of three analysis sections. First, the current research explores how the Ilbe online community confronted other groups with opposite political perspectives. This research also examines how the Ilbe community members initiated their ad event, how they responded to the pro-left-wing government advertisement, and how they developed their stance as an alt-right community to interpret the event. Second, this research demonstrates how the Ilbe community developed a relevant online discourse, turned it into social action, and justified the

action. Finally, the third section of this research elaborates the implications regarding the series of events and Times Square as the chosen venue for social action. It also articulates how public space plays a key role in delivering political messages to the public.

From Online Interaction to Digital War

The 2016–2017 South Korean political scandal that centered on President Park's relation with her old friend, Choi Soon-sil (in regard to abusing state power and leaks of classified information), has had a significant impact on South Koreans, both inside and outside South Korea (Lee, 2018). This massive social action not only resulted in President Park's impeachment, but also served as momentum for South Koreans to mobilize social change based on digital communication. Without the aid of digital media, the original idea of having candlelight vigils every Saturday afternoon to urge presidential impeachment would not have spread or continued for months. Digital media have even enabled South Korean diaspora members to join such movements. Overseas candlelight vigils in support of President Park's impeachment were orchestrated in 70 cities of 26 countries within a month (Im, 2017). As a result of witnessing the success of online-initiated social movements, South Koreans have actively used digital media to become involved in ongoing social and political issues.

South Korean netizens initially suggested the idea of putting up birthday-wish billboards as a way to show support for their new president on January 10, 2018 (Yoon, 2018). The original suggestion was to place ads in ten different subway stations in Seoul after fundraising the money for them. A day later, the users of Missyusa.com, a representative online community for South Korean American immigrant women, suggested launching a U.S. version of the ad in Times Square. In order to attract more people's attention, all of these processes, including raising money, creating a video clip, and contacting an advertising agency, were disclosed via online interaction – in particular Twitter. What is interesting here is that the Ilbe community rarely paid attention to news about these ads in the Seoul subway stations. Only four postings mentioned the ads. They complained about the project and laughed at the idea, but did not take the ads seriously at all. However, their nonchalant attitudes changed completely when they learned that South Korean American women were preparing to put up the ad in Times Square. Given the fact that President Moon has many female supporters and that the leading Twitter user names are feminine in nature, such as the Organic Wool Knitting Union[2], Ilbe's initial response postings and comments expressed hatred of women, then moved on to denounce the Moon administration. The Ilbe community members' threads before their response ad idea can be summarized as a mixture of misogyny, mockery of the left-wing president, and criticism of the current political situation in South Korea.

Many initial responses from Ilbe users targeted the project team. They belittled the participants of the project as "groupies" blindly following their idol. They did not see it as necessary to check on how many female participants were involved in the project. Assuming that women had created the project, their condemnation was aimed thoroughly at South Korean females.

> **2018.01.21**   21:33:34 We, 20s to 40s Korean males, need to be careful. We can see who supports the president and manipulates the media. The current government has been supported by these lunatics. There can't be any good policy made for men by this government.

---

[2] The project participants created fake names to protect their private information.

2018.01.23	02:25:05 They are savages. I do not know what to say.
2018.01.23	03:26:23 It shows why we cannot stop blaming Korean bitches. They are so unreasonable.
2018.01.23.	05:12:18 Females in their 30s and 40s are, in particular, a terror. They have no brains.
2018.01.25	16:16:15 We need to deprive women's voting right.
2018.01.23	12:25:01 They are always like that. They probably followed H.O.T., and Shinhwa [K-pop boy groups], and now the president.

As briefly mentioned above, the Ilbe community is very well known for its misogyny (Kasulis, 2017). One of the few rules that Ilbe has is to ban female users within the community. Even if there are female users, they are not supposed to "come out" openly as females. Ilbe users sometimes called one another "bitches" for the purpose of humiliating them. In this light, when Ilbe users found out that an ad as a birthday wish for the South Korean president would be put up in Times Square, they blamed this action as one of the typical behaviors of females – irresponsible and emotional. Numerous threads elaborated on how emotional and unreasonable South Korean females are. They argued that South Korean females are unable to evaluate what the important political issues are, so these ignorant voters elected and followed the left-wing president just like girls who admire their idols unconditionally. Such an argument led them to solidify their disapproval of Moon's administration. Their resentment about losing the former conservative President Park as well as the distrust of the subsequent liberal government often went hand in hand.

2018.01.23	12:29:39 This is why Korea is so messed up.
2018.01.23	13:11:55 This is the difference. We, the right-wing, do not do that.
2018.01.23	15:17:47 The current president is not a rightfully elected one. These lunatics did not know what they had done.
2018.01.23	14:13:57 The bitches messed up not only their husbands or boyfriends, but also this country.
2018.01.24	11:02:42 The whole project might be planned by the government. Who would do that, spending their money?

The Ilbe community shares many similarities with 4chan in the United States. Yet, Ilbe's roots and popularity stem from a unique South Korean political situation. For example, they pay homage to the former conservative presidents Park Chung-hee and Chun Doo-hwan, while criticizing the former liberal presidents Kim Dae-Jung and Roh Moo-hyun. Ilbe users evaluate President Park Chung-hee, father of the impeached President Park, and President Chun Doo-hwan, a former South Korean army general who ruled as an unelected coup leader, as great leaders who brought forth South Korea's economic development in the 1970s and 1980s. Their years of dictatorship have hardly been of concern for Ilbe users. Rather, the Ilbe community gives more weight to economic aspects than any other sectors in South Korean society. A part of the reason for this concern is that unsecure economic conditions are critical problems for millennials, who comprise the majority of the community.

Rising youth unemployment and economic hardship have been significant issues in South Korean society. The Ilbe community has argued that the conservative party knows best how to

handle economics. Ironically, it became even worse during the conservative President Park's administration with rocketing unemployment rates. According to an analysis by Statistics Korea, South Korea topped the list with the sharpest growth in youth unemployment among the 21 member countries of the OECD in 2017 (Kim, 2017). Thus, the neologism, Hell Joseon, was created to describe the difficulties faced by young South Koreans in 2014. It is a satirically coined word, joining both *hell* and *Joseon* (the last dynasty of Korea). The term was initially used online, but was later mentioned in the media. Finally, it was used as a keyword to indicate the failure of the Park administration during the 2016–2017 candlelight vigils.

Admitting that South Koreans had been living in "Hell Joseon," Ilbe users claimed that changing the ruling party did not improve socioeconomic conditions at all; in fact, they maintained that conditions became even worse with the liberal president. They complained that the unchanging dismal economic index proves how unqualified the president is. Nevertheless, they believed that President Moon is elected because of female voters.

Given that President Moon has tried to develop a good relationship with the North Korean leader, a series of comments and posts accused the president's supporters of being either "commies" or "North Korean spies."

> **2018.01.21** 22:43:13 They need to go back to North Korea.
>
> **2018.01.21** 19:28:33 Once we censor these tweets, more than hundreds of North Korean spies will be captured.
>
> **2018.01.23** 13:18:29 They like North Korea. Why do they want to have the ad in the U.S., instead of North Korea?

Such comments show Ilbe's stance as an alt-right community that has been for diligent defenders of traditional, conservative values and right-wing political perspectives. Its members share a distinctive binary choice that distinguishes *us* from *them*. In particular, supporters of the Moon administration are considered as *them*, or even worse, enemies associated with North Korea. As a result, they considered the ad, promoting the South Korean government in such a well-known global city, as a critical threat to their beliefs. It encouraged them to take corresponding action.

Invisible Participants, Tangible Media in a Global City
Within three days after the billboard's appearance in Times Square, an interesting post was uploaded in the Ilbe's daily best forum. An Ilbe user wrote that he created a counter ad with a video clip critical of the previous birthday ad, that it would soon be released in the same location of Times Square. Approximately six hundred comments followed this post.

> **2018.01.25** 12:06:06 It is about the upcoming ad in Times Square. I understand that many of you think it is a lie. But I can assure you that it is not a lie. If any of you live in New York City, please go and take a picture of the ad.

Ilbe is not just an alt-right community, but also a humor forum (at least it was the initial purpose of the online community), so spurious posts are not uncommon. Many Ilbe users were not sure whether the post was credible. In particular, when the post said that the ad would be released in Times Square, it was difficult for the majority of the community members to verify it with their own eyes.

2018.01.25	12:07:38 Yeah, I want to believe you. But I don't think so.
2018.01.25	12:10:14 I am sure somebody will be there to see whether it is true. But, what if all of this is just fake?
2018.01.25	12:09:48 I don't believe you until I see its picture.
2018.01.25	12:40:44 So it will be 2:05 p.m. in Korean time. I really hope somebody will be there.
2018.01.25	13:30:47 Tell me how much you paid for the ad first.

From the advance notice to the moment when the ad appeared as one of the billboards in Times Square, hundreds of threads were generated within the community. Most of them were skeptical. Right after the expected release time of the ad, several posts were uploaded with pictures of the ad in Times Square by Ilbe users living in New York City. The ad was real. It used one of their notorious memes, an image mocking the former President Roh Moo-hyun. The message on the screen stated, "Happy birthday 'Roh-ala.' We love you. Happy Un-ji Day." The images and phrases used in the ad could only be understood by Ilbe users, because it was full of jargons and memes. Soon, the atmosphere of the community reached an obvious turnaround from anger and frustration to excitement and triumph.

2018.01.25	14:56:10 Thank you.
2018.01.25	14:59:26 I respect you.
2018.01.25	15:03:28 You are a true patriot.
2018.01.25	15:28:41 The Ilbe community is always right. We are in the center of this nation.
2018.01.25	20:18:17 MAKE ILBE GREAT AGAIN
2018.01.26	05:22:08 You are a true patriot. I respect you.

Whereas they blamed the previous birthday ad in Times Square as a waste of money, as well as a national disgrace, they evaluated the counter ad as a brave, patriotic action against leftists. Their understanding was thoroughly based on the clear dichotomy between the right versus the left wing. They enjoyed the subsequent media attention towards the ad, and wondered whether the international media mentioned the event as well:

2018.01.25	14:39:19 Are there any related international news reports?
2018.01.25	14:40:01 What about the Times? Did it mentioned about us?

Needless to say, after the mockery ad was reported in news media, an intense confrontation developed between the Ilbe community and President Moon's supporters. What is noteworthy here is that there were not any identifiable individuals in this online turmoil, which lasted several days. Along with the ban on female users and their coming out in the community, there is another strict rule in Ilbe: anonymity. Its users cannot exchange personal information with one another in order to prevent members from making friendships within the community. Moreover, the users tend not to reveal their identities (as Ilbe users) to outsiders due to their abusive comments among fellow Ilbe members, and their notoriety in the larger society. Thus, even though Ilbe users referred to the person who put up the counter ad as "a national hero" or

"a great patriot," no one knew who that person actually was. Additionally, the members of the initial birthday wish ad project team did not disclose their personal information online, either. This team started the project online via Twitter and the online community, missyUSA.com. Their personal information remained hidden.

When there were heated discussions between the two different communities, Ilbe and the initial project team members, there was no one who had concrete information. No matter how intense the discussion and criticism were toward one another online, these have served as extensions of the digital war between two contrasting groups, conservatives and liberals, since the 2016 Korean political scandal. Nothing was tangible, except for the ads displayed in Times Square: there was no one who went out in the streets to make his or her voice heard. Moreover, people outside these online communities could only see the ads, which were displayed 6,877 miles away from Seoul. An Ilbe user described this scenario as their battle field, which had moved from online forums such as Naver [One of the biggest Korean online search engines, such as Google] to New York City. Consequently, the ads had significant impacts on the participants of the digital war in various ways. Based on an analysis of the numerous threads and comments, the most crucial factor that led to such a significant impact on the online community was the symbolic meaning of the space where all of these events occurred – Times Square in New York City.

A Global City Makes Us Global
The Ilbe users did not pay much attention to domestic ads. However, the subsequent ads in Times Square made them react with a series of counter activities. Ilbe members no longer regarded this ad as a one-time event; rather, it was seen as a "national shame" and a "critical threat to the right wing." It did not matter to them that the Times Square ad was shown only for several minutes so that its exposure time to the public would be significantly less, compared to the subway station ads in South Korea. Notwithstanding, the Ilbe users considered where the ads were displayed as the most significant factor.

2018.01.21	20:22:43 People who planned it are criminal.
2018.01.25	13:08:35 It is a national crisis.
2018.01.23	02:33:26 Why in the U.S.?
2018.01.23	07:23:58 The commies wants to harm the relationship between Korea and the U.S.
2018.01.23	13:07:01 Americans will be confused whether it is for either South Korea or North Korea.

These comments show how members of this alt-right group perceived the event. The United States has been considered as a powerful ally that can destroy their enemies, including communists and people who are pro-North Korea, for alt-right groups in South Korea. When there are alt-right group demonstrations in South Korea, their members hold up the national flags of South Korea and the United States to show that they strongly support the South Korea-U.S. alliance (Ock, 2019). In this sense, they connected the ads supporting the left-wing president in New York City with the concern or threat that diplomatic relations between South Korea and the United States might become shaky. The Ilbe users did not find such an interpretation as a breach of logic; rather, they felt the urge to react to this initial ad promptly.

One of the major reasons for such a reaction is based on the symbolic meaning of Times Square, which had only been known to South Koreans as a highly popular tourist attraction with numerous musicals and shows. When Samsung installed its billboard in Times Square in 1992, this locale also became known as "the center of advertising across the world" and "the crossroads of the world" (Yonhap News, 1992). Furthermore, a series of bibimbap ads in 2010 made people aware of Times Square as a place where significant messages to the world can be delivered (Koh, 2010). In this sense, Ilbe users perceived the initial birthday ad as "a national shame," based on their understanding that Times Square represents "pride as the center of the world." Such an attitude is derived from the symbolic status and power that the mass media have given to Times Square. It is also reflected in the series of threads in Ilbe after their counter ad was released in Times Square.

> **2018.01.25**   14:12:11 Ilbe is so global.
>
> **2018.01.25**   14:14:59 It feels like we are in the center of the world.
>
> **2018.01.25**   16:04:03 So this is the power of Ilbe. We are the ones who truly support our country.
>
> **2018.01.25**   14:32:58 We are in the center of the world indeed.

The most commonly used words in these threads were "global," "center," and "power." While replaying the ad in Times Square via YouTube, many Ilbe users expressed excitement and satisfaction. They praised the fact that one of their representative, abusive memes was displayed in the United States. This finding indicates that significant features of alt-right groups, such as using abusive memes to deliver their messages in unforgettable ways, are still applied outside their community. Since this event happened not on the computer screen, but in one of the busiest areas in the world, Ilbe members saw it as a powerful moment for them.

Taking it one step further, the meaning they granted to the public space where the ads were put up was not limited to Times Square, as the online discussion went further. They tended to interpret these ads in the United States as an ideological confrontation between the right and left wing. Their endless, ideological confrontations with anonymous "commies" were finally dragged out of the digital world, and even better, in front of their powerful ally, the United States. In this light, they repeatedly displayed pictures and video clips of the ad in Times Square for days. An anonymous user even said that he witnessed the birth of "a myth for the new Ilbe" (Ilble, 2018).

Only a few members could see the ads in Times Square with their own eyes, while others were waiting for related pictures and news updated online in South Korea. Moreover, the advertising agency that helped put up the mockery ads published a public apology several days later, as South Korean American immigrants complained about the ad's use of abusive memes. Yet, the Ilbe community still considered the series of the events as their "victory" against irrational groupies in the center of the world.

It is, indeed, interesting to note that major discussions were conducted online as usual. Yet, the events in late January of 2018 virtually translocated all of the participants from South Korea to the United States. Through the billboard ad in Times Square, the president's supporters declared their love and support toward the current South Korean government, while the Ilbe community members reinforced and reconfirmed their political stance as an alt-right online community. In this process, Times Square played a key role as a significant public space that generated various meanings for both sides.

Conclusion

One of the most distinctive changes that the development of digital media has brought is that the world has become more ubiquitous, and the boundaries between online and offline have been eroded. Online communication and interaction began to get involved in real-world politics. It is not rare for online communities to mobilize social movements outside the virtual society. Tarrow (1998) defines social movement as "sequences of contentious politics that are based on underlying social networks and resonant collective action frames, and which develop the capacity to maintain sustained challenges against powerful opponents" (p. 2). Thus, it may not be an exaggeration to say that various levels of social movement happen daily online. An online community based on similar beliefs and values often shares the same political perspectives, and easily motivates its users to create various types of collective action. An interesting example involves the events related to the case discussed in this article. It provides us with a great opportunity to examine contemporary digital culture within the alt-right community, as well as to witness how a digitally initiated conflict developed into offline social action.

The findings of this research demonstrate how faithfully the Ilbe community performs its role as a representative alt-right community in South Korea. Their comments, mixed with misogyny and ultra-conservativism, show their current stance in South Korean society. This research also shows how social action can be mobilized based on online communication. When there is a triggering event, online community users engage in social action quickly to express their political preferences and opinions. Even though there is no one who actually goes in the streets to make his or her voice heard, tangible media products start to substitute for this role. The participants of this case study confronted invisible others who disagreed with their perspectives and the worldviews embedded in their ads. Indeed, this scenario represents a digital war for its participants, who continuously asserted their political beliefs, even though outsiders could never recognize who they were.

The selection of the location for the ads made the events and following confrontations even more serious. For the participants, Times Square was not merely considered as an effective place to advertise. In particular, the Ilbe members tended to identify Times Square with the entire American nation. From the stance of the alt-right group in South Korea, which values the US as a strong ally to defeat their enemies (communists and the left wing), the Ilbe community members saw the release of their ad in Times Square as a victory in their digital ideological battle.

By closely examining this recent digital confrontation among online communities in South Korea, this project yields insights into understanding the current social movements based on digital media, and in particular, an alt-right group. It contributes to multiple fields of scholarships. First, this research enables us to enrich scholarly discussions regarding the alt-right community outside Western societies. Second, this research explores the relations between the digital world and physical space. Furthermore, it also presents how symbolic meanings within a public space direct and influence heated online discourse. Previous studies have focused on how digital interactions have changed the binary choice between virtual and physical space. Alternatively, this study suggests that pre-existing meanings and understandings of public space force us to blur the boundaries between the online and offline spheres.

Reference

Altemeyer, B. (2004). Highly dominating, highly authoritarian personalities. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, *144*(4), 421–448. https://doi.org/10.3200/SOCP.144.4.421-

448Barkun, M. (2003). *A culture of conspiracy: Apocalyptic visions in contemporary America*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Castells, M. (1996). *The rise of the network society.* Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

Castells, M. (2008). The new public sphere: Global civil society, communication networks, and global governance. *ANNALS, AAPSS, 616,* 78–93. https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716207311877

Chun, S. (2012, November 7). Bibimbap advertised in Times Square again. *Korea Herald.* Retrieved from http://www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20121107000952

Coleman, G. (2014). *Hacker, hoaxer, whistleblower, spy: The many faces of Anonymous.* Brooklyn, NY: Verso books.

Correll, S. (1995). The ethnography of an electronic bar: The lesbian cafe. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography, 24*(3), 270–98. https://doi.org/10.1177/089124195024003002

Dirlik, A. (2001). Place-based imagination: Globalism and the politics of place. In R. Prazniak & A. Dirlik (Eds.), *Places and politics in an age of Globalization* (pp. 15–51). Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield.

Geertz, C. (1973). *The interpretation of cultures.* New York: Basic Books.

Gül, M., Dee, J., & Cünük, C. N. (2014). Istanbul's Taksim Square and Gezi Park: the place of protest and the ideology of place. *Journal of Architecture and Urbanism, 38*(1), 63–72. https://doi.org/10.3846/20297955.2014.902185

Habermas, J. (1996). *Between facts and norms: Contributions to a discourse theory of law and democracy.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Hakken, D. (1999). *Cyborgs@Cyberspace: An Ethnographer Looks at the Future.* New York, London: Routledge.

Herman, T. (2017, December 21). K-pop fans spend big on Times Square ads promoting their favorite stars. *Forbes*. Retrieved from https://www.forbes.com/sites/tamarherman/2017/12/21/k-pop-fans-spend-big-on-times-square-ads-promoting-their-favorite-stars/#32a22f4f7105.

Im, J. (2017, November 8). A memory of when people light up candles all over the world. *Sisa In.* Retrieved from http://www.sisain.co.kr/?mod=news&act=articleView&idxno=30467.

Jones, S. (1999). *Doing Internet research: Critical issues and methods for examining the net.* London: Thousand Oaks.

Juris, J. (2012). Reflections on #Occupy Everywhere: Social media, public space, and emerging logics of aggregation. *American Ethnologist, 39*(2), 259–279. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-1425.2012.01362.x

Kasulis, K. (2017, September 18). Inside Ilbe: How South Korea's angry young men formed a powerful new alt-right movement. *Mic.* Retrieved from

https://mic.com/articles/184477/inside-ilbe-how-south-koreas-angry-young-men-formed-a-powerful-new-alt-right-movement#.OQnP9YYG4.

Kim, D. (2017, June 18). Korea's youth unemployment rate rising fast: OECD data. *Korea Herald*. Retrieved from http://www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20170618000212

Koh, J. (2010, December 7). Korean TV show, Infinity challenge and publicist Suh Kyung-Duk will release Bibimbap ad in Times Square. *Asia Kyungjae*. Retrieved from http://www.asiae.co.kr/news/view.htm?idxno=2010120709180959868

Lee, H. (2018). *Digital media and the Korean diaspora: A journey of identity construction* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertation and Theses database. (No. 13385)

Lee, N. (2009). How is a political public space made? – The birth of Tiananmen Square and the May Fourth Movement. *Political Geography, 28*(1), 32–43. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2008.05.003

Lee, S. (2018, January 23). From Seoul to New York: A birthday wish ad for President Moon Jae. In. *Hankook Ilbo*. Retrieved from http://www.hankookilbo.com/News/Read/201801231178505438.

Lefebvre, H. (2000). *The production of space.* Malden, MA: Blackwell.

Low, S. M., & Smith, N. (Eds.). (2006). *The politics of public space.* New York: Routledge.

Lyons, M. (2017). *Insurgent supremacists: The U.S. far right's challenge to state and empire.* Montreal, Quebec: Kersplebedeb Publishing and Distribution.

Matias, J. N. (2016). Going dark: Social factors in collective action against platform operators in the reddit blackout. *In Proceedings of the 2016 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems,* 1138–1151. ACM.

McChesney, R. W. (2007). *Communication revolution: Critical junctures and the future of media*. New York: New Press.

Michael, G. (2017). The rise of the alt-right and the politics of polarization in America. *Skeptic 22*(2), 9–17.

Morstatter, F., Shao, Y., Galstyan, A., & Karunasekera, S. (2018). From alt-right to alt-rechts: Twitter analysis of the 2017 German federal election. *In WWW '18 Companion: The 2018 Web Conference Companion, April 23–27, 2018, Lyon, France*. ACM, New York, NY, USA, 8 pages. https://doi.org/10.1145/3184558.3188733

Nagle, A. (2017). *Kill all normies: Online culture wars from 4chan and Tumblr to Trump and the Alt-Right.* UK: John Hunt Publishing.

Neiwert, D. (2017). Birth of the alt right. *The Public Eye*, *Winter*, 4–22.

Ock, H. (2019, March 10). Radical conservatives call for Park's release, condemn Moon. *Korea Herald.* Retrieved from http://www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20190310000230.

Pearson, J. (2013, April 30). Conservatives go on the online offensive. *Yonhap News Agency*. Retrieved from https://en.yna.co.kr/view/AEN20130429006500315.

Persio, S. L. (2018, January 24). Happy birthday Mr. President: New York's Times Square joins South Koreans in celebrating Moon Jae-In. *Newsweek.* Retrieved from https://www.newsweek.com/happy-birthday-mr-president-new-yorks-times-square-joins-south-koreans-789108.

Pirro, A. L. P. (2015). *The populist radical right in central and eastern Europe: ideology, impact, and electoral performance.* Routledge.

Sade-Beck, L. (2004). Internet Ethnography: Online and offline. *International Journal of Qualitative Methodology, 3*(2), pp. 45–51. https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690400300204

Southern Poverty Law Center. (2016, December 16). Update: 1,094 bias-related incidents in the month following the election. *Hatewatch.* Retrieved from https://www.splcenter.org/hatewatch/2016/12/16/update-1094-bias-related-incidents-

Tarrow, S. (1998). *Power in movement: Social movements and contentious politics.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Thompson, J. B. (2000). *Political scandal: Power and visibility in the media age.* Cambridge, UK: Polity.

Wilson, A. F. (2018). #Whitegenocide, the alt-right and conspiracy theory: How secrecy and suspicion contributed to the mainstreaming of hate. *Secrecy and Society, 1*(2). Retrieved from https://scholarworks.sjsu.edu/secrecyandsociety/vol1/iss2/1.

Yonhap News Agency. (1992, January 8). Samsung billboard will be in Times Square. *Yonhap News Agency.* Retrieved from https://news.naver.com/main/read.nhn?mode=LSD&mid=sec&sid1=101&oid=001&aid=0003593275

Yoon, J. (2018, January 11). Netizens will release a birthday ad for president Moon in subway stations. *Kyunghyang Shinmun.* Retrieved from https://news.v.daum.net/v/20180111100456031

Corresponding Author: Hojeong Lee
Email: tuc70018@temple.edu